Home of Gibbor120 Posted by gibbor120 - 18 Aug 2011 21:06

Hi,

I introduced myself, not long ago, <u>Here</u>. But I have grown since then, and have outgrown my small house in the "Introduce Yourself" part of town. I am a Jr. Member and soon will be a "Full Member" IY"H, so I decided I needed to build a new house in a new neighborhood. I looked around at different neighborhoods and saw some spectacular houses in "Wall of Honor". I see that <u>Zemmy</u> and <u>Bards</u> have built here among others, so I decided to plant myself here as well. I will hopefully build some walls of honor myself, and continue to make great friends along the way.

I plan to use this as my main posting thread. So please come in and make a l'chayim, or enjoy some chocolate babke and fresh brewed coffee, or just stop by to say hello.

It's a privilege to dwell among such chashuve yidden!

====

Re: Home of Gibbor120 Posted by eslaasos - 07 Dec 2015 19:36

I think you're a thinking person (check out my signature), and I like the vort, I am just questioning whether this is what this line of Gemara is saying.

I translate it the same way you do - the fact that he admitted is his praise.

I understand that to mean that translating the beginning of the story is still a pechisas kovod for Yehuda but since the ending of the story is his praise (since he admitted it in public) we still read and translate that parsha. So the ka mashma lon is not saying the hava amina is not correct and the initial action becomes a source of pride, it's saying there is another factor that overrides the embarrassment. The next kamashma lon follows the same construct (thanks for the hyperlink). The Parsha of the eigel is embarrassing but we still read it and translate it because the kapparah value of this embarrassment makes it worthwhile. The Gemara's maskana is not negating the hava amina that this is embarrassing, it's saying there is another factor that overrides the hava amina.

Just to reiterate, I am not convinced I am correct. I would actually prefer to be wrong about this and I would really like to see a mekor for this vort, I just don't see that it's muchach from the straight reading of the text.

Re: Home of Gibbor120 Posted by gibbor120 - 07 Dec 2015 21:43

How do you get to the end of the story without the beginning? How can we read about him being modeh, without the beginning, the maaseh he did?

I actually heard a vort about yosef. There are 2 opinions about what "laasos melachto" means. Either "work" or "the aveirah" If we could say it means work, why would someone choose to learn that it means to do the aveira?

The answer is because that is a bigger praise. He was ready to do the aveira and still refrained!

Obviously, the beginning of the maaseh is less than favorable, but the whole package taken as a whole is, at the end of the day, a praise.

my .02

====

Re: Home of Gibbor120 Posted by eslaasos - 07 Dec 2015 22:57

gibbor120 wrote:

How do you get to the end of the story without the beginning? How can we read about him being modeh, without the beginning, the maaseh he did?

Maybe.

Thank you for the vort.

Re: Home of Gibbor120 Posted by gibbor120 - 17 Dec 2015 21:36

A certain fellow had a pain in his finger. He tried all sorts of ways to get rid of the pain, but none worked. The pain was unbearable. One day, he couldn't take it any more and took a drastic step - he cut off his finger.

What are your feelings towards the fellow? (I'm looking for your gut reaction, first emotion, not your rational thoughts)

I have a point to make. To Be Continued...

====

Re: Home of Gibbor120 Posted by eslaasos - 17 Dec 2015 21:39

What a fool!

Re: Home of Gibbor120 Posted by markz - 17 Dec 2015 21:44

I echo Eslaasos

There was a guy that was driving. By the gas gauge an "E" light turned on

Then started flashing

He said "to hell with it" took a hammer, smashed the light, and continued driving...

Re: Home of Gibbor120 Posted by Shlomo24 - 18 Dec 2015 00:24

my first thought was "gosh his finger must have hurt a lot for him to do that"

Re: Home of Gibbor120 Posted by Bigmoish - 18 Dec 2015 00:28

First thought:

what an incredibly sad story.

Re: Home of Gibbor120 Posted by eslaasos - 18 Dec 2015 00:36 It's embarrassing, but in the interests of full honesty, Moish's response reminded me that my first thought was actually from ...

????? ???????

Sorry. Moderators, feel free to delete. Even without knowing Gibbor's purpose I doubt this is relevant.

====

====

Re: Home of Gibbor120 Posted by gibbor120 - 18 Dec 2015 18:27

Or perhaps, let's make it a bit different. Someone is chronically depressed and eventually takes his own life.

Re: Home of Gibbor120 Posted by Shlomo24 - 18 Dec 2015 18:40

i don't agree with the metaphor. even if someone has a lot of pain, there's a difference between removing a finger and taking one's life. i went through a stage where i had constant thoughts of suicide and i even knew how i was going to take my life, but it's very different than removing a finger. if my finger hurt as much as my life did then, i could see myself removing it. but the reason why i didn't commit suicide was because i knew there was nothing after i killed myself. jumping off a roof wouldn't do anything. i decided that being in pain and existing was better than not existing.

Re: Home of Gibbor120 Posted by eslaasos - 18 Dec 2015 18:51

gibbor120 wrote:

Or perhaps, let's make it a bit different. Someone is chronically depressed and eventually takes his own life.

First reaction - what a shame. Maybe I'm in a different mood, maybe I relate differently to this question, maybe lots of things.

====

Re: Home of Gibbor120 Posted by cordnoy - 18 Dec 2015 19:07

Shlomo24 wrote:

i don't agree with the metaphor. even if someone has a lot of pain, there's a difference between Mast ingot and if a when along the some has a lot of pain, there's a difference between here ingot and i even knew how i was going to take my life, but it's very different than removing a finger. if my finger hurt as much as my life did then, i could see myself removing it. but the reason why i didn't commit suicide was because i knew there was nothing after i killed myself. jumping off a roof wouldn't do anything. i decided that being in pain and existing was better than not existing.

Forgive me. I have no idea what's goin' on here, but regardin' suicide, I had a question.....then I deleted it.

B'hatzlachah to all.

====

Re: Home of Gibbor120 Posted by markz - 18 Dec 2015 19:08

gibbor120 wrote:

Or perhaps, let's make it a bit different. Someone is chronically depressed and eventually takes his own life.

1- I am saddened to hear such a story

2- I can relate to what the guy did

If someone has issue with this - shout at me on my aspie thread

Re: Home of Gibbor120 Posted by gibbor120 - 18 Dec 2015 19:45

will hopefully reply by monday.