

The first step

Posted by livingpalpitation - 06 Sep 2024 17:29

---

I hope this is the first step on a journey to rid myself of a profoundly insidious habit. As part of a couple who had difficulty conceiving, I am constantly fearful that my sins will be avenged on my children.

Is that Judaism? I don't know.

At the same time, I am keenly aware that a great deal of prohibitive writings on masturbation drew from incomplete and incorrect understanding of the human body.

Where does the truth lie?

I need to rid myself of these thoughts but I don't know where to begin.

=====

Re: The first step

Posted by youknowwho - 09 Sep 2024 18:35

---

[livingpalpitation wrote on 09 Sep 2024 18:24:](#)

You're right in that this is the wrong forum for this discussion.

You're wrong in saying I believe science is the only baseline reality. Don't paint me as worshipping at the altar of western values.

I refuse to deify human understanding, rabbinical or otherwise, which is apparently heretical to some here.

But all of that is irrelevant. **If you look at the entirety** of this post and replies, we've arrived at nothing. Most people (myself included) have only reaffirmed their viewpoints or suggested this is not the place for the conversation to be had.

**We can end here.**

Looking at the entirety of this conversation has left me with the clear impression that you are here for nothing other than to churn balls. There were plenty of responses that were friendly, nonjudgmental and presented opportunities to further discuss this, on or off the forum.

You have consistently maintained an attitude of antagonistic negativity to the good folks here. Plenty of people here have had struggles with the same Emunah question and we are all struggling with kedusha issues.

I agree with you, **please end it here** and sign up to a mainstream nofap community where you can find the help you need, irrespective of religious concerns...

That is, if you really want it.

=====

Re: The first step

Posted by redfaced - 09 Sep 2024 18:40

---

[livingpalpitation wrote on 09 Sep 2024 18:24:](#)

You're right in that this is the wrong forum for this discussion.

You're wrong in saying I believe science is the only baseline reality. Don't paint me as worshipping at the altar of western values.

I refuse to deify human understanding, rabbinical or otherwise, which is apparently heretical to some here.

But all of that is irrelevant. If you look at the entirety of this post and replies, we've arrived at nothing. Most people (myself included) have only reaffirmed their viewpoints or suggested this is not the place for the conversation to be had.

We can end here.

Was a pleasure to meet you. If you ever decide that you don't want to masturbate anymore because you just don't want to - Than we got plenny of tools to help you

G'luck

=====  
=====

Re: The first step

Posted by cande - 09 Sep 2024 18:46

---

[redfaced wrote on 09 Sep 2024 18:40:](#)

Was a pleasure to meet you. If you ever decide that you don't want to masturbate anymore because you just don't want to - Than we got plenny of tools to help you

**G'luck**

and dont forget god loves you even if you masturbate.

=====  
=====

Re: The first step

Posted by truthaintflashy - 09 Sep 2024 18:56

---

I think he specifically has religious concerns, since he doesn't seem to have taken kindly to the torrent of posts telling him religious concerns aren't going to motivate him. A Jew is allowed to be spiritually sensitive and just want to know why something's wrong.

In any case seems like we scared him off (self included)

In case he's still reading, I'll entertain him with the whole "the seed originates in the brain" idea which he alluded to but nobody here mentioned:

In general, I trust the rabbis to talk about spiritual phenomena more than others, and the act of drawing a soul down into a body is in that category. The seat of the neshama is in the brain, and calling down souls is an act of the neshama.

They are not merely clothed in the sperm. They are clothed in a spiritual body as well, which serves as their interface with the body. (this is in the Tanya somewhere and I've heard it other places too) As mentioned, this is affected by thoughts at the time of conception, as well as the actual circumstances of the conception etc.

As far as masturbation -- the rabbis say it draws souls down, without giving them proper bodies...so the klippah gives them bodies. On this I trust the rabbis, whose spiritual awareness far exceeded mine. Why did G-d arrange the world with such a possibility? Because the act of drawing souls into the world has a profound effect on the mind, in particular because of the unique connection between those souls and your soul. When done properly this creates love between parent and child. When done improperly this creates love (and frustration) between parent and demon-child, which manifests physically as outright insanity, wanting things that won't help you, thinking G-d hates you, not believing in yourself, or other more conventional insanities, ADHD, depression, etc. The sources are clear that pgam habrit literally makes a person insane, and look at the world today -- more insane than ever, even by medical standards.

Feel free to PM me if this is the conversation you want and I'll do my (admittedly limited) best. Or ignore the people shouting you down and have a conversation here.

(I maintain that conversations like this fit perfectly for the torah&chizuk approach section of the

forum, for people with less serious struggles. It could be the reason his struggle seems less serious is because he hasn't yet revealed the extent of it by trying to struggle, in which case he can later move on to other sections...)

=====

Re: The first step

Posted by bright - 09 Sep 2024 19:13

---

[livingpalpitation wrote on 09 Sep 2024 18:24:](#)

You're right in that this is the wrong forum for this discussion.

Yes I am. Doesnt mean it shouldnt be had or that I dont hear what you are saying.

You're wrong in saying I believe science is the only baseline reality. Don't paint me as worshipping at the altar of western values.

I am happy to hear I am wrong about that. I am still not sure what is the baseline then? This has been what I've been asking you since the start (in pm and on the forum). Where are you coming from?

I refuse to deify human understanding, rabbinical or otherwise, which is apparently heretical to some here.

Many people have been very understanding of you. You are not having a conversation. Just throwing everyone under the bus. You have not even elaborated about what you find wrong with rabbinic understanding in this area. Maybe this is due to some of the reactions you got. I am sorry if it is. Either way, you are being very defensive and dont sound open or interested in anything at this point.

But all of that is irrelevant. If you look at the entirety of this post and replies, we've arrived at nothing. Most people (myself included) have only reaffirmed their viewpoints or suggested this is not the place for the conversation to be had.

We can end here.

Yes lets. Please, please reach out to Hashem Help Me, he can be very understanding. I wish you well.

=====

Re: The first step

Posted by cande - 09 Sep 2024 19:15

---

wish you good luck,

O' and dont forget, god loves you

**Warning: Spoiler!**

=====  
=====

Re: The first step  
Posted by neshomo kedosha - 09 Sep 2024 23:20

---

[richtig wrote on 08 Sep 2024 15:47:](#)

Hey, so this is a whole topic, and I'm guessing most folks here would strenuously argue that it is a biblical prohibition, or at least the rabbis knew what they were talking about, and at the very very least even if they didn't their ordinance would be binding anyway.

I understand the need for clarity if the main motivation is the prohibition itself, but most people have had a hard time with masturbation even with being totally on board with the severity of the law...

The ezer mikodesh writes that it is derabonon (although a very chomur one obviously) not sure if there are cholkim or not

=====  
=====

Re: The first step  
Posted by chaimoigen - 09 Sep 2024 23:34

---

I'm not sure if I'm relieved or disappointed that I missed this whole thread....

Thompson, loved your post.

=====  
=====

Re: The first step  
Posted by chaimoigen - 09 Sep 2024 23:35

---

[neshomo kedosha wrote on 09 Sep 2024 23:20:](#)

[richtig wrote on 08 Sep 2024 15:47:](#)

Hey, so this is a whole topic, and I'm guessing most folks here would strenuously argue that it is a biblical prohibition, or at least the rabbis knew what they were talking about, and at the very very least even if they didn't their ordinance would be binding anyway.

I understand the need for clarity if the main motivation is the prohibition itself, but most people have had a hard time with masturbation even with being totally on board with the severity of the law...

The ezer mikodesh writes that it is derabonon (although a very chomur one obviously) not sure if there are cholkim or not

There are

=====

Re: The first step

Posted by frank.lee - 12 Sep 2024 13:08

---

Hi LN, if you come back to visit, why erase your account? I hope I did not offend you. Some great responses here!

Do have the same disquietude regarding other Mitzvos? Like how do we know the lulav is the biblically ordained species?

Maybe phylacteries should really be rounded? The injunction against round head pieces was based on a health reasoning of mortal danger. This has been proven by cutting edge modern science that there is a dearth of documented deaths with proven causation of circular object.



We've been objugated to avoid consuming meat and fish products together, due to physical danger to health. With the insight of modern science, we can declare that there has never been a thorough study with a control group, accompanied by university professors, proving a significantly increased fatality rate asking consumers of said combination.

Or do these questions only arise on this topic? And maybe marriage between two men should be allowed, considering our brilliant and fresh understanding of physiology and psychology which we clearly see there is zero negative impact of such a union?

In other words, Rationalization, my dear Watson!

One more small point. If modern science lacks proof of demons created from seed, do they cogently comprehend how a man and a woman can beget a human life, with a soul??

=====

Re: The first step

Posted by BenHashemBH - 12 Sep 2024 13:36

---

), I was planning to post here today as well.

BezH making my way through Shas and this morning I learned in Menachos daf chaf tes amud beis (39b) the Gemara about Moshe seeing Hashem attaching the crowns to the holy letters of the Torah and the explanation that Rabbi Akiva was going to expound on them many generations in the future. After Hashem showing Moshe the 'classroom' of Rabbi Akiva and Moshe not understanding the Torah being learned, Moshe asks why Hashem isn't giving the Torah to Rabbi Akiva, instead of himself. Hashem responds "Quiet"! Then Moshe asks to see Rabbi Akiva's reward and Hashem shows him Rabbi Akiva's flesh in the Roman meat market (after the Romans tortured him by combing his flesh with iron combs). Moshe exclaims "this is Torah and this is its reward?!" and again Hashem responds "Quiet! This is part of My greater plan to which you are not privy".

See Artscroll note 17 for the sources that explain this Gemara. There are 50 gates of understanding and Moshe was on the 49th. The answer to Moshe's questions resided on the 50th level where Hashem did not permit him to probe. Hashem tells Moshe "Quiet!" because a

person is not allowed to explore intellectually that which he is constitutionally incapable of understanding (Gemara Chagiga 11b-12a, 13a). This boundary varies for each person and a person can broaden his intellectual horizon, but there is always a point beyond which a person will force himself into mental desolation. For Moshe this was the fiftieth gate.

So perhaps there is an innate challenge to discussing these matters publicly (and this was said in other context several times here) because the intellect and boundary varies from person to person. One cannot 'explain' to another with logic or understanding when they are on different levels, because one of them will not be capable of gaining from it and will instead be left with mental desolation.

Not judging who is at which level here, I obviously have no idea, but interesting to learn this Gemara and thought others might appreciate it too.

Kol Tov

=====

=====