

The first step

Posted by livingpalpitation - 06 Sep 2024 17:29

---

I hope this is the first step on a journey to rid myself of a profoundly insidious habit. As part of a couple who had difficulty conceiving, I am constantly fearful that my sins will be avenged on my children.

Is that Judaism? I don't know.

At the same time, I am keenly aware that a great deal of prohibitive writings on masturbation drew from incomplete and incorrect understanding of the human body.

Where does the truth lie?

I need to rid myself of these thoughts but I don't know where to begin.

=====

Re: The first step

Posted by cande - 08 Sep 2024 18:42

---

I hope this is the first step on a journey to rid myself of a profoundly insidious habit. As part of a couple who had difficulty conceiving, I am constantly fearful that my sins will be avenged on my children.

Is that Judaism? I don't know.

At the same time, I am keenly aware that a great deal of prohibitive writings on masturbation drew from incomplete and incorrect understanding of the human body.

Where does the truth lie?

I need to rid myself of these thoughts but I don't know where to begin.

i would guess guess god is keenly aware,

god manufactured masturbation, and god said dont do it!

i would trust the manufacturer,

or study the manual again.

=====

=====

Re: The first step

Posted by cande - 08 Sep 2024 18:50

---

[livingpalpitation wrote on 06 Sep 2024 17:29:](#)

I hope this is the first step on a journey to rid myself of a profoundly insidious habit. As part of a couple who had difficulty conceiving, I am constantly fearful that my sins will be avenged on my children.

Is that Judaism? I don't know.

At the same time, **I am keenly aware** that a great deal of prohibitive writings on masturbation drew from **incomplete** and **incorrect** understanding of the human body.

Where does the truth lie?

I need to rid myself of these thoughts but **I don't know where to begin**.

begin here:

**i would guess god is keenly aware, of the complete and correct understanding of the human body.**

**god manufactured your gentiles & masturbation too, and god said dont do it!**

**i would trust the manufacturer,**

**or study the manual again.**

end here.

=====  
=====

Re: The first step

Posted by livingpalpitation - 08 Sep 2024 19:57

---

Responses like yours only serve to shut down discussion, not further it, and they do so in with minimal effort.

=====  
=====

Re: The first step

Posted by livingpalpitation - 08 Sep 2024 19:58

---

This is not a helpful response.

=====  
=====

Re: The first step

Posted by redfaced - 08 Sep 2024 22:47

---

[livingpalpitation wrote on 08 Sep 2024 19:58:](#)

This is not a helpful response.

Halacha has never and will never change to fit what the current science thinks is accurate. As a matter of fact if science is changing so often it will probably change right back to what Chazal initially said, once all the liberal scientists stop pushing their liberal agendas.

The point being made here I think, is that while GYE is a primarily a frum website created to battle this horrible devil, ~~more often than not~~ the frumness is not what is needed to fight. The tools that exist are not dependent on the fact that Chazal say it is Assur Min HaTorah.

We're here to help and the help is real . I promise you that.

[livingpalpitation wrote on 08 Sep 2024 16:02:](#)

I said nothing about zealotry, I asked for clarity from a religious standpoint on prohibitions that were made with incomplete knowledge. Are the sages of the past beyond reproach? Am I not permitted to ask this question, just expected to blindly follow, ~~out of fear~~? Is that your Judaism?

Yes we are expected to blindly follow Chazal, and believe hat no prohibitions were made with incomplete knowledge.

Ever changing science is in no way more knowledgeable than the Torah. How can something that changes so often be accurate? Every few years the nee information is true and the old information becomes obsolete? That means the old information was never true....

And no our following is not supposed to be out of fear, Its because we think it is the full truth.

That being said answers often exist for those that are looking in the right place. But this awesome place is more of a place to get clean of Even permitted things as long as they are not good for you, me or the other guy.

Hatzlocha!!

=====  
=====

Re: The first step

Posted by frank.lee - 08 Sep 2024 23:09

---

Thanks for the response.

In order to address your question, it is imperative to understand your belief. You can avoid describing your observance or history. But do you believe in God? Do you believe the Torah was given to us by God? Do you ascribe to the philosophy of the Sadducees?

On the other end of the spectrum, do you believe in science? Global warming? Gender dysphoria? Spontaneous generation? Critical race theory? Implicit bias? The honest pursuit of truth by the clear-eyed, enlightened great paragons of science and meaning, rhyme and reason?

Without this background, addressing your doubts is shooting at phantom ghosts in the dark.

Another point is that much of "settled science" had been debunked within a couple decades of being foresworn as absolute truth. The foundational pillars of our scientific lived experience have been laid bare numerous times to have been buttressed by corrupt big pharma or base greed and jealousy.

No need for superciliousness and blind faith in meek, fickle men, and reserving jaundiced leeriness towards the wise men of faith and God.

Looking forward to hearing from you.

=====  
=====

Re: The first step

Posted by frank.lee - 08 Sep 2024 23:12

---

Well said, Red!

=====

=====

Re: The first step

Posted by livingpalpitation - 08 Sep 2024 23:21

---

I believe in the Torah. I am not sure it was given by God and survived unaltered. I believe Judaism has sometimes been misused at the whims of fallible men. I do not believe any man is above the divine or worthy of worship.

I believe in the scientific process and I recognize it has been at the whims of fallible men. I recognize scientific conclusions can be overturned or shown to have been falsified.

I hope that clears it up.

=====

=====

Re: The first step

Posted by richtig - 08 Sep 2024 23:48

---

[livingpalpitation wrote on 06 Sep 2024 17:29:](#)

I hope this is the first step on a journey to rid myself of a profoundly insidious habit. As part of a couple who had difficulty conceiving, I am constantly fearful that my sins will be avenged on my children.

Is that Judaism? I don't know.

At the same time, I am keenly aware that a great deal of prohibitive writings on masturbation drew from incomplete and incorrect understanding of the human body.

Where does the truth lie?

**I need to rid myself of these thoughts but I don't know where to begin.**

I came back to your original post, friend. You write that you need to rid yourself of these thoughts. Why?

As an aside, without ascribing blame, this conversation is better had elsewhere. People join GYE from a variety of backgrounds, and that is wonderful. Emunas chachamim is not the same for everyone and the rishonim even disagreed on such a fundamental issue as divine corporeality. Certainly an issue as the one being discussed here is one that has been long discussed and there are many different opinions among the rabbis. I suspect the plurality of the current makeup of GYE members ascribe to a particular belief how to look at what chazal knew, which you may not. And that's ok.

But ultimately we are here to get clean, regardless of these differences. If we focus on that, believe me, we are in good company.

=====

Re: The first step

Posted by eerie - 09 Sep 2024 00:09

---

[eerie wrote on 08 Sep 2024 06:20:](#)

[richtig wrote on 08 Sep 2024 03:03:](#)

[livingpalpitation wrote on 08 Sep 2024 02:56:](#)



If I may ask, where did you find, and what is, the complete and correct understanding of the human body?

I would like to address this question specifically without further delving into my level of observance or past history.

I do not believe sages living 400-500 years ago had the necessary tools or complete understanding of the human body or reproductive system. In fact, the prevailing opinion regarding semen was that it contained all the necessary building blocks for make a human being.

The extreme language around prohibitions against masturbation is coherent when you consider the lack of scientific knowledge.

What then, do we say about sages living thousands of years ago? I cannot reconcile the lack of knowledge with the certainty of prohibiting this practice. I understand completely it has significant downsides and pornography is clearly a morally corruptive element, but in order to take the necessary steps to curb this behavior, I have to actually understand and believe that the people who prohibited it knew what they were talking about.

At this point in time, I do not.

Is your main reason for considering stopping these behaviors based on the prohibitions, or do you have additional personal motivations?

Dear Pal, please think carefully about Richtig's point.

And, as has been mentioned, this might not be the best place for all your religious questions, but it definitely is the place to beat the bad sexual habits

P.s. I think it is important to point out that masturbation was not prohibited by the sages. It is a Torah prohibition, proclaimed by the Almighty himself. ~~And He definitely knows the reproductive system He created.~~

Godpeed

And Keep trucking!

Dear friend, there are so many people here that will be helpful in fighting the scourge of masturbation, but I, for one, feel that fundamental questions about Judaism are not for this forum.

I just want to add one point.

I regret writing that line that God knows the system He created. I ask Hashem to forgive me. That line gives the impression that I agree that the Sages may possibly have had a flawed understanding, God forbid. I proclaim that I believe with all my heart and soul that the Sages knew more about anything there is to know than anyone that will ever exist. All I meant was to point out that masturbation is a Torah prohibition. God killed Onan. The Sages teach us what the Torah means, and that is Min HaTorah. As others have pointed out, the Torah itself tells us ?? ????. Again, I am not writing this to be part of a discussion of emunah, I am only writing this to express my opinion which it could have C"V been understood that I somewhat agree with the OP thoughts, heaven forfend. And no, I don't consider any of this zealotry.

=====

Re: The first step

Posted by livingpalpitation - 09 Sep 2024 00:38

---

The sages were human. Humans are flawed. People make mistakes, even when operating at a profoundly high spiritual level. I cannot with certainty say there was ever an infallible human being.

Edit: we should not be afraid of this discussion, even if this is not the forum for it. I hope one day your faith will permit not doubt, but strength to ponder beyond only affirming faith.

=====

====

Re: The first step

Posted by cande - 09 Sep 2024 00:47

---

THE END!

thank you.

=====

Re: The first step

Posted by livingpalpitation - 09 Sep 2024 00:55

---

Please don't attempt to silence me in this forum. You are not the authority with whom I should contend.

Thank you to those who attempted to speak to me on the level. And thank you to those who very clearly stated that in order to belong, I have to fall in line.

I don't think I will.

=====

Re: The first step

Posted by eerie - 09 Sep 2024 01:41

---

[livingpalpitation wrote on 09 Sep 2024 00:38:](#)

Edit: we should not be afraid of this discussion, even if this is not the forum for it. I hope one day your faith will permit not doubt, but strength to ponder beyond only affirming faith.

When discussion is for the sake of gaining more understanding, but behind it, underneath it, around it, there is faith, that is a conversation that I would love to be part of. Maybe this is a funny place for it, but I'd enjoy it and possibly partake in it. That type pondering is fine. But this discussion does not have the safety posts in place. There is no faith, with people pondering, trying their best to understand and grasp at the little that their limited intellect can fathom. And it is such a discussion that a faithful Jew, who at least has faith that he affirms, should have no part in.

=====