SA groups in church basement can one join ? Posted by yid2012 - 05 Sep 2012 19:48

i do not want to go to an SA group in the area that i live the best option is one in A Church ? is one permitted to go in their ?

Re: SA groups in church basement can one join ? Posted by Gevura Shebyesod - 05 Sep 2012 20:48

Welcome Reb Yid!

See the 4th paragraph on this page: <u>http://www.guardyoureyes.com/the-gye-program/20-tools/item/tool-16?start=2</u>

Re: SA groups in church basement can one join ? Posted by Dov - 05 Sep 2012 21:14

Thank G-d someone's got seichel. Good link.

====

Re: SA groups in church basement can one join ? Posted by Ash - 09 Sep 2012 10:15

Indeed it's a good link. Also, remember that the addicts mind will try to use anything to rationalize the halt of recovering or acting out even more. Besides how many times have we done things that we are not supposed to and never thought twice about the consequence. If lust is trying to use god as an excuse try the following. Everything and everyone is unique to us in some way. We don't know who or what we will cross paths with that we are supposed to do

something good with. Many times it happens that the help we need is often received from the most unlikeliest of places (trust me I know). You have determined you need a live group (congrats btw for being aware of what you need!) and it happnes to be a church around, use it.....good luck on your journey!

Re: SA groups in church basement can one join ? Posted by cordnoy - 15 Jan 2014 01:29

one of the fellows on this site that is closer to God than I am thought that this might be a question of concern, so I did some research and found this thread.

this is what it says: Even if the group meetings are held in side rooms of a church building, Rav Shmuel Kaminetsky rules that the behaviors we are trying to break free of are by far more severe, and one should not hesitate to join a 12-Step group because of this (barring the main sanctuary).

I also searched for "church," and found this pearl of wisdom from Gevurah:

Woman at a party: "Sir, you are drunk."

Churchill: "Madam, you are ugly. And in the morning, I shall be sober."

Re: SA groups in church basement can one join ? Posted by cordnoy - 15 Jan 2014 19:11

cordnoy wrote:

one of the fellows on this site that is closer to God than I am thought that this might be a question of concern, so I did some research and found this thread.

this is what it says: Even if the group meetings are held in side rooms of a church building, Rav Shmuel Kaminetsky rules that the behaviors we are trying to break free of are by far more severe, and one should not hesitate to join a 12-Step group because of this (barring the main sanctuary).

I also searched for "church," and found this pearl of wisdom from Gevurah:

Woman at a party: "Sir, you are drunk."

Churchill: "Madam, you are ugly. And in the morning, I shall be sober."

from a Rabbi in an email to me: Rabbi Moshe Tendler told me that his father-in-law, Rebbe Moshe Feinstein, said that one may go into the basement of a Protestant church, but not a Catholic church, because the latter have statues.

====

====

Re: SA groups in church basement can one join ? Posted by Pidaini - 15 Jan 2014 23:59

In the thread mentioned above there is a paragraph before that, it reads

"Rabbi Twerski suggests that it is preferable to try and internalize the 12 Steps first through GYE's anonymous 12-Step phone conference groups that we discussed above.....However, for those of us who did not find the phone conferences to be sufficient, we will need to take our recovery to the next level and seek out a live group in our area"

One should certainly try the calls before getting into a situation that needs heterim.

Re: SA groups in church basement can one join ? Posted by cordnoy - 16 Jan 2014 01:45

Pidaini wrote:

In the thread mentioned above there is a paragraph before that, it reads

"Rabbi Twerski suggests that it is preferable to try and internalize the 12 Steps first through GYE's anonymous 12-Step phone conference groups that we discussed above.....However, for those of us who did not find the phone conferences to be sufficient, we will need to take our recovery to the next level and seek out a live group in our area"

One should certainly try the calls before getting into a situation that needs heterim.

It seems from R' Twerski in the quote mentioned above that he says first the calls and then the meetings (even in a church). R' Kamenetsky, however, did not say that. He said that one should not hesitate to join these meetings.

therefore, I am curious, my dear chaver Pidaini, whose psak was the last sentence that you wrote? Are you deciding between these two Sages?

thanks for your concern...like always

Re: SA groups in church basement can one join ? Posted by Pidaini - 16 Jan 2014 08:34

I do not see a stirah between the two in the least. I do not see a doichek in assuming that R' Shmuel was dealing with someone who needed it (Teidah from the way Guard layed out that article, first saying that one should do the calls and *if that is not enough* then one should not hesitate to go to live meetings quoting R' Shmuel, which would mean that R' Shmuel agrees to everything up to where guard quotes him).

Yes, if someone needs it for sobriety then one should be going, but how can one know if he needs it if he hasn't tried the calls yet?

2) R' Shmuel is BH still alive and well, he can still be asked to clarify if he meant that anybody in any situation should be going to live step meetings in churches. And as every situation is different one should always ask their posek for thier specific situation.

One of my friends here on GYE always likes pointing out that this is an anonymous forum and nothing, and certainly not something as sever a Avodah Zara, should be taken lightly.

Re: SA groups in church basement can one join ? Posted by cordnoy - 16 Jan 2014 08:44

Pidaini wrote:

I do not see a stirah between the two in the least. I do not see a doichek in assuming that R' Shmuel was dealing with someone who needed it (Teidah from the way Guard layed out that article, first saying that one should do the calls and *if that is not enough* then one should not hesitate to go to live meetings quoting R' Shmuel, which would mean that R' Shmuel agrees to everything up to where guard quotes him).

Yes, if someone needs it for sobriety then one should be going, but how can one know if he needs it if he hasn't tried the calls yet?

2) R' Shmuel is BH still alive and well, he can still be asked to clarify if he meant that anybody in any situation should be going to live step meetings in churches. And as every situation is different one should always ask their posek for thier specific situation.

One of my friends here on GYE always likes pointing out that this is an anonymous forum and nothing, and certainly not something as sever a Avodah Zara, should be taken lightly.

rischa d'oraysa here

giluy arayos is pretty chamur as well

and when it comes to a"z, the psak from reb shmuel, whomever was quoting it, (according to you) should have said: when all else fails and when all options have been exhausted and when a competent reliable orthodox understander of sex addiction is asked, then and only then should one enter the churches double doors in the back.

in conclusion: I am not aying it is muttar, and I am not even saying that reb shmuel said so....I am merely being mefalpel in the inyan.

[agav, is roman catholic the same as catholic? does one say shakeitz teshaktzenu before entering or after entering?]

Re: SA groups in church basement can one join ? Posted by kilochalu - 17 Jan 2014 05:42

be mefalpel in shnayim ochazin batallis

laytzanusa d'avoda zara is muttar and mitzva when one is making fun of a"z not making light of issues regarding a"z

when the poskim deal with shaylos of a"z and they have sfaikos in d'oraysa, d'rabanan and less they go lechumra to stay away from a"z, quoting chazal "harchek min hakiur"

you wrote "giluy arayos is pretty chamur as well" 1000% thats why we're here (maybe not lefi Dov), but there are other reasons not to jump to a live group for someone whom its not necessary for, for several reasons, so the whole issue is not really so nogeya ====

Re: SA groups in church basement can one join ? Posted by kilochalu - 17 Jan 2014 05:54

agav in todays daf yomi the gemara says that the chachomim were first mevatel the yetzer of avoda zora and then went to work on the yetzer of arayos and gave up on being mevatel it.

(see poras yosef in back of the gemara as to why they worked on a"z first)

Re: SA groups in church basement can one join ? Posted by Lizhensk - 17 Jan 2014 13:30

kilochalu wrote:

agav in todays daf yomi the gemara says that the chachomim were first mevatel the yetzer of avoda zora and then went to work on the yetzer of arayos and gave up on being mevatel it.

(see poras yosef in back of the gemara as to why they worked on a"z first)

Wait a second, i thought your already busy 25 hours a day, when do you have time for Daf Yomi!?!?

Re: SA groups in church basement can one join ? Posted by cordnoy - 17 Jan 2014 19:55

nice that many here received their semichah

good to see we have so many poskim here

====

Re: SA groups in church basement can one join ? Posted by cordnoy - 17 Jan 2014 22:29

I am sorry, but I reread this post, and take issue with some of it (the post; not the person c"v)

kilochalu wrote:

be mefalpel in shnayim ochazin batallis

what does that mean? would the poster have any idea how much people on this site are learning? does he mean to say that this particular issue should not be discussed at all...in any type of manner? why not?

kilochalu wrote:

laytzanusa d'avoda zara is muttar and mitzva when one is making fun of a"z not making light of issues regarding a"z

this sentence I took to heart. I reread my post above and edited and deleted based upon it; thank you for that.

kilochalu wrote:

but there are other reasons not to jump to a live group for someone whom its not necessary for, for several reasons, so the whole issue is not really so nogeya

who was this for? yes, some might have reasons not to go, but some do! to offer a blanket

statement that the whole issue is not nogea? it is very nogea! while some communities are blessed with sa groups in schools, libraries and even shuls (perhaps), there are others that do not have that luxury.

And to repeat: I am not saying muttar or assur; there were poskim quoted above, and one can ask his Rav.

My apologies, and thank you.

b'hatzlachah