eitzos for emunah and bitachon
Posted by higher - 24 Oct 2019 17:33

_____

i would be interested to hear anyone's personal tried and proven eitzos for strengthening their connection with Hashem. The times that ive felt close to Hashem i felt that i didnt want anything else. i think it can help in this struggle.

thanks in advance.

==========

Re: eitzos for emunah and bitachon
Posted by DavidT - 22 Jun 2020 16:44

_____

Everything we do is governed by the hashgacha of Hashem. Even when we decide to do a simple act of kindness, Hashem is involved every step of the way. He decides who the recipients of the kindness will be and the way the kindness will be done. We choose to do the chesed and then Hashem ensures that it’s done the way He knows is best. Most of the time, we’re not able to see the benefits and the results from our acts of chesed, but sometimes Hashem does allow us to see them and gives us the pleasure of seeing the fruits of our labor.

All of our deeds of chesed are precious and they go a very long way. Hashem is involved in each one of them. He doesn’t always show us the effects of those deeds, but we can rest assured that they are all special and all accomplish a lot.

==========

Re: eitzos for emunah and bitachon
Posted by DavidT - 09 Feb 2021 17:12

_____

Getting inspiration or chizuk is such an important part of life. There are times when a person finds himself struggling to live up to his potential. It could be because something is bothering him or just that he’s lacking in motivation. Hearing the right words could change everything. It could change a person’s outlook, bring back joy into his life and give him the motivation he needs to produce the way he is capable of producing. A person should always look for inspiration by reading sifreh musar or listening to inspirational speakers and, of course, the person should pray to Hashem to direct him to the right chizuk that will be especially beneficial to him.

==========

Re: eitzos for emunah and bitachon
Posted by bego - 09 Feb 2021 17:25

_____

DavidT wrote on 09 Feb 2021 17:12**:**

Getting inspiration or chizuk is such an important part of life. There are times when a person finds himself struggling to live up to his potential. It could be because something is bothering him or just that he’s lacking in motivation. Hearing the right words could change everything. It could change a person’s outlook, bring back joy into his life and give him the motivation he needs to produce the way he is capable of producing. A person should always look for inspiration by reading sifreh musar or listening to inspirational speakers and, of course, the person should pray to Hashem to direct him to the right chizuk that will be especially beneficial to him.

Definitely true, but be wary of fake chizuk. Stories that are the chizuk equivalent of porn, meaning a quick high and then a serious low. I leave it to my fellow GYE'ers to work out which is which.

==========

Re: eitzos for emunah and bitachon
Posted by DavidT - 07 Mar 2021 17:59

_____

Rabbi Duvi Bensoussan told a story about a Sephardic girl from Canada. She was dating for quite a few years and her mother kept telling her that the reason she’s not getting married is because she’s dressing too modestly, and no one is noticing her. On one occasion, her mother pushed her so much she finally broke and went to a wedding dressed immodestly. When she arrived, she gave her coat to be hung up, feeling very insecure and out of place. When she turned around, she saw her rabbi who just walked in. She was so ashamed. She turned red, immediately went back to the coat check to get her coat and ran out of the wedding. She felt so uncomfortable and out of place, she couldn’t bear to be there for one more second like that. She came back to the wedding an hour and a half later, this time dressed in her regular, modest garb. She felt dignified, like a princess, and spent the rest of the night with a huge smile on her face, proud to be a Bat Yisrael, dressing according to the codes of modesty. She felt an inner joy knowing that she just passed a test and did the will of Hashem.

The very next morning, this girl got a phone call from a shadchanit, asking her if she was at that wedding on the previous night. When she replied in the affirmative, the woman then said, “A lady there noticed that your smile there was so radiant and you were walking with such confidence. You looked so happy. She’s asking about you for her son. Are you interested in trying it?”

She replied, “This is very funny. I originally went to that wedding last night dressed a certain way, thinking that would get me a shidduch. Turns out, what got me the shidduch was my happiness from going home to change and dressing the way Hashem wants me to dress.”

P.S. They went out and a couple of months later they were engaged.

We all have a very lofty mission that we are trying to accomplish in this world. The tests are hard, but they are meant to elevate us. We should feel proud every time we persevere, knowing that we are doing the ratzon Hashem.

==========

Re: eitzos for emunah and bitachon
Posted by DavidT - 11 Mar 2021 17:12

_____

When we deal with life's struggles, what makes our problems so much worse is the anxiety which results from thinking that they are never going to go away. This is where emunah could do wonders. Someone who knows that his problem was sent to him by his loving Hashem, who has calculated and measured precisely how difficult it should be for exactly how long it needs to be that way, and he won’t experience a second more or a second less of what’s necessary, will have a much easier time dealing with that problem. When a person is able to strengthen himself with this emunah, it’s a very valuable avodat Hashem.

The pasuk says in Mishleh, perek 17, “????? ????? ?'– Hashem checks our hearts.” What is He checking them for? Rabbenu Yonah writes, to see if we have bitachon in Him. The stronger our reliance on Hashem is, the better off we’ll be in this world and the Next.

We must also believe no matter how tough of a situation we seem to be in, Hashem could always take us out of it. Even people who, lo alenu, felt that they had nothing left to live for, eventually had joy brought back into their lives.

==========

Re: eitzos for emunah and bitachon
Posted by DavidT - 26 Oct 2021 18:25

_____

The Sefas Emmes brings an explanation in the pasuk that gives us advice on how to hasten salvations. When a person truly understands ???? ???? ???? – that he is not capable of figuring out the solution, but rather, he trusts in Hashem to do it, then ???? ??? ?' – that triggers Hashem to bring the salvation.

==========

Re: eitzos for emunah and bitachon
Posted by Captain - 06 Dec 2022 04:47

_____

Clarifying about Hashem's control over the world:

This is a very important point to clarify, because The Ani Maamin (printed in the siddur) says that one of the 13 principles of faith (to avoid being an apikores) is that Hashem creates and guides every creation, and **He Does, Did, And Will Do All The Actions**. (The Chofetz Chaim and Brisker Rov both said that the Ani Maamins printed in the siddur are the most authoritative position on the 13 principles of faith.) Let's explore whether the Rishonim agree with this statement of the Ani Maamin.

(Note: I am deliberately avoiding the terms Hashgocha Protis and Hashgacha Klalis for now, for reasons that will become clear later.)

Someone earlier on this thread suggested that we deal with the Rishonim instead of contemporary opinions. This is a great idea. But let's first start by going back even earlier, to two Gemaros and a Talmud Yerushalmi.

Shabbos 32a:

The students of Rabbi Yishmael taught: [The posuk says (Devarim 22:8)] “when the nofel (person who falls) falls off [the roof]." The Torah should have stated that "when a man falls off the roof," not "when the 'faller' falls off the roof," because this man did not yet fall off the roof [at the time the Torah was written]! Rather, this person was fit to fall from sheishes yemei bereishis (the six days of creation) [meaning that this was in Hashem's plan from then].

Rashi d”h Misheishes Yemei Bereishis:

As the posuk (Yeshaya 51) says, Hashem is the korei hadoros meirosh, the One Who calls out the generations from the beginning of the world. It was already then revealed before Him all the generations, their deeds, and the punishments they would have to receive for their sins.

Chullin 7b:

Rabbi Chanina said, a person does not injure his finger below unless they first announced it about him from Above.

Yerushalmi Sheviis Perek 9, Halacha 1:

Rabbi Shimon bar Yochai was debating whether to leave the cave. He saw that a trapper had set traps for birds, and a heavenly voice came out and said “acquitted” and the bird escaped. Rabbi Shimon said, “No bird will be caught without Heaven, and surely not a person.”

Here's a list of Rishonim who are clear that Hashem controls every action of every person's life, and nothing is left to chance:

Chovos Halevavos (Shaar Habitachon, Chapter 2 Condition 6; Chapter 3 Part 1 Condition 5; Chapter 3 Part 5; Chapter 4 Part 1; and many other places)

Rambam (Hilchos Taanis Perek 1 Halacha 3)

Rabbi Avrohom ben Harambam (Sefer Hamaspik, Chapter 8, already on the first page and at least 20 times throughout the chapter)

Sefer Hachinuch (Mitzvah 241)

Kuzari (Maamar 3 Os 11)

Meiri (Shabbos 55a)

Ramban (Shemos Perek 13 posuk 16)

(I can't ignore the acharonim entirely, especially some big names:

Seforno (he is an Acharon. Lived from 1475-1550)- Ohr Amim, in Kisvei Rabbi Ovadia Seforno, chapter 15, Hashgacha.

Gra- Yahel Ohr, Shelach 157b, d”h de'inun be'irei. Also Sifra Detzeniusa 55a

Chofetz Chaim- Shem Olam, Shaar Shemiras Shabbos, chapter 3. And many other places.

Chazon Ish- Emunah Ubitachon, Chapter 2

They all are clear that Hashem controls every event that happens in this world, bar none.)

So why is there so much confusion on this topic? Most of it has to do with that there are lines in a bunch of Rishonim about people having just Hashgacha Klalis, and their intent is misunderstood. This word “Hashgacha” is a language of Rishonim, and we must understand what they meant with it.

1) The Rishonim often use “Hashgacha Protis” to mean that the person receiving schar ve'onesh, rather than his life being decided by Hashem using other calculations, which is referred to as Hashgacha Klalis. In fact, this is clearly what is going on in the Sforno (Vayikra 13:47) and Michtav Me'eliyahu (Volume 2 p 75-77) that someone mentioned earlier. See them inside. And see earlier that I mentioned a different writing of the Sforno who goes on for five pages discussing that Hashem is controlling every action.

2) The Rishonim often use the word Hashgacha to refer to Hashem controlling things directly with extra protection. And they use the word “Mikreh” to refer to Hashem controlling things himself using nature, and without invoking extra protection for the person. This can be seen clearly in Ramban Bereshis 19:8 and in Ramban Bamidbar 11:19. And see Rabbeinu Bachya Kad Hakemach on Hashgacha, where this is also clear.

There are some excellent contemporary writings on this subject as well. For hebrew, see the Sefer Be'emunah Shelemah by Rabbi Yosef Zalman Bloch. For English (with hebrew sources), see Divine Providence by Ephraim Pinczower.

I hope this clarifies things. Hashem is controlling every action.

==========

Re: eitzos for emunah and bitachon
Posted by bego - 06 Dec 2022 09:41

_____

Captain wrote on 06 Dec 2022 04:47**:**

Clarifying about Hashem's control over the world:

This is a very important point to clarify, because The Ani Maamin (printed in the siddur) says that one of the 13 principles of faith (to avoid being an apikores) is that Hashem creates and guides every creation, and **He Does, Did, And Will Do All The Actions**. (The Chofetz Chaim and Brisker Rov both said that the Ani Maamins printed in the siddur are the most authoritative position on the 13 principles of faith.) Let's explore whether the Rishonim agree with this statement of the Ani Maamin.

(Note: I am deliberately avoiding the terms Hashgocha Protis and Hashgacha Klalis for now, for reasons that will become clear later.)

Someone earlier on this thread suggested that we deal with the Rishonim instead of contemporary opinions. This is a great idea. But let's first start by going back even earlier, to two Gemaros and a Talmud Yerushalmi.

Shabbos 32a:

The students of Rabbi Yishmael taught: [The posuk says (Devarim 22:8)] “when the nofel

(person who falls) falls off [the roof]." The Torah should have stated that "when a man falls off the roof," not "when the 'faller' falls off the roof," because this man did not yet fall off the roof [at the time the Torah was written]! Rather, this person was fit to fall from sheishes yemei bereishis (the six days of creation) [meaning that this was in Hashem's plan from then].

Rashi d"h Misheishes Yemei Bereishis:

As the posuk (Yeshaya 51) says, Hashem is the korei hadoros meirosh, the One Who calls out the generations from the beginning of the world. It was already then revealed before Him all the generations, their deeds, and the punishments they would have to receive for their sins.

Chullin 7b:

Rabbi Chanina said, a person does not injure his finger below unless they first announced it about him from Above.

Yerushalmi Sheviis Perek 9, Halacha 1:

Rabbi Shimon bar Yochai was debating whether to leave the cave. He saw that a trapper had set traps for birds, and a heavenly voice came out and said "acquitted" and the bird escaped. Rabbi Shimon said, "No bird will be caught without Heaven, and surely not a person."

Here's a list of Rishonim who are clear that Hashem controls every action of every person's life, and nothing is left to chance:

Chovos Halevavos (Shaar Habitachon, Chapter 2 Condition 6; Chapter 3 Part 1 Condition 5; Chapter 3 Part 5; Chapter 4 Part 1; and many other places)

Rambam (Hilchos Taanis Perek 1 Halacha 3)

Rabbi Avrohom ben Harambam (Sefer Hamaspik, Chapter 8, already on the first page and at least 20 times throughout the chapter)

Sefer Hachinuch (Mitzvah 241)

Kuzari (Maamar 3 Os 11)

Meiri (Shabbos 55a)

Ramban (Shemos Perek 13 posuk 16)

(I can't ignore the acharonim entirely, especially some big names:

Seforno (he is an Acharon. Lived from 1475-1550)- Ohr Amim, in Kisvei Rabbi Ovadia Seforno, chapter 15, Hashgacha.

Gra- Yahel Ohr, Shelach 157b, d”h de'inun be'irei. Also Sifra Detzeniusa 55a

Chofetz Chaim- Shem Olam, Shaar Shemiras Shabbos, chapter 3. And many other places.

Chazon Ish- Emunah Ubitachon, Chapter 2

They all are clear that Hashem controls every event that happens in this world, bar none.)

So why is there so much confusion on this topic? Most of it has to do with that there are lines in a bunch of Rishonim about people having just Hashgacha Klalis, and their intent is misunderstood. This word “Hashgacha” is a language of Rishonim, and we must understand what they meant with it.

1) The Rishonim often use “Hashgacha Protis” to mean that the person receiving schar ve'onesh, rather than his life being decided by Hashem using other calculations, which is referred to as Hashgacha Klalis. In fact, this is clearly what is going on in the Sforno (Vayikra 13:47) and Michtav Me'eliyahu (Volume 2 p 75-77) that someone mentioned earlier. See them inside. And see earlier that I mentioned a different writing of the Sforno who goes on for five pages discussing that Hashem is controlling every action.

2) The Rishonim often use the word Hashgacha to refer to Hashem controlling things directly with extra protection. And they use the word “Mikreh” to refer to Hashem controlling things himself using nature, and without invoking extra protection for the person. This can be seen clearly in Ramban Bereshis 19:8 and in Ramban Bamidbar 11:19. And see Rabbeinu Bachya Kad Hakemach on Hashgacha, where this is also clear.

There are some excellent contemporary writings on this subject as well. For hebrew, see the Sefer Be'emunah Shelemah by Rabbi Yosef Zalman Bloch. For English (with hebrew sources), see Divine Providence by Ephraim Pinczower.

I hope this clarifies things. Hashem is controlling every action.

One of the more patronising pieces written recently on the site.

You hope it clarifies things? As though we are all awash in a sea of ignorance until you clarify it? Apology accepted.

1) the most authoritative source of the Rambam's 13 ikkrim is, funnily enough, the Rambam. They are available to all in the Ibn Tibbon Hebrew as well as more modern versions. Go learn them. They have little resemblance to the catechism that is the printed the version.

?2) Loving the assumption that you know that the Rishonim mean. The Rishonim say what they mean and mean what they say (except the Rambam who deliberately tried to mislead people, but he admits to that openly).

3) seforno - not sure which version you have, but the real version (not the censored one) clearly says most people, Jews and not, are given over to nature (stars, however you choose to interpret that).

4) I think you got that bit about mikreh vs. hashgocgo from sifsei chaim maybe? He's an opinion, not the only one.

5) learn the last of the 8 perokim of the 8 perokim (sounds like tautology but isn't). He explains what Hashem being in control means (albeit contradicted in various parts of Yad and Moreh but that just makes it more fun to work out what he was saying).

6) that Ramban and Rabbeinu Bachya DO mean what they say, even if it's not conveient. Most people, dont have hashgocho protis.

7) the later seforim changed everything. If someone wants to follow them, they are absolutely entitled to. But we mustn't rewrite the Rishonim.

Sorry if too harsh but I need to sleep and your post needed replying to.

==========

====

Re: eitzos for emunah and bitachon
Posted by Captain - 06 Dec 2022 14:22

_____

bego wrote on 06 Dec 2022 09:41**:**

Captain wrote on 06 Dec 2022 04:47**:**

Clarifying about Hashem's control over the world:

This is a very important point to clarify, because The Ani Maamin (printed in the siddur) says that one of the 13 principles of faith (to avoid being an apikores) is that Hashem creates and guides every creation, and **He Does, Did, And Will Do All The Actions**. (The Chofetz Chaim and Brisker Rov both said that the Ani Maamins printed in the siddur are the most authoritative position on the 13 principles of faith.) Let's explore whether the Rishonim agree with this statement of the Ani Maamin.

(Note: I am deliberately avoiding the terms Hashgocha Protis and Hashgacha Klalis for now, for reasons that will become clear later.)

Someone earlier on this thread suggested that we deal with the Rishonim instead of contemporary opinions. This is a great idea. But let's first start by going back even earlier, to two Gemaros and a Talmud Yerushalmi.

Shabbos 32a:

The students of Rabbi Yishmael taught: [The posuk says (Devarim 22:8)] “when the nofel (person who falls) falls off [the roof]." The Torah should have stated that "when a man falls off the roof," not "when the 'faller' falls off the roof," because this man did not yet fall off the roof [at the time the Torah was written]! Rather, this person was fit to fall from sheishes yemei bereishis (the six days of creation) [meaning that this was in Hashem's plan from then].

Rashi d”h Misheishes Yemei Bereishis:

As the posuk (Yeshaya 51) says, Hashem is the korei hadoros meirosh, the One Who calls out the generations from the beginning of the world. It was already then revealed before Him all the generations, their deeds, and the punishments they would have to receive for their sins.

Chullin 7b:

Rabbi Chanina said, a person does not injure his finger below unless they first announced it about him from Above.

Yerushalmi Sheviis Perek 9, Halacha 1:

Rabbi Shimon bar Yochai was debating whether to leave the cave. He saw that a trapper had set traps for birds, and a heavenly voice came out and said “acquitted” and the bird escaped. Rabbi Shimon said, “No bird will be caught without Heaven, and surely not a person.”

Here's a list of Rishonim who are clear that Hashem controls every action of every person's life, and nothing is left to chance:

Chovos Halevavos (Shaar Habitachon, Chapter 2 Condition 6; Chapter 3 Part 1 Condition 5; Chapter 3 Part 5; Chapter 4 Part 1; and many other places)

Rambam (Hilchos Taanis Perek 1 Halacha 3)

Rabbi Avrohom ben Harambam (Sefer Hamaspik, Chapter 8, already on the first page and at least 20 times throughout the chapter)

Sefer Hachinuch (Mitzvah 241)

Kuzari (Maamar 3 Os 11)

Meiri (Shabbos 55a)

Ramban (Shemos Perek 13 posuk 16)

(I can't ignore the acharonim entirely, especially some big names:

Seforno (he is an Acharon. Lived from 1475-1550)- Ohr Amim, in Kisvei Rabbi Ovadia Seforno, chapter 15, Hashgacha.

Gra- Yahel Ohr, Shelach 157b, d”h de'inun be'irei. Also Sifra Detzeniusa 55a

Chofetz Chaim- Shem Olam, Shaar Shemiras Shabbos, chapter 3. And many other places.

Chazon Ish- Emunah Ubitachon, Chapter 2

They all are clear that Hashem controls every event that happens in this world, bar none.)

So why is there so much confusion on this topic? Most of it has to do with that there are lines in a bunch of Rishonim about people having just Hashgacha Klalis, and their intent is misunderstood. This word “Hashgacha” is a language of Rishonim, and we must understand what they meant with it.

1) The Rishonim often use “Hashgacha Protis” to mean that the person receiving schar ve'onesh, rather than his life being decided by Hashem using other calculations, which is referred to as Hashgacha Klalis. In fact, this is clearly what is going on in the Sforno (Vayikra 13:47) and Michtav Me'eliyahu (Volume 2 p 75-77) that someone mentioned earlier. See them inside. And see earlier that I mentioned a different writing of the Sforno who goes on for five pages discussing that Hashem is controlling every action.

2) The Rishonim often use the word Hashgacha to refer to Hashem controlling things directly with extra protection. And they use the word “Mikreh” to refer to Hashem controlling things himself using nature, and without invoking extra protection for the person. This can be seen clearly in Ramban Bereshis 19:8 and in Ramban Bamidbar 11:19. And see Rabbeinu Bachya Kad Hakemach on Hashgacha, where this is also clear.

There are some excellent contemporary writings on this subject as well. For hebrew, see the Sefer Be'emunah Shelemah by Rabbi Yosef Zalman Bloch. For English (with hebrew sources), see Divine Providence by Ephraim Pinczower.

I hope this clarifies things. Hashem is controlling every action.

One of the more patronising pieces written recently on the site.

You hope it clarifies things? As though we are all awash in a sea of ignorance until you clarify it? Apology accepted.

1) the most authoritative source of the Rambam's 13 ikkrim is, funnily enough, the Rambam. They are available to all in the Ibn Tibbon Hebrew as well as more modern versions. Go learn them. They have little resemblance to the catechism that is the printed the version.

?2) Loving the assumption that you know that the Rishonim mean. The Rishonim say what they mean and mean what they say (except the Rambam who deliberately tried to mislead people, but he admits to that openly).

3) seforno - not sure which version you have, but the real version (not the censored one) clearly says most people, Jews and not, are given over to nature (stars, however you choose to interpret that).

4) I think you got that bit about mikreh vs. hashgocgo from sifsei chaim maybe? He's an opinion, not the only one.

5) learn the last of the 8 perokim of the 8 perokim (sounds like tautology but isn't). He explains what Hashem being in control means (albeit contradicted in various parts of Yad and Moreh but that just makes it more fun to work out what he was saying).

6) that Ramban and Rabbeinu Bachya DO mean what they say, even if it's not conveient. Most people, dont have hashgocho protis.

7) the later seforim changed everything. If someone wants to follow them, they are absolutely entitled to. But we mustn't rewrite the Rishonim.

Sorry if too harsh but I need to sleep and your post needed replying to.

Rabbeinu Bego Shlita,

I have tremendous respect for you and your knowledge. I would like to respectfully respond to some of the points that you made.

1) This one was based on later sources. The Chofetz Chaim and Brisker Rav are later

sources. For myself, i'm nervous arguing with them about what the 13 principles of faith are, since becoming an apikores is at risk. But everyone can do what they want. That's why I brought up exploring the Rishonim.

2) The List of Rishonim I brought all mean what they say.

3) I think it's very important to read the other piece of the Seforno. when an author takes 5 pages to discuss a topic, it's very important to read that before we say that we know what his opinion is, no matter how clear the other spot seems to be.

4) Never read it. Maybe I should have. But I like to read the Rishonim for myself without later explanation, at least first. (I think we are similar in this regard.

5) I have read it.

6) Not sure which Rabbeinu Bachya you're referring to. But see what he wrote in Devorim 22:8 and in Kad Hakemach on hashgocha. Of course the Ramban writes that not everyone has "Hashgocha Pratis," but at the same time, many times within the same piece, he writes openly that everything that happens in the person's life was decided by Hashem. please see the two pieces that i mentioned.

7) Not sure which later seforim you're referring to. I haven't read that many of them. If I find the time I might. Please let me know.

I ask that you don't turn this into typical anonymous-internet-forum-style mudslinging. I gave a list of Rishonim. Anyone can read them and comment on them, or not. I think everyone should read through the Rishonim, the ones I mentioned and others that Bego will share, and form an opinion for themselves.

Again, with respect and love,

Captain

==========

Re: eitzos for emunah and bitachon
Posted by bego - 06 Dec 2022 15:45

Captain wrote on 06 Dec 2022 14:22**:**

bego wrote on 06 Dec 2022 09:41**:**

Captain wrote on 06 Dec 2022 04:47**:**

Clarifying about Hashem's control over the world:

This is a very important point to clarify, because The Ani Maamin (printed in the siddur) says that one of the 13 principles of faith (to avoid being an apikores) is that Hashem creates and guides every creation, and **He Does, Did, And Will Do All The Actions**. (The Chofetz Chaim and Brisker Rov both said that the Ani Maamins printed in the siddur are the most authoritative position on the 13 principles of faith.) Let's explore whether the Rishonim agree with this statement of the Ani Maamin.

(Note: I am deliberately avoiding the terms Hashgocha Protis and Hashgacha Klalis for now, for reasons that will become clear later.)

Someone earlier on this thread suggested that we deal with the Rishonim instead of contemporary opinions. This is a great idea. But let's first start by going back even earlier, to two Gemaros and a Talmud Yerushalmi.

Shabbos 32a:

The students of Rabbi Yishmael taught: [The posuk says (Devarim 22:8)] “when the nofel (person who falls) falls off [the roof]." The Torah should have stated that "when a man falls off the roof," not "when the 'faller' falls off the roof," because this man did not yet fall off the roof [at the time the Torah was written]! Rather, this person was fit to fall from sheishes yemei bereishis (the six days of creation) [meaning that this was in Hashem's plan from then].

Rashi d”h Misheishes Yemei Bereishis:

As the posuk (Yeshaya 51) says, Hashem is the korei hadoros meirosh, the One Who calls out the generations from the beginning of the world. It was already then revealed before Him all the generations, their deeds, and the punishments they would have to receive for their sins.

Chullin 7b:

Rabbi Chanina said, a person does not injure his finger below unless they first announced it about him from Above.

Yerushalmi Sheviis Perek 9, Halacha 1:

Rabbi Shimon bar Yochai was debating whether to leave the cave. He saw that a trapper had set traps for birds, and a heavenly voice came out and said “acquitted” and the bird escaped. Rabbi Shimon said, “No bird will be caught without Heaven, and surely not a person.”

Here's a list of Rishonim who are clear that Hashem controls every action of every person's life, and nothing is left to chance:

Chovos Halevavos (Shaar Habitachon, Chapter 2 Condition 6; Chapter 3 Part 1 Condition 5; Chapter 3 Part 5; Chapter 4 Part 1; and many other places)

Rambam (Hilchos Taanis Perek 1 Halacha 3)

Rabbi Avrohom ben Harambam (Sefer Hamaspik, Chapter 8, already on the first page and at least 20 times throughout the chapter)

Sefer Hachinuch (Mitzvah 241)

Kuzari (Maamar 3 Os 11)

Meiri (Shabbos 55a)

Ramban (Shemos Perek 13 posuk 16)

(I can't ignore the acharonim entirely, especially some big names:

Seforno (he is an Acharon. Lived from 1475-1550)- Ohr Amim, in Kisvei Rabbi Ovadia Seforno, chapter 15, Hashgacha.

Gra- Yahel Ohr, Shelach 157b, d”h de'inun be'irei. Also Sifra Detzeniusa 55a

Chofetz Chaim- Shem Olam, Shaar Shemiras Shabbos, chapter 3. And many other places.

Chazon Ish- Emunah Ubitachon, Chapter 2

They all are clear that Hashem controls every event that happens in this world, bar none.)

So why is there so much confusion on this topic? Most of it has to do with that there are lines in a bunch of Rishonim about people having just Hashgacha Klalis, and their intent is misunderstood. This word “Hashgacha” is a language of Rishonim, and we must understand what they meant with it.

1) The Rishonim often use “Hashgacha Protis” to mean that the person receiving schar ve'onesh, rather than his life being decided by Hashem using other calculations, which is referred to as Hashgacha Klalis. In fact, this is clearly what is going on in the Sforno (Vayikra 13:47) and Michtav Me'eliyahu (Volume 2 p 75-77) that someone mentioned earlier. See them inside. And see earlier that I mentioned a different writing of the Sforno who goes on for five pages discussing that Hashem is controlling every action.

2) The Rishonim often use the word Hashgacha to refer to Hashem controlling things directly with extra protection. And they use the word “Mikreh” to refer to Hashem controlling things himself using nature, and without invoking extra protection for the person. This can be seen clearly in Ramban Bereshis 19:8 and in Ramban Bamidbar 11:19. And see Rabbeinu Bachya Kad Hakemach on Hashgacha, where this is also clear.

There are some excellent contemporary writings on this subject as well. For hebrew, see the Sefer Be'emunah Shelemah by Rabbi Yosef Zalman Bloch. For English (with hebrew sources), see Divine Providence by Ephraim Pinczower.

I hope this clarifies things. Hashem is controlling every action.

One of the more patronising pieces written recently on the site.

You hope it clarifies things? As though we are all awash in a sea of ignorance until you clarify it? Apology accepted.

1) the most authoritative source of the Rambam's 13 ikkrim is, funnily enough, the Rambam. They are available to all in the Ibn Tibbon Hebrew as well as more modern versions. Go learn them. They have little resemblance to the catechism that is the printed the version.

?2) Loving the assumption that you know that the Rishonim mean. The Rishonim say what they

mean and mean what they say (except the Rambam who deliberately tried to mislead people, but he admits to that openly).

3) seforno - not sure which version you have, but the real version (not the censored one) clearly says most people, Jews and not, are given over to nature (stars, however you choose to interpret that).

4) I think you got that bit about mikreh vs. hashgocgo from sifsei chaim maybe? He's an opinion, not the only one.

5) learn the last of the 8 perokim of the 8 perokim (sounds like tautology but isn't). He explains what Hashem being in control means (albeit contradicted in various parts of Yad and Moreh but that just makes it more fun to work out what he was saying).

6) that Ramban and Rabbeinu Bachya DO mean what they say, even if it's not conveient. Most people, dont have hashgocho protis.

7) the later seforim changed everything. If someone wants to follow them, they are absolutely entitled to. But we mustn't rewrite the Rishonim.

Sorry if too harsh but I need to sleep and your post needed replying to.

Rabbeinu Bego Shlita,

I have tremendous respect for you and your knowledge. I would like to respectfully respond to some of the points that you made.

1) This one was based on later sources. The Chofetz Chaim and Brisker Rav are later sources. For myself, i'm nervous arguing with them about what the 13 principles of faith are, since becoming an apikores is at risk. But everyone can do what they want. That’s why I brought up exploring the Rishonim.

2) The List of Rishonim I brought all mean what they say.

3) I think it’s very important to read the other piece of the Seforno. when an author takes 5

pages to discuss a topic, it's very important to read that before we say that we know what his opinion is, no matter how clear the other spot seems to be.

4) Never read it. Maybe I should have. But I like to read the Rishonim for myself without later explanation, at least first. (I think we are similar in this regard.

5) I have read it.

6) Not sure which Rabbeinu Bachya you're referring to. But see what he wrote in Devorim 22:8 and in Kad Hakemach on hashgocha. Of course the Ramban writes that not everyone has “Hashgocha Pratis,” but at the same time, many times within the same piece, he writes openly that everything that happens in the person's life was decided by Hashem. please see the two pieces that i mentioned.

7) Not sure which later seforim you're referring to. I haven't read that many of them. If I find the time I might. Please let me know.

I ask that you don't turn this into typical anonymous-internet-forum-style mudslinging. I gave a list of Rishonim. Anyone can read them and comment on them, or not. I think everyone should read through the Rishonim, the ones I mentioned and others that Bego will share, and form an opinion for themselves.

Again, with respect and love,

Captain

Hi Captain

Rabbeinu??

1) I'm not arguing with either the brisker Rov, Reb Chaim or the Chofetz Chaim. But I've learned the rambam a few times both myself and with others and the catechism just isn't true. Do you have a mekor for this?

2&3) Reread Shaa'r habitochon. i don't recall exactly where but he has a throwaway line that, "this refers to someone that has worked through all the ten stages etc." his is referring to the yochid. The seforno - I dont know that sefer, but Rav Dessler cites the version and understanding I have given (somewhere in the RH pieces, MME book 2) . Sefer Hacinuch - I agree this is hard to give my reading to. I struggle with it. Meiri is an ultra-rationalist in the extreme Maimonidean path. Not sure that one piece would disprove that (I haven't looked it up yet)

4) Agreed!

5) But choose to ignore it? he explicitly deals with several of the gemoros you cite (see Moreh, i think 3:40 or thereabouts, where he takes a different path)

6) yedias Hashem (decided by Hashem) is a interesting one. It doesn't mean Hashem intervenes neccessarily.

Fun learning - thank you.

==========

Re: eitzos for emunah and bitachon
Posted by Captain - 07 Dec 2022 03:35

_____

Bego wrote:

Hi Captain

Rabbeinu??

As I mentioned, I have a lot of respect for your work here. And anyway, I think anyone willing to learn the Rishonim on his own instead of being spoonfed or assuming what everyone told him deserves to be called Rabbeinu. Am I right?

1) I'm not arguing with either the brisker Rov, Reb Chaim or the Chofetz Chaim. But I've learned the rambam a few times both myself and with others and the catechism just isn't true. Do you have a mekor for this?

i'll try to find it later.

It definitely is very peculiar. I will try to think about it later

2&3) Reread Shaa'r habitochon. i don't recall exactly where but he has a throwaway line that, "this refers to someone that has worked through all the ten stages etc." his is referring to the yochid.

I've read it a few times. Don't remember this line. If you remember where it is, please let me know.

. The seforno - I dont know that sefer, but Rav Dessler cites the version and understanding I have given (somewhere in the RH pieces, MME book 2).

I found the pieces you mentioned. I referenced them before. This sefer is hard to find, but the piece is quoted in its entirety in a sefer I have. If you have an anonymous email address, pm it to me and I can send it to you.

. Sefer Hacinuch - I agree this is hard to give my reading to. I struggle with it.

Rishonim do argue much more often than we think, and it's okay if you feel that most Rishonim hold one way and he doesn't fit with them.

. Meiri is an ultra-rationalist in the extreme Maimonidean path. Not sure that one piece would disprove that (I haven't looked it up yet)

Sure. We can discuss further after you see it.

4) Agreed!

It's a pleasure to finally find someone who embraces this path who isn't a tremendous posek. (Please forgive me if you are one for assuming that you are not.)

5) But choose to ignore it? he explicitly deals with several of the gemoros you cite (see Moreh, i think 3:40 or thereabouts, where he takes a different path)

I will have to look into this more later. All I remember was that he holds that free will cannot be encroached on, and Hashem wouldn't interrupt it. (Which is a somewhat-related but new topic. We should discuss that one next. I think there we'll be in agreement that it's a huge machlokes rishonim.) Could you prepare me a full list of relevant Rambams, and I will try to go through them when I get a chance?

6) yedias Hashem (decided by Hashem) is a interesting one. It doesn't mean Hashem intervenes neccessarily.

Definitely true.

The jist of the two Rambans I keep referring to:

Bereshis 19:8 – About the people by Pilegesh Begivah (both sides). ???? ??? ?' ?? ????? ???? ?????? ??????. And yet ????? ????? ?"? ????? ??? ????? ????? ???? ???? ???? ??? ????? ????. Doesn't seem so random for “?????? ??????”, does it

Bamidbar 11:19 – When the people complained and asked for meat, and Moshe asked Hashem how he could provide them with enough meat. It's kedai to see the entire piece inside, but here's from near the end: ??' ????? ?? ??? ?? ?' ???? ??? ??? ????? ?? ???? ??????. ??? ??? "????? ???? ?? ??". Hashem says I can give them the meat they requested even “bederech mikrim.” And that's the meaning of the actual posuk “hayikrecha.” “mikreh” in the Ramban and even in the posuk still meant that Hashem was controlling and doing it.

Fun learning - thank you

Same here! Thank you!

==========

Re: eitzos for emunah and bitachon

Posted by i-man - 07 Dec 2022 08:16

_____

Lol between this and the Ibn Ezra thread ,Gye having Yarcheikallah vibes today.

==========

Re: eitzos for emunah and bitachon
Posted by baaltshuvah5782@gmail.com - 21 May 2023 03:51

_____

i would suggest ??? ?? ??? from the baal shem tov.

www.sefaria.org/Keter_Shem_Tov.1.1.1?lang=bi

hebrewbooks.org/16081

with explanation

store.kehotonline.com/prodinfo.asp?number=HBS-KESSMM1

or tanya

==========