

Doctor's orders

Posted by Benoni - 07 Feb 2021 05:43

Can someone please explain to me why usually when it comes to halacha, we will follow the general consensus of modern medicine and science, but when it comes to zera levatala, we do not heed this? Most modern doctors nowadays agree that masturbation for men lowers prostate cancer and reduces stress. It also can help men to sleep better. In fact many of them actually recommend masturbation for young men who are not currently sexually active because they still need the release. If this is the modern medical concensus, why do we not follow this?

Just curious

=====

Re: Doctor's orders

Posted by Hakolhevel - 07 Feb 2021 06:01

Reduces stress. It's not helping anyone who is on this site.

=====

Re: Doctor's orders

Posted by Benoni - 07 Feb 2021 06:06

Maskim, BUT, that might be bc of the intense guilt that they get afterwards due to all the poskim saying it's mamish murder. (IM NOT SPEAKING FOR EVERYONE ON THIS, but it's kinda the general vibe I get from most of these users)

=====

Re: Doctor's orders

Posted by Sapy - 07 Feb 2021 06:17

There are alot of stuff that can help reduce stress that are not kosher, and we dont do it, how about eating something not kosher to feel better etc. Or drinking yayin nesech to sleep better? In order to be oiver on haloches there are guidelines like pikuach nefesh, etc.

Additionally we believe that hashem is the one who heals us, and makes us feel better, but he told us to see a doctor and follow their advice, but that is only hishtadlus, and hashem is the one who actually heals us. There is no such thing as hishtadlus if it is not permitted, treif etc so it's clear that doing it wont really help us.

=====

Re: Doctor's orders

Posted by Benoni - 07 Feb 2021 06:25

Thank you. That mostly makes sense. I'm just confused on the difference of this vs. for example taking medication (per dr's orders) on shabbos even tho the halacha is generally not to take meds?

=====

Re: Doctor's orders

Posted by wilnevergiveup - 07 Feb 2021 08:22

For an excellent discussion on this topic, take a look at the book "Dangerous

Disease & Dangerous Therapy" by Rabbi Dr. Akiva Tatz, he discusses every aspect thoroughly.

While there is a hashkafic argument to this as well (Torah being the ultimate truth and modern science needing to fit with the Torah and not vice versa) the halachic argument is basically (it is quite complicated) that we can only overrule the Torah when there is a danger to ones life. In addition, the danger has to be present (and possibly it's enough for there to be a strong likelihood although I don't remember what the percentages have to be for this). It doesn't have to be life threatening now, but it has to be that something is present that can lead to something life threatening.

As far as medication is concerned, in general, issues such as animal fat in a capsule can be overridden with things like *shelo b'derech achila* etc. and it should be noted that most Rabanim say that it's best to look for a kosher option if you can.

Shabbos has it's own considerations where we allow preventative medicine in certain instances because it is not considered *refuah* and we allow taking medications because the illness is present.

This is a broad subject and I am not a Rav.

As far as your original question, I think you have to really ask yourself if it is even possible to masturbate without it being rooted in lust. If the answer is that it is indeed rooted in lust (the other option being that you masturbate without thinking about any woman if it's even possible) then I think we can all attest that even without the guilt feeling of the Torah, the guilt of cheating on our wives still exists. In addition, lust in general makes marriage as well as waiting to get married very stressful.

Listen, we all did it, and I think the chevra here in general feel that abstaining has increased their happiness and satisfaction in life, not to mention their marriages.

Correct me if I am wrong but I feel that asking the question is looking for a justification more than anything else. So to this I say, if you really really want, try it and see for yourself. Ask around, chat with the *choshuve chevra* here, we all can attest to the same thing, chasing after lust has zero stress relief components.

Try exercise, you can even ask your Doctor, I don't think he will protest. Try helping someone who is in need or even your wife or mother. There are many, but these are actual proven to relieve stress.

As far as prostate cancer is concerned, in order to violate the Torah, it would have to be that there is an actual risk to life (even if it's a small one) currently present. I don't remember all the details but a risk is not enough.

I hope this helps, I would be happy to clarify further if you have any more question.

All the best,

Wilnevergiveup

=====

Re: Doctor's orders

Posted by Benoni - 07 Feb 2021 08:34

Thank you willnevergiveup. I'll look into the book. Also c"v I wasn't asking for a heter to masturbate. I was really just genuinely curious ab the halacha of all this. Plus I feel that once I truly understand the etzem of this halacha, it will give me so much more motivation to fulfill it. I actually agree that when I abstain I have much closer keshet with Hashem and quality of life improves. Also not married so can't speak on that, but I do admit that masturbation is pretty much only derived from lust in my case. Again thanks!

=====

Re: Doctor's orders

Posted by wilnevergiveup - 07 Feb 2021 12:16

[Benoni wrote on 07 Feb 2021 08:34:](#)

Thank you willnevergiveup. I'll look into the book. Also c"v I wasn't asking for a heter to masturbate. I was really just genuinely curious ab the halacha of all this. Plus I feel that once I truly understand the etzem of this halacha, it will give me so much more motivation to fulfill it. I actually agree that when I abstain I have much closer keshet with Hashem and quality of life improves. Also not married so can't speak on that, but I do admit that masturbation is pretty much only derived from lust in my case. Again thanks!

Awesome!

=====

Re: Doctor's orders

Posted by Markz - 07 Feb 2021 13:24

[Benoni wrote on 07 Feb 2021 05:43:](#)

Can someone please explain to me why usually when it comes to halacha, we will follow the general consensus of modern medicine and science, but when it comes to zera levatala, we do not heed this? Most modern doctors nowadays agree that masturbation for men lowers prostate cancer and reduces stress. It also can help men to sleep better. In fact many of them actually recommend masturbation for young men who are not currently sexually active because they still need the release. If this is the modern medical concensus, why do we not follow this?

Google is not the United Medical General Assembly. Is Dr Fauci and others in with this consensus?

And then don't forget - the non Jewish culture currently espouses and legalized other unnatural realities such as drugs and samesex 'marriage', so I wouldn't take everything they say so seriously. Yes such things could fuel the religious community not to respect "medical opinion" regarding Masks etc, but as you see the warning on top of this thread, we can't debate

[Benoni wrote on 07 Feb 2021 06:06:](#)

Maskim, BUT, that might be bc of the intense guilt that they get afterwards due to all the poskim saying it's mamish murder. (IM NOT SPEAKING FOR EVERYONE ON THIS, but it's kinda the general vibe I get from most of these users)

Not the vibe I get and not by me either.

Yes I have guilt after, but not to do with murder, rather a natural reaction of sadness, failing to be in control etc. and I assume that applies to many on gye and offsite too.

Did I answer your question?

=====
=====

Re: Doctor's orders

Posted by Shmuel - 07 Feb 2021 13:26

[Benoni wrote on 07 Feb 2021 05:43:](#)

Can someone please explain to me why usually when it comes to halacha, we will follow the general consensus of modern medicine and science, but when it comes to zera levatala, we do not heed this? Most modern doctors nowadays agree that masturbation for men lowers prostate cancer and reduces stress. It also can help men to sleep better. In fact many of them actually recommend masturbation for young men who are not currently sexually active because they still need the release. If this is the modern medical concensus, why do we not follow this?

Just curious

Are you able to share where you are getting this information from?

Did your doctor recommend this to you?

Is this actually what doctors are saying or is it just "common knowledge"?

I wonder if you asked your physician would he agree that masturbation actually has enough health benefits on the same level as taking antibiotics that it should affect your observance of halacha??

=====
=====

Re: Doctor's orders

Posted by Hakolhevel - 07 Feb 2021 13:39

I also want to add, maybe some doctors speak of some medical benefits, but many phycologists (and relationship experts) are against.

Look up phillip zimbarado on the demise of guys for example. Although he is mainly talking about masturbation with porn.

=====

=====

Re: Doctor's orders

Posted by Benoni - 07 Feb 2021 15:07

Thanks everyone for all the replies. Again sorry I wasn't clear enough: was not necessarily look for a loophole in halacha to masturbate but rather wanted to put into perspective against other halachos I knew about. As far as where I got my sources, so my mother's actually a pediatrician (obv not religious yet) and besides for that a lot of medical websites I have seen but yeah I know that basically every viewpoint on everything will be represented on the internet so u could prob find an article to support every wild claim out there.

=====

=====

Re: Doctor's orders

Posted by Benoni - 07 Feb 2021 15:26

Ok I don't want to stray too far from limudei kodesh in this forum but I feel it's worth mentioning regarding the internet: it's possible many drs justify zera levatala bc it's the popular opinion and that's what their patients want to hear

But more so because deep down they know it's wrong and they're trying to use any bit of shtickle evidence they can get to justify doing it themselves

Hope this makes any sense lol

=====

=====

Re: Doctor's orders

Posted by DavidT - 07 Feb 2021 15:32

???? ???? ????"? . ??? ???? . ?????? ???? . ??? ?????? . ????? ??

???? ??? ??? ?? ????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ??? ?????? ?????? ?????? ??? ?????? ?????? ?????? ???
????? ?????? ??????? ?? ??? ?????? ?????? ?? ?????? ??????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ??? ?????? ?????
????? ?? ?????? ?????? ??????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????
?????? ??? ?????? ??????? ??????? ?????? ??? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????
?????? ?????? ?????? ???????

=====

=====

Re: Doctor's orders
Posted by Markz - 07 Feb 2021 15:42

[DavidT wrote on 07 Feb 2021 15:32:](#)

???? ????? "?? . ??? ????? . ?????? ????? . ??? ?????? . ????? ??

???? ??? ??? ?? ????? ?????? ?????? ??????? ??? ?????? ?????? ?????? ??? ?????? ?????? ?????? ???
????? ?????? ??????? ?? ??? ?????? ?????? ?? ?????? ??????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ??? ?????? ?????
????? ?? ?????? ?????? ??????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????
?????? ??? ?????? ??????? ?????? ?????? ??? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????
?????? ?????? ?????? ???????

I know this is the Beis Medrash forum, but you forgot to mention an important point.

You're quoting the words of one of the most famous doctors!

=====

=====