

Masechtes Music

Posted by UTS - 14 Jul 2009 19:42

---

Disclaimer:

The following should be discussed with an insightful rov if applicable.

-----

What brought me to write this is that someone, I believe, wrote that the Three Weeks are driving him crazy and he may do something seriously wrong.

I think that the issur of "music" has to be understood and the halochically permissible therapeutic uses of it understood and taken into account more than they are.

I am quite convinced that if the Three Weeks causes atzvus, the halochos that deal with those things that cause it, mainly music, should be limited or ignored. The inyan is aveilus not atzvus. ...One compromise is to allow one who is feels this way to listen via headphones, which does not cause as much simcha as with speakers.

Serious aveiros aside, again the inyan is aveilus, not atzvus. If anyone is overly depressed, or maybe at all depressed, as compared to sad, I don't see the big problem if he keeps in mind various things. Things such as alternatives, using only headphones, what type of music.

It is better to ask a rov, but as with eating on a ta'anis, only a person himself knows his own tza'ar and should not fool himself, one way or the other. If the purpose is just to keep one from becoming angry or other therapeutic reasons, same thing.

The best thing would be to be able to consult someone who knows the halochos, understands

music and psychology. We must do our best in the absence of such individuals. There are still great people among us who can guide us.

=====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus  
Posted by UTS - 22 Jul 2009 20:48

---

[chl wrote on 22 Jul 2009 07:57:](#)

bs"d

Hi Kutan,

wow, this is an amazing likut of information. If anyone is interested, i also have 50+ pages worth of word-docs concerning these halachos and their practical applications.

I also would like to add something personal:

similar to what i wrote in a post to tRyInG, it is one thing to study the information you have presented us. That is very important.

The other thing is to have a rov (or rebbetzen) (that one can really trust. As i wrote "trying" one can get burned. What if f.ex. in the story of "Today is the first day" the bochur has a rosh yeshiva who does not understand him. or even worse who pushes him down?!?).

A rov/rebbetzen who really understands me can help make sense between any information i learn in a sefer and my life.

It is easy to make wrong decisions (for oneself, or others depending on oneself). If i would have just stayed with that information concerning music, i would have decided not to practice, perform or teach music. After all is said and done it seems to be the lechatchila, until the Bays HaMikdash is built again (bimhera veyamenu. i am still davening that from now on Tisha b'av will be a Yom Tov! :D).

But HaShem made me meet different Rabbis, from Meah Shearim to community rabbis in the US; all encouraging music and music performance (concerts). If anyone is interested i am happy to share details in private, but i don't want to give myself away here.

Some of what they said seems to go against what i had learned... but those rebbeim in their mentshlichkayt, in their experience with people, i guess in their wisdom were able to make decisions that are needed in our times, for certain parts of (maybe even the majority) of the Jewish people today. I seriously doubt that anybody would deny that people like R'Shloime Carlebach, or even Matisyahu were/are making a big Kiddush Hashem, bringing Jews closer to Yiddishkayt, and shining light even into the goyishe world. I am not a fan of Matisyahu's music, but i once met an African American who loved Matisyahu's message. And he told me that in the middle of a street in NYC, just because i was dressed hassidish, and he assumed i was into Matisyahu's music.

I hope this was helpful...

a gut choidesh to all of you, and all of am yisrael

Rabbonim preferably at least, should have (a lot of) seichel hayoshor --- especially for things like these. As the saying goes, Shulchan Oruch really has 5 parts.....

=====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus  
Posted by UTS - 22 Jul 2009 20:53

---

[chl wrote on 22 Jul 2009 18:38:](#)

bs"d

here is a list of mekoros:

[koltorah.org/ravj/13-32%20Jewish%20Perspectives%20on%20Music.htm](http://koltorah.org/ravj/13-32%20Jewish%20Perspectives%20on%20Music.htm)

Yasher koach. A gutten chodesh to you and all.

=====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus  
Posted by chl - 23 Jul 2009 06:20

---

bs"d

[dov wrote on 22 Jul 2009 19:22:](#)

Hey, chevra - by the time we are all done figuring out what to do about music, atzvus r"l, and the three weeks...the three weeks will be all over! ;D

Maybe it'll finally be /ess than three weeks, this time....

:D

=====

=====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus  
Posted by kutan - 27 Jul 2009 19:54

---

Esnachtoh,

Hope to have mera mekomos by tomorrow.

Sorry for the delay

Its Cute that you are so interested... fits with you name :D :D :D

kutan

=====

=====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus  
Posted by kutan - 28 Jul 2009 21:36

---

here are some mereh mekomos on the subject:

Mareh mekomos:

concerts are a no-no: Ig"m YD 2 #137, az nidbaru vol 7 no 64,see also igrm oc vol 1 end of 166)

to create a beat for working: gm sotah 48a, yechave daas vol 1 no. 45

to heal melencholy is OK: mishne halachos vol 6 no 106. see also tsh' az nidberu vol 8 no 58.

Purim, chol hamoed, even a seudas siyum is considered l'tzorech mitva: Ig'm OC 1 end of siman 166, also see yechave das (ibid)

Ok to be maikel like the rama? : see ig'm vol 3 siman 87 and tzitz eliezer vol 15 no. 33).

for parnasa is mutar: igr'm (???), tzit eliezer (ibid) see also shvet levi vol 6 no. 69

tape recorded music is like regular music: igrm and titz eliezer (not sure which igrm) and az nidbaru (ibid) and Shevet halaeivi (ibid)

However, Chelkas Yakov (siman 62) **is** maikel, as a 'snif' and 'limud zchus' for the minhad haolum. also heard this from R' Pam, that canned music is not as enjoyable as live music, and is not technically in the gezaira.

=====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus  
Posted by Pintele Yid - 29 Jul 2009 16:21

---

Heiliga Kutan,

Yasher Koach!

Pintele Yid

=====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus

Posted by kutan - 29 Jul 2009 16:51

---

[Pintele Yid wrote on 29 Jul 2009 16:21:](#)

Heiliga Kutan,

Yasher Koach!

Pintele Yid

Maybe, one day. Meanwhile I'm enjoying being a kutan.

Thanks pintele yid.

=====

Re: Masechtes Music

Posted by bardichev - 03 Aug 2009 03:17

~~Du bist nisht a Kutan. Der Kutan iz shoin a Gadol~~

HEY BUDDIES THE 3 WEEKS ARE OVER!!!

IT'S ALMOST TIME TO TAKE OUT MY SUKKAH!!

b

[/quote]

Yeah, but people posted a lot of interesting things about the halochos of music etc., so I am not removing this topic yet. I would like to help keep this forumn as small as reasonably possible, so if the olam thinks this topic should be removed, I have no problem. However, if you want to keep it, fine.

=====

=====