Masechtes Music
Posted by UTS - 14 Jul 2009 19:42

_____

Disclaimer:

The following should be discussed with an insightful rov if applicable.

---

What brought me to write this is that someone, I believe, wrote that the Three Weeks are driving him crazy and he may do something seriously wrong.

I think that the issur of "music" has to be understood and the halochically permissible therapeutic uses of it understood and taken into account more than they are.

I am quite convinced that if the Three Weeks causes atzvus, the halochos that deal with those things that cause it, mainly music, should be limited or ignored. The inyan is aveilus not atzvus. ...One compromise is to allow one who is feels this way to listen via headphones, which does not cause as much simcha as with speakers.

Serious aveiros aside, again the inyan is aveilus, not atzvus. If anyone is overly depressed, or maybe at all depressed, as compared to sad, I don't see the big problem if he keeps in mind various things. Things such as alternatives, using only headphones, what type of music.

It is better to ask a rov, but as with eating on a ta'anis, only a person himself knows his own tza'ar and should not fool himself, one way or the other. If the purpose is just to keep one from becoming angry or other therapeutic reasons, same thing.

The best thing would be to be able to consult someone who knows the halochos, understands

music and psychology. We must do our best in the absence of such individuals. There are still great people among us who can guide us.

==========

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by TrYiNg - 20 Jul 2009 04:33

_____

What about that recorded music isn't really considered music ? Aren't there poskim that say that music that is ossur , meant live music?

I know it's not L'chatchila but this i what usually makes me be meiikel in this regard. Is it wrong? (We are very meikil bchlal with this , we listen Friday and motzei shabbos regularly bec of shabbos and every day if you feel you need it. I think it's bec reason I just stated.)

Just today I was listening to music, and I was trying to figure out what's better. I was traveling a long way and listening to music inspired me and brought me closer to hashem. If the churban happened bec. of our severing our connection with him, being baatsvus won't help , but trying to form a kesher with hkbh, will.

Am I making sense or just rationalizing? "

_____

Reply: from Esnachtoh

Sorry, I think that I deleted the quote mark by mistake. Anyway....

I think that you are basically or completly right. However, Yiddin ask these questions to a qualified Poisek. If you don't know anyone, maybe you could ask Rav Zev Leff shlitoh. BTW, I think he said something about using music when driving so as to remain alert or awake !!! (That

was not your reason of course, but may be related.)  And using music for other ulterior  reasons. This was for the Sfirah. I have heard him speak about these things.

Personally, I asked these questions a few times and heard things many years ago, for myself. But I am not quoting Rabbi  Leff and what I was told was for me only. Maybe Reb Guard shlitoh would be willing to answer or present the question to someone.

Since I started this thread, for the reasons that I stated at the beginning, (and for better or for worse) ---- not to have a halochik discussion here, I felt that I should  offer some kind of reply. All the best.

Here is a shiur by Rabbi Leff on the Three Weeks.

www.rabbileff.net/shiurim/moadim/tishabav/halachos/halachos_of_3_weeks-5769.mp3

The Nine Days.

www.rabbileff.net/shiurim/moadim/tishabav/halachos/halachos_of_9_days-5769.mp3

==========

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by TrYiNg - 21 Jul 2009 04:32

_____

Thank you. Will check it out.

==========

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by UTS - 21 Jul 2009 06:29

_____

Efshar Letaken wrote on 14 Jul 2009 20:40**:**

Esnachto,

I was driving back from the Mountains the other day when this thought poped into my head & you might have a point there of cores as you said "ask your Local Rov!

But then I took it a step further.

Yes! Music lifts the spirit, but if we really want to lift are spirit we can get there with being close to Hashem, which can be done in many ways.

Studying Torah, Praying with Kavono, Brachos with Kavono, Guarding your Eyes & anytime we overcome the Y"H Ahhhh Gevald does that feel good. Looking at Hashems creations, the mountains, The Sky on a nice day, Flowers, Chirping Birds just to mention a few.

We can be uplifted in so many ways and not be B'Atsvus!

Believe me I'm a Music Addict (one more addiction to work on, lol) and used to give myself this heter, but I decided to try to be happy & uplifted in other ways so that I'm not B'Atsvus & at the same time really feel the loss of are Holy Beis Hamikdash every time I want my Music (and I want it a lot) I get to think of why I can't have it & what we are missing so when I say V'Yerushaliam Ercha B'Rachmim Toshuv I really mean it & hopefully if we show Hashem that we want it back we will get it back very soon.

I Hope I can do it! I'm sure I can! I just have to take things more serious & not try to find a way out of everything.

That said, I'm sure that if it is the Music that will stop you from A Fall then there's no question that the Music is a Tofel & the Aveirah is a Ikar & let the Music Blast!

Okay, you seem to think that music is not a way to get closer to Hashem. Does it not say somewhere that heichal haneginoh is next to heichal hatshuvoh? ;D

==========

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by bardichev - 21 Jul 2009 20:29

_____

I UPDATED MY PICTURE

==========

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by Dov - 21 Jul 2009 20:36

_____

bardichev wrote on 21 Jul 2009 20:29**:**

I UPDATED MY PICTURE

berdichever - I respect your decision and your bechira chofshis in this matter, as in anything else. But - why'd ya do it!!!??? The old one had some panache (whatever that is) that this one, well...oh, yeah, the three weeks...never mind.

You are sweeter than Equal!

Dov

==========

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by bardichev - 21 Jul 2009 21:40

_____

THE PICTURE MOVES ME

I WISH I CAN BE THAT BOY AT THE KOSEL

AND CRY CRY CRY

WE NEED MOSHIACH MORE THAN EVER

HASHEM HAVE MERCY ON US

LOOK AT THIS FORUM

IT IS ATRUE KIBBUTZ GALIYOS

EVERY CONTINENT EVERY TRIBE OF JUDAISM

FIGHTING SURRENDERING WHATEVER

ONE COMMON GOAL

WE SEEK YOUR CLOSENESS!!!

SOMEDAY WE WILL ALL BE TOGETHER

SOMEDAY WE WIL BE SHELTERED AND WARM

NWVER WILL WE HAVE TO EZPECT ANY FEAR

OUR SCARS AND OUR WOUNDS WILL DISAPPEAR!!!!!

bardichev

==========

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by Efshar Letaken - 21 Jul 2009 21:45

_____

I hope you don't mind but I will follow in the bardichevers foot steps & change my Picture for the nine days as well.

This is the most amazing picture I ever saw from the Kosel.

It is the Back Drop of my 34"  Desktop Screen.

E.L.

P.S.

it's a bit to small over here but you can see it clearly over here www.flickr.com/photos/95266315@N00/1549007370/ or here icons-pe.wunderground.com/data/wximagenew/w/Weather89/17.jpg

==========

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by kutan - 21 Jul 2009 22:04

_____

Hi everyone... This post should probably be in the B'M....

When I was young and innocent with much more free time to use constructively, I looked into the music 'shaila' and can report the following: (this is for the whole year, because of zecher lchurban, not for the 3 weeks)

1) music is mutar for a 'workout' or to create a rhythm during working (its an open Gemara, pretty much)

2) it is mutar for uplifting the spirits in a therapeutic way. R' Pam was very firm on this, not to be machmir for those that need it to relieve stress. R' Chaim Pinchas Scheinberg rules our entire generation needs it, and we should not be machmir on recorded music for the general public. period. If he is your posek, you can pretty much skip to the end and just read about the concert issue. :D

3) the Rama is follows the most meikel opinion in the rishonim, and assurs music only if it is with wine (pasuk: b'shir lo sishteh yayin) or if it is bikveeyus, such as awaking/going to sleep every day to music (based on a story in the Gemara), which is considered hanaah yesayra and is like with wine.

The mishna brura (based on the achronim) seems to be machmir and assure all music (except l'tzhorch mitzva such as chasuna, sheva brachos, other seudas mitzva, chol hamoed, etc)! R'

Moshe follows the middle opinion in the rishonim, permitting vocal music (except in the cases like with wine) and assuring instrumental (except if it is for mitzva).

But the minhag haolum is like the Rama.

Regarding 'canned' music, most (all?) tshuvos are machmir that it has a din like music. The reason is the lashon of the shulchan aruch, that mentions some instruments and then adds: "v'chol mashmi'ai kol shel shir", which, as one t'shuva wrote, effectively closes the door. (there was one tshuva who considered acapella recordings to be instrumental... since it came out of a machine!)

The real problem then is the k'veeyus... to listen on a constant basis would seem to need to come onto R' Chaim Pinchus Scheinberg's heter.

Another concern is concerts... many teshuvos write that coming together collectively to listen to a concert is hanaha yesayra and is as much like 'with wine' as k'veeyus is, and would not be muter (except on chol hamoad etc where there is simchas YT.. assuming it is a really kosher concert...). They also say that if the concert raises funds for tzedaka, it is still not considered l'tzorech mitzva, since the actual music is not.

==========

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by chl - 22 Jul 2009 07:57

_____

bs"d

Hi Kutan,

wow, this is an amazing likut of information. If anyone is interested, i also have 50+ pages worth of word-docs concerning these halachos and their practical applications.

I also would like to add something personal:

similar to  what i wrote in a post to tRyInG, it is one thing to study the information you have presented us. That is very important.

The other thing is to have a rov (or rebbetzen) (that one can really trust. As i wrote "trying" one can get burned. What if f.ex. in the story of "Today is the first day" the bochur has a rosh yeshiva who does not understand him. or even worse who pushes him down?!?).

A rov/rebbetzen who really understands me can help make sense between any information i learn in a sefer and my life.

It is easy to make wrong decisions (for oneself, or others depending on oneself). If i would have just stayed with that information concerning music, i would have decided not to practice, perform or teach music. After all is said and done it seems to be the lechatchila, until the Bays HaMikdash is built again (bimhera veyamenu. i am still davening that from now on Tisha b'av will be a Yom Tov!  :D).

But HaShem made me meet different Rabbis, from Meah Shearim to community rabbis in the US; all encouraging music and music performance (concerts). If anyone is interested i am happy to share details in private, but i don't want to give myself away here.

Some of what they said seems to go against what i had learned... but those rebbeim in their mentshlichkayt, in their experience with people, i guess in their wisdom were able to make decisions that are needed in our times, for certain parts of (maybe even the majority) of the Jewish people today. I seriously doubt that anybody would deny that people like R'Shloime Carlebach, or even Matisyahu were/are making a big Kiddush Hashem, bringing Jews closer to Yiddishkayt, and shining light even into the goyishe world. I am not a fan of Matisyahu's music, but i once met an African American who loved Matisyahu's message. And he told me that in the middle of a street in NYC, just because i was dressed hassidish, and he assumed i was into Matisyahu's music.

I hope this was helpful...

a gut choidesh to all of you, and all of am yisrael

==========

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by TrYiNg - 22 Jul 2009 10:04
_____

==========

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by kutan - 22 Jul 2009 14:02
_____

chl wrote on 22 Jul 2009 07:57**:**

E-l- bs"d tis a beautiful pic! I downloaded it and put it as my desktop picture too. Thanks

Hi Kutan,

wow, this is an amazing likut of information. If anyone is interested, i also have 50+ pages worth of word-docs concerning these halachos and their practical applications.

I also would like to add something personal:

similar to  what i wrote in a post to tRyInG, it is one thing to study the information you have presented us. That is very important.

The other thing is to have a rov (or rebbetzen) (that one can really trust. As i wrote "trying" one can get burned. What if f.ex. in the story of "Today is the first day" the bochur has a rosh yeshiva who does not understand him. or even worse who pushes him down?!?).

A rov/rebbetzen who really understands me can help make sense between any information i learn in a sefer and my life.

It is easy to make wrong decisions (for oneself, or others depending on oneself). If i would have just stayed with that information concerning music, i would have decided not to practice, perform or teach music. After all is said and done it seems to be the lechatchila, until the Bays HaMikdash is built again (bimhera veyamenu. i am still davening that from now on Tisha b'av will be a Yom Tov!  :D).

But HaShem made me meet different Rabbis, from Meah Shearim to community rabbis in the US; all encouraging music and music performance (concerts). If anyone is interested i am happy to share details in private, but i don't want to give myself away here.

Some of what they said seems to go against what i had learned... but those rebbeim in their mentshlichkayt, in their experience with people, i guess in their wisdom were able to make decisions that are needed in our times, for certain parts of (maybe even the majority) of the Jewish people today. I seriously doubt that anybody would deny that people like R'Shloime Carlebach, or even Matisyahu were/are making a big Kiddush Hashem, bringing Jews closer to Yiddishkayt, and shining light even into the goyishe world. I am not a fan of Matisyahu's music, but i once met an African American who loved Matisyahu's message. And he told me that in the middle of a street in NYC, just because i was dressed hassidish, and he assumed i was into Matisyahu's music.

I hope this was helpful...

a gut choidesh to all of you, and all of am yisrael

chl,

You are absolutely right. Especially on music, where it is not the music itself that is the prohibition, but the concept of excessive enjoyment that shows the lack of zecher lchurban, there is much room for leeway by a personal Rav. I'm glad you added it, as the post is missing without this point.

kutan

==========

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by chl - 22 Jul 2009 15:10

_____

kutan shel hachabura wrote on 22 Jul 2009 14:02**:**

Especially on music, where it is not the music itself that is the prohibition, but the concept of excessive enjoyment that shows the lack of zecher lchurban, there is much room for leeway by a personal Rav.

very well put! i see that you, as 7up, have a gift for words... whereas i need to ramble to make :D

==========

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by UTS - 22 Jul 2009 18:19

_____

kutan shel hachabura wrote on 21 Jul 2009 22:04**:**

Hi everyone... This post should probably be in the B'M....

When I was young and innocent with much more free time to use constructively, I looked into

the music 'shaila' and can report the following: (this is for the whole year, because of zecher lchurban, not for the 3 weeks)

1) music is mutar for a 'workout' or to create a rhythm during working (its an open Gemara, pretty much)

2) it is mutar for uplifting the spirits in a therapeutic way. R' Pam was very firm on this, not to be machmir for those that need it to relieve stress. R' Chaim Pinchas Scheinberg rules our entire generation needs it, and we should not be machmir on recorded music for the general public. period. If he is your posek, you can pretty much skip to the end and just read about the concert issue. :D

3) the Rama is follows the most meikel opinion in the rishonim, and assurs music only if it is with wine (pasuk: b'shir lo sishteh yayin) or if it is bikveeyus, such as awaking/going to sleep every day to music (based on a story in the Gemara), which is considered hanaah yesayra and is like with wine.

The mishna brura (based on the achronim) seems to be machmir and assure all music (except l'tzhorch mitzva such as chasuna, sheva brachos, other seudas mitzva, chol hamoed, etc)! R' Moshe follows the middle opinion in the rishonim, permitting vocal music (except in the cases like with wine) and assuring instrumental (except if it is for mitzva).

But the minhag haolum is like the Rama.

Regarding 'canned' music, most (all?) tshuvos are machmir that it has a din like music. The reason is the lashon of the shulchan aruch, that mentions some instruments and then adds: "v'chol mashmi'ai kol shel shir", which, as one t'shuva wrote, effectively closes the door. (there was one tshuva who considered acapella recordings to be instrumental... since it came out of a machine!)

The real problem then is the k'veeyus... to listen on a constant basis would seem to need to come onto R' Chaim Pinchus Scheinberg's heter.

Another concern is concerts... many teshuvos write that coming together collectively to listen to a concert is hanaha yesayra and is as much like 'with wine' as k'veeyus is, and would not be muter (except on chol hamoad etc where there is simchas YT.. assuming it is a really kosher concert...). They also say that if the concert raises funds for tzedaka, it is still not considered l'tzorech mitzva, since the actual music is not.

I hope to copy this message and then open up a shulcan aruch and use these notes together. And maybe take it further by looking into acharonim.

Dear Kutan,

If you don't mind, would you write the mekoros of the tshuvos you mentioned so I (we) can see them?

Just one thing to add. A rov once pointed out that there is a difference between live and recorded because the live ***experience*** does not compare to the recorded. I am not sure exactly how much he meant there would be a nafke minoh le'halochoh because of this, but it sounded like a lot. Anyway, he held that there is a difference between recorded and live music.

==========

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by chl - 22 Jul 2009 18:38

_____

bs"d

here is a list of mekoros:

koltorah.org/ravj/13-32%20Jewish%20Perspectives%20on%20Music.htm

==========

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by Dov - 22 Jul 2009 19:22

_____

Hey, chevra - by the time we are all done figuring out what to do about music, atzvus r"l, and the three weeks...the three weeks will be all over! ;D

Maybe it'll finally be *less* than three weeks, this time....

==========