

Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos

Posted by Kedusha - 12 Nov 2010 15:45

---

**Disclaimer: Nothing posted on this thread, or anywhere else on the forum, should be relied upon for Halacha l'Maaseh. As to whether a Sheilah should be asked, see replies # 110 & 112.**

**[Note that the first few pages of this thread relate to an earlier version of this poll. Many of the issues raised have been addressed in the way the question is currently worded].**

What do you say, Chevra? This is a question that has been on my mind for quite some time.

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos

Posted by briut - 18 Nov 2010 15:55

---

Reb K, motek: I'm still not voting because I still don't understand the question.

Once you say it's al pi halacha, I'd say you not only MAY, but you MUST. So there's no question.

But, saying it's al pi halacha requires daas Torah for an individual's circumstances -- what would a loss of sobriety DO; are there LESSER means than a Jew dialing & talking; how LIKELY is it the call would save things; what MENTAL ANGUISH is the situation causing; etc.

So not to trivialize the issue to compare it to Tylenol for a migraine (often a tricky Q), I still say each case is different enough there's not "one" answer to read from a Kitzur S.A. Hence, even here THERE'S NO QUESTION because daas Torah may differ in each case.

Bottom line: There's nothing to poll!

Sorry to keep pushing rabbit season, but I ain't seein' no ducks to hunt.

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos  
Posted by Kedusha - 18 Nov 2010 16:11

---

Assuming that lesser measures wouldn't help, I don't see how someone serious about his recovery would not make the call (of course, if a non-Jew can dial the number, that's obviously the way to go). He doesn't have a choice - if he loses his sobriety, he may never recover (besides for the fact that the aveira from that one fall will be far worse than making a call with a Shinui).

If "Al tehi tzadik harbei" ever had application, it's here.

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos  
Posted by briut - 18 Nov 2010 16:30

---

[Kedusha wrote on 18 Nov 2010 16:11:](#)

[...] the aveira from that one fall will be far worse than making a call with a Shinui). I suppose I'm just ignorant and insensitive to the state of addiction. It still sounds to lil ole' me like, "Rabbi, I'm tired of matzo and really NEED a little rye bread (d'oreisa). Could I have a little kitnios (d'rabbonon) instead?"

Perhaps you can help me learn a little more about the nature of addiction, or at least the nature of yours (isn't each case different?)....

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos

---

Posted by Kedusha - 18 Nov 2010 16:35

---

If Chametz were addictive, your analogy would be appropriate.

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos

Posted by Kedusha - 18 Nov 2010 16:43

---

In other words, we're not talking about giving the Rav an ultimatum - either you permit the lesser aveira or I'll do the worse aveira. The addict is losing control - he's going to do the worse aveira unless he makes that call.

Aveiros aside, maybe the following exercise will help you understand this issue better.

Recite the following with great conviction:

If I lose my sobriety, I'm dead!

If I lose my sobriety, I'm dead!

If I lose my sobriety, I'm dead!

If I lose my sobriety, I'm dead!

If I lose my sobriety, I'm dead!

If I lose my sobriety, I'm dead!

If I lose my sobriety, I'm dead!

If I lose my sobriety, I'm dead!

If I lose my sobriety, I'm dead!

If I lose my sobriety, I'm dead!

=====

====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos  
Posted by jewinpain - 18 Nov 2010 16:45

---

What a lamdunas going on here, I can't keep up with u guys,

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos  
Posted by Yosef Hatzadik - 18 Nov 2010 18:26

---

Why not? You're a big lamdan too!

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos  
Posted by briut - 18 Nov 2010 18:33

---

[Kedusha wrote on 18 Nov 2010 16:43:](#)

maybe the following exercise will help you understand this issue better. Recite the following with great conviction: If I lose my sobriety, I'm dead!  
Please, K, this is really important to me. I'm really trying to understand. I'm sorry to keep flogging this duck to death. But let me see if I've got you right.

1) P\*??

I'm going to assume that even if the issue is p\*, you're not going to flip the switch on the computer over Shabbos. Maybe you've got a stack of Shabbos hiding for a very dark & rainy day. So those "visceral" aveiros like lightswitches and cheeseburgers and the like are probably not at risk. And if I'm wrong, a long walk around the block would keep you even further removed than a phone call from the comfort of that same place housing the .

2) M\*??

So I'll guess that your real sobriety challenge comes with m\*. And there's nothing left to do until Havdalah other than call the sponsor? What could I be considering? I don't know: sit in the Bais Medresh (surely you wouldn't... there!), have your wife handcuff you (BEHIND your back, of course), play cards with some kids, I don't know. But to think that survival for a few hours isn't possible without giving up the mitzvois you say you hold so dear... WOW. Bummer!

I'm not trying to imply that sobriety isn't a very high value, worthy of extraordinary measures. I'm just trying to say that TO MY LIMITED MIND most of those situations could have a short-term solution that's compatible with hilchos Shabbos.

Any chance you could help me to understand the limitations of my mind? I really mean no offense, I really just want to understand, this might be very helpful to me in understanding myself and others. Thanks.

=====  
=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos  
Posted by Kedusha - 18 Nov 2010 18:58

---

Boruch Hashem, personally, I usually don't find Shabbos to be a big problem. I think there are addicts that, even in the throws of their addiction, can stay clean on Shabbos. I also agree that there will often be other eitzos. But not always. I'm addressing a situation where the person WANTS to act out, but knows he's going to regret it, and needs someone to talk him out of it.

=====  
=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos  
Posted by silentbattle - 18 Nov 2010 19:22

---

And there are a lot of people here who seem to have particular trouble staying clean on shabbos.

=====  
=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos

---

Posted by briut - 18 Nov 2010 19:24

---

[Kedusha wrote on 18 Nov 2010 18:58:](#)

Boruch Hashem, personally, I usually don't find Shabbos to be a big problem.  
AHA! SO WE'RE TALKING ABOUT AN INTERESTING PHILOSOPHICAL TOPIC, NOT REALLY ANY KIND OF SHEILAH! Whew! Thank G-d! And I thought for a moment this was even worth trying to understand and discuss.

Or as the potential chosson responded to the girl's father who quizzed him about what to do about a found \$100 bill on Shabbos, on the sidewalk, next to a rock... FIRST SHOW ME THE \$100 BILL. In other words, there may be such an addict out there, but I don't have to break a sweat trying to think of one.

Duck and rabbit both put back on shelf. Called off the dogs. Whew.

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos  
Posted by ur-a-jew - 18 Nov 2010 19:34

---

[Kedusha wrote on 18 Nov 2010 18:58:](#)

I'm addressing a situation where the person WANTS to act out, but knows he's going to regret it, and needs someone to talk him out of it.

So will you pick up?

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos  
Posted by Kedusha - 18 Nov 2010 19:39

---

That's a separate issue. The hypothetical is that he has a non-Jewish sponsor.

=====  
=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos  
Posted by ur-a-jew - 18 Nov 2010 20:58

---

[Kedusha wrote on 18 Nov 2010 19:39:](#)

The hypothetical is that he has a non-Jewish sponsor.

I know and I'm changing the hypothetical.

[Kedusha wrote on 18 Nov 2010 19:39:](#)

That's a separate issue.

Why is it separate issue. If I can call, why can't you answer.

=====  
=====