

Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by Kedusha - 12 Nov 2010 15:45

Disclaimer: Nothing posted on this thread, or anywhere else on the forum, should be relied upon for Halacha l'Maseh. As to whether a Sheilah should be asked, see replies # 110 & 112.

[Note that the first few pages of this thread relate to an earlier version of this poll. Many of the issues raised have been addressed in the way the question is currently worded].

What do you say, Chevra? This is a question that has been on my mind for quite some time.

=====
=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by Dov - 12 Nov 2010 16:13

I voted that it needs to be brought to a posek.

If a guy is not willing to admit the exact nature of his sickness and powerlessness to the rav, then he does not admit it to himself, either. In that case, there is not point to making a call anyway. The game is over.

Asking the rov might be a first step to actually taking his first step.

So I hope he asks.

Ha.

=====
=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by Kedusha - 12 Nov 2010 16:20

I hear.

I decided to modify the poll to remove the option of asking a Posek. My reasoning is that, with a Halachic question like this, that's going to be the default response for most people. However, in the real world, this could come up in a situation where no Posek is available.

I have reset the poll, so, if you voted already, please vote again.

=====
=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by Kedusha - 12 Nov 2010 16:51

Common folks, let's get with the program! This has been read 100 times, with only 2 votes!

=====
=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by Dov - 12 Nov 2010 16:59

I refuse to answer the poll, because the process of asking the posek if calling on Shabbos is mutar ***is recovery itself***, which is *surely* pikuach nefashos.

So there.

=====
=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by Kedusha - 12 Nov 2010 17:11

[dov wrote on 12 Nov 2010 16:59:](#)

I refuse to answer the poll, because the process of asking the posek if calling on Shabbos is mutar ***is recovery itself***, which is *surely* pikuach nefashos.

So there.

Dov, I have modified the question, yet again, to address your concern, so please vote.

For those who have voted already (some of you twice!), my apologies, but I reset the poll, hopefully for the last time. Please vote once again!

=====
=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by Dov - 12 Nov 2010 17:15

If he asked so many poskim, then surely there is at least *one* of them nearby. He needs to walk over to that posek and share with him that he "really wants to look up some schmutz and masturbate right now".

So there.

Nice try.

=====
=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by Kedusha - 12 Nov 2010 17:27

Dov,

I modified the poll, yet again, to allow for your concerns (there is a limit to how long I could make the question, but my intent is that you clearly explained to the Posek what's at stake).

And, yes, I reset the poll yet another time (I'm trying to make it into the Guinness book! ;D). So, if you voted already (up to three times!), please do so again!

=====
=====

I don't know why I'm such a pushover! :

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by Steve - 12 Nov 2010 19:38

Vote for me that NO, I would not use the telephone.

My reason is that I have no right to chose to do one aveira so that I can avoid a different one. And Shabbos is the Mekor Haberacha.

Do I have a right to drive on Shabbos if i felt my ruchniyos life depended on davening with a minyan?

Do i have a right to steal money so I could feed my family who are mamash starving, or to avoid foreclosure on my home?

Do I have a right to kill another person so I could use his organs to save myself?

I would safeguard Shabbos, and beg Hashem to remove my lust urge from me, as I am powerless to do so on my own. If i REALLY place the burden on His shoulders, I firmly believe I will be freed from the urge of the moment. And that phone call to HKB"H I can make on Shabbos, no polls asked.

=====
=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by Kedusha - 12 Nov 2010 19:56

But Steve, put aside the issue of Aveira. If an alcoholic in recovery needed to use the phone to avoid breaking his sobriety, I have no doubt that he would be permitted to do so because, at the very least, you're dealing with a situation of Safek Pikuach Nefashos. Is lust addiction any less potentially lethal?

=====
=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by the.guard - 13 Nov 2010 16:57

Rabbi Twerski once spoke about GYE and said, that although he is not a posek - so he can't pasken, he considers this pikuach nefesh, and he would tell someone to open GYE even on Shabbos if he was about to look at porn on the computer anyway.

But I have a few comments about this.

1) Like he said, he is not a posek, so we can't pasken from this.

2) I don't really see a chidush in this. If the guy was anyway going to be mechalel shabbos and look at porn, why not be mechalel Shabbos and stay sober? Is it only mutar to be mechalel

3) Like I wrote above, it all depends what his "fall" was going to be, in my opinion. If he was about to masturbate without being mechalel Shabbos, it is a big question if he can be mechalel Shabbos to call someone or open GYE on the computer. In this case, it really needs to be brought to a Rav who understands his precise situation. For most people it is not pikuach nefesh. For a real addict, it may be. Only a real posek who understands addiction can pasken such a thing. And I don't know how many there are like that in the world.

=====
=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by Kedusha - 14 Nov 2010 01:42

Disclaimer: This post, and those related to it are intended l'Halacha v'Lo l'Maaseh.

1.) To clarify, the case in question is where the fall will not involve Chillul Shabbos.

2.) The case in question is not simply talking about someone who is about to fall, but someone who is about to lose a good streak of sobriety. Anyone with experience (all of us) know what's at stake here - one fall may lead to dozens, and the person may not be able to pick himself up, at least for the foreseeable future. Even if it's not Pikuach Nefashos (which, for some people, it may be), it should at least be Safek Pikuach Nefashos. And, even if it's definitely not Pikuach Nefashos, we should at least apply the leniencies available to a Choleh Kol Gufo (see next paragraph).

3.) Without getting into details here, using a telephone on Shabbos can be done in a way that it's a Shvus d'Shvus (i.e. 2 steps removed from a Melacha d'Oraysah) according to most Poskim. Therefore, even if we're not dealing with Pikuach Nefesh, this should be no less urgent than treating a Choleh Kol Gufo, where Poskim allow performing a Shvus d'Shvus (see reply #19 below).

=====
=====

====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by kosher - 14 Nov 2010 01:58

Will the chillul shabbos even work??

My feeling is that the potential faller (did I spell that right), is going to feel even worse about himself after his addiction led him to chillul shabbos and crossing another red-line he never dreamed he would have. This will all feed a downward spiral.

As a practical matter, if someone has the sanity to ask the question, the answer has to be that ultimately the tools and mindset to stop this behaviour are available to him and he can't be mechallel shabbos and he should focus on those tools/mindset...

(No-one said it's easy, but we can't be matir chillul shabbos because one is not holding somewhere yet. To be matir is a dangerous approach. Without seforim in front of me, I will mention one potential comparison that comes to mind. Tosfos in meschtas pesachim says, that even though a mumar may not bring a korban pesach he is still considered mechayav to bring a korban pesach, because he is mechuyav to do teshuva and then bring it (no distinction for addict mentioned)).

Feel free to throw tomatoes if you wish

=====
====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by Kedusha - 14 Nov 2010 02:02

The difference is that an addict doesn't have Bechira to simply do Teshuva and stop, as per step one of the 12 steps.

Whether reaching out will help is an open question. But, that's what we tell an addict to do

during the week, so there must be something to it.

=====
=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by kosher - 14 Nov 2010 02:13

[Kedusha wrote on 14 Nov 2010 02:02:](#)

The difference is that an addict doesn't have Bechira to simply do Teshuva and stop, as per step one of the 12 steps.

Whether reaching out will help is an open question. But, that's what we tell an addict to do during the week, so there must be something to it.

Of course reaching out helps!! But not when the price is the negative feelings he will get from having been mechalel shabbos etc.

Even if you accept that the 12 steps are the only way to stop (its another poll somewhere else) and I certainly don't have the expertise to comment either way, then engage in the 12 steps - why make phone calls?

=====
=====