

Reflections About a Year at GUE now GYE

Posted by Holy Yid - 22 Jul 2010 08:09

---

Today is the first anniversary of my joining this site. It truly has been one of the most dramatic years of my life. I have changed in how I look at this struggle, how I look at myself and how I act. I now know that I am not a monster or a terrible person rather I am a normal healthy good Jew who got caught in something I did not know how to deal with. Maybe if I would have had the proper *hadrach* I would not be here but there is another way to look at this. There is a concept in *Chasidus* that Hashem, in His Infinite Wisdom, causes all sins to happen and we, those who sinned *unwillingly* so to speak (this idea is very kabbalistic and Rav Desler warns about not letting Kabbalistic teachings weaken our fear of sin), are supposed to use them as a vehicle (lav davka a truck) to better ourselves. When we use them as a source of motivation to improve ourselves, in that area and in general, we have brought out the good in the sin and the Divine Intention in causing us to sin is revealed. Now that sin is a source of merit for us, for it was an input in our growth, and we are a better person. (**Bards** correct me if I am wrong, I am not the resident expert on Chasidus).

With this thought in mind I can say I have started to reveal the Divine Intention in my years of sinning. They are the groundwork for me to improve as a person and really learn about and live a life of kedusha. I have also had the chance to have a very minor part in spreading the message of the site that is about the of hope, redemption and meaning that is possible. It is possible that my pain and sins were intended to enable me to help others avoid this path and make the world a holier place.

The questions I ask myself today is how far have I removed myself from sinning by applying what I have learnt about both myself and this struggle and after having focused on that how much meaning have I realized in my past sins?

Thank you Guard and all the others who have helped me till here and will help in the future.( I )

=====

Re: Reflections About a Year at GUE now GYE

Posted by destructive cycle - 22 Jul 2010 10:18

---

[Holy Yid wrote on 22 Jul 2010 08:09:](#)

There is a concept in *Chasidus* that Hashem, in His Infinite Wisdom, causes all sins to happen and we, those who sinned *unwillingly* so to speak (this idea is very kabbalistic and Rav Desler warns about not letting Kabbalistic teachings weaken our fear of sin)

Can you please include a source for this idea (not Rabbi Arush, he is not proper mesorah). I am not that knowledgeable, but the little knowledge I have, taught me otherwise. This idea you quote from the chassidim is against the Rambam. Are these chassidim aware of this? Maybe they say that the Rambam did not have the mesora. But, the Rambam was very adamant. Please, inform me.

The Rambam even goes on to ask how we could act against the will of Hashem. He explains that the will of Hashem is for us to choose.

Also, during tisha b'av we read the famous megillas eicha, where Yirmiyahu speaks his experience. If you look in chapter 3, it is only at the point that Yirmiyahu recognizes that all evil comes from man NOT G-D, was yirmuyahu able to rise above his depression. So, I am not quite sure what to do with your words.

As far as Rabbi Dessler, I found the opposite to be true from his words. It has been a while since I read this stuff, but I vaguely recall him speaking about how a few great people were sort of forced into it. The implication being that most people it is not that way.

:'(

=====  
=====

Re: Reflections About a Year at GUE now GYE  
Posted by Holy Yid - 22 Jul 2010 16:39

---

I write from memory. This idea is originally from the Mai Hasheiloach, the Ishbitzer Rebbe. It is quoted in Pri Tzadik in sefer Devorim.

It is known that our actions are both the product of our choice due to our free will and the product of G-d pre-ordaining everything we do. These two ideas seem to contradict each other, in fact Rambam writes that it is not possible for the human mind to reconcile them.

It is also known (see Ramban introduction to his commentary on Chumash) that everything which was created by G-d, both the spiritual and physical, can be understood on 50 different levels of depth, with each level new depth of understanding in the existence. The human mind can only grasp the first 49 levels and the 50th is only understood by G-d Himself.

The Arizal teaches that in the 50th level of understanding free will and Divine Pre-Ordination reconciled. Through Teshuva a person can remove his part of the sin and reach a level where the only thing that remains is G-d pre-ordaining the sin. But to do this a person must transcend the shallowness of this world and connect to G-d in the deepest way possible so the person connects with G-d on the 50th level of wisdom. I do not recall the specifics of how one reaches the 50th level through Teshuva.

The piece from Rav Desler I had in mind is in Vol IV p 11. The thought you mention (I believe it is in Vol II) does not contradict this as a few holy people have the ability through their actions, to impact the point all the souls connect and thereby influence, in a positive manner, the spiritual core of Israel and thereby cause a positive change in the whole nation.

Sorry if I am way in over my head.

One more thought. You are not "just a dumb pervert". You are a Jew wanting and working to improve yourself. The reward is according to the pain and a Jew like you who feels they are so low and still is working to change is very special to G-d.

=====

=====

Posted by destructive cycle - 22 Jul 2010 19:07

was mankind himself who caused it, as he writes at the beginning.

Incidentally, Rav tzadok in tzidkas hatzadik, number 43 makes a passing reference to this idea from his Rebbe. And he is explicit as well that this only happens to few people. And it is rare. No one is allowed going on saying this on their own. Please look up the sources and let me know if you agree.

So, what I come out of these sources is certainly no proof to the claim you mentioned above, and to me it implies the opposite.

It is known the our actions are both the product of our choice due to our free will and the product of G-d pre-ordaining everything we do. These two ideas seem to contradict each other, in fact Rambam writes that it is not possible for the human mind to reconcile them.

I am very well aware of this Rambam. This is found in chapter 5 of hilchos teshuvah and in greater depth in his introduction to pirkei avos (entitled shemoneh perakim), chapter eight. It is this same Rambam that I quoted you above. I urge you to look it up inside. You will find that your assertions are strongly rejected by the Rambam.

Allow me to explain something very important and that confuses most people. The Rambam deals with two basic philosophical questions in both of the sources I quoted to you above. The first issue is Ratzon Hashem. He asks how is it possible that we act against Ratzon Hashem? To that he *does* have an answer, and a very clear answer. He explains, as I wrote above, that ratzon hashem is for us to decide. And he elaborates how our actions are not preordained. He even goes on to explain that even choosing a shiduch is not preordained. He refers to the belief that things are preordained as the belief of “idiots of the world” and “uneducated Jews”.

The second question is if Hashem knows everything, surely he knows we will sin, and so how can it not be preordained. In other words, the question of knowledge (yediya) seems to contradict the idea of gezeira (preordained). To that he does not have an answer. And he explains why we can't understand.

In the quote above, you referred me to the Rambam's second question, but misquoted it. The Rambam makes no mention of the fact that our actions are a combo. Quote the opposite. And

he rejects the notion of G-d pre-ordaining everything. As stated above, he is quite adamant about his belief.

So as far as the Rambam, we do not have a source for your original claim from the "Chassidim". And we have a source against them.

Please, if I am misunderstanding this Rambam, please clarify. I am still new to this game. I will quote the Rambam in hilchos teshuvah at the end of the post for you to see for yourself. But you must read the shemoneh perakim as well.

It is also known (see Ramban introduction to his commentary on Chumash) that everything which was created by G-d, both the spiritual and physical, can be understood on 50 different levels of depth, with each level new depth of understanding in the existence. The human mind can only grasp the first 49 levels and the 50th is only understood by G-d Himself.

The Arizal teaches that in the 50th level of understanding free will and Divine Pre-Ordination reconciled. Through Teshuva a person can remove his part of the sin and reach a level where the only thing that remains is G-d pre-ordaining the sin. But to do this a person must transcend the shallowness of this world and connect to G-d in the deepest way possible so the person connects with G-d on the 50th level of wisdom. I do not recall the specifics of how one reaches the 50th level through Teshuva.

Rav Tzadok makes reference to this idea in siman 40. But again the issue reconciling yediya (knowledge) with bechira. Not ratzon and bechira. This doesn't teach us that it was preordained. Look up the language inside. I am not familiar with the works of Arizal inside (though I am in awe of you that you read Arizal) but as far as Rav Tzadok, he doesn't address ratzon hashem. But again, I could be misinterpreting the sources.

Either way, you agree that this source has little relevance to us, as very few of us reach this level.

The piece from Rav Desler I had in mind is in Vol IV p 11.

I looked it up but did not find the chissideshe yesod you began with.

The thought you mention (I believe it is in Vol II) does not contradict this as a few holy people have the ability through their actions, to impact the point all the souls connect and thereby influence, in a positive manner, the spiritual core of Israel and thereby cause a positive change in the whole nation.

I am not sure how reconciled it. Sorry, my head is filled with filth. I guess I have no room for proper Torah understanding.

Thank you Holy Yid for taking the time to read this. If you can please respond with proper sources for this idea you began with, it would be most helpful to me. Also, once we found the source, please help me understand it with the Rambam. Should we assume that the Ramabam is against the Chassidim (which we have not found yet) you quote.

One more thought. You are not "just a dumb pervert". You are a Jew wanting and working to improve yourself. The reward is according to the pain and a Jew like you who feels they are so low and still is working to change is very special to G-d.

Thank you. That meant a lot. If you read my thread in introduce yourself, you will see why I am so sour about myself. I was clean for almost a whole year. I then fell. And I can't get out of this whole. The GYE site has made matters worse. It removed all my guilt, so now I freely surf for porn guilt free. One of the reason why I needed to address this thought you brought from the Chassidim is because for me this is yetzer hara speech. This is precisely what the Rambam was trying to address as well. Once we fall into the trap of thinking that our action are in Hashem's hands, we subconsciously remove the efforts from within. I am not sure if you are a fan of SA 12 steps, but they got great stuff. I know it is goyish, but they have some good ideas and they address addictions and lust in a very real way like no Torah book does. I was in a group once and now trying to get a group here in Israel. Anyway they explain this idea.

I will end with a quote from the White book, if you do not mind:

[SA, White Book, page 26\]](#)

[I see now that in all my religious striving and psychotherapy I was waiting for the miracle to happen first, that I should somehow be zapped or wrote:](#)

God doesn't want to remove from me the possibility of falling; he wants me to have the freedom to choose not to fall.[/u] I'd been praying self-righteously all along, "Please God, take it away!" not realizing my inner heart was piteously whining, ". . . so I won't have to give it up." There was belief in God without surrender. That belief availed nothing! I had never died to lust.

A true belief in free will is the essence to surrender and recovery in general.

=====

Re: Reflections About a Year at GUE now GYE  
Posted by Holy Yid - 22 Jul 2010 20:02

---

I appriceate you studying my post so in depth. It will take me a few days to prurse all the proper sources. In the mean time I suggest you look in Sifsai Chaim from Rav Chaim Freidlander Vol I. he has an essay about the Chazal the sins can become merits. From what I recall (I have heard this more recently on a recorded lecture from someone else) if we use sins to shape our world view and motivate us to improve then they have had a positive effect also. This is without any other ideas people may find questionable.

Should you want to persue Pri Tzadick you can follow this link  
[hebrewbooks.org/pdfpager.aspx?req=22600&pgnum=1](http://hebrewbooks.org/pdfpager.aspx?req=22600&pgnum=1)

I am aware of the Mai HaSheiloach you quoted and have seen it in the past and I don't think it condtraticts what I am saying.

Regarding groups if you have a DSL line GYE has phone groups in the USA and the Denver branch of SA has multiple daily phone calls.



=====

Re: Reflections About a Year at GUE now GYE  
Posted by destructive cycle - 22 Jul 2010 20:39

---

I appriceate you studying my post so in depth.

It keeps me out of trouble.

In the mean time I suggest you look in Sifsai Chaim from Rav Chaim Freidlander Vol I. he has an essay about the Chazal the sins can become merits.

Thanks. I actually read that sefer cover to cover numerous times. I can't go Ellul/R"H/YK without it. I will read that essay over again for chazara. Thanks.

From what I recall (I have heard this more recently on a recorded lecture from someone else) if we use sins to shape our world view and motivate us to improve then they have had a positive effect also.

Yes, this I agree. But this is not the same as saying that our sins were caused by Hashem, chas v'shalom. The fact that we are to grow from our mistakes and become greater people is from chazal. Perhaps the two most popular statements are :

- 1) that when we do teshuvah m'ahavah our sins become zechoyos (merits)
- 2) a baal teshuvah's madreiga is greater than a tzadik gamur.

I am aware of the Mai HaSheiloach you quoted and have seen it in the past and I don't think it contradicts what I am saying.

Then maybe I misunderstood you. But I thought that you said that Hashem causes all sins to happen, while Mai HaSheiloach said only at the top level. Please clarify!

Regarding groups if you have a DSL line GYE has phone groups in the USA and the Denver branch of SA has multiple daily phone calls.

Thanks. I will find time to jump on the bandwagon of one of these.

I just went maariv and afterwards I went to look up the tzidkas from siman 40 I quoted above. I was mistaken. You are correct. He does mention that all our sins at the highest levels of teshuvah will be perceived as ratzon hashem (but he never says that hashem causes them). I guess this is the closest source we can find for your principle. I still wonder if it contradicts the Rambam. The Rambam was very clear. What do you think? Rav tzadok goes on to quote the Arizal that you brought. unbelievable. But, like all pieces from rav tzadom it is hard to fully grasp what he is trying to say.

Oh, by the way can you give me the source in the pri tzadik?

Take care my friend,

-dc

=====

Re: Reflections About a Year at GUE now GYE  
Posted by Kollel Guy - 23 Jul 2010 04:02

---

Can you please include a source for this idea (not Rabbi Arush, he is not proper mesorah). I am

not that knowledgeable, but the little knowledge I have, taught me otherwise. This idea you quote from the chassidim is against the Rambam. Are these chassidim aware of this? Maybe they say that the Rambam did not have the mesora. But, the Rambam was very adamant. Please, inform me.

You can check out Drash Moshe by R' Moshe Feinstein (as "proper mesorah" as it gets), at the end of the sefer he adds in a whole section of his pshetlach on T'nach.

Look at the shtickle on "Kol Haneshama t'hallel kah", where he basically says this whole inyan very clearly.

=====

=====

Re: Reflections About a Year at GUE now GYE  
Posted by Holy Yid - 23 Jul 2010 06:36

---

Thanks, but what are you doing online? I thought you gave up the web. Should I worry you are slipping?

=====

=====

Re: Reflections About a Year at GUE now GYE  
Posted by destructive cycle - 23 Jul 2010 06:56

---

[Holy Yid wrote on 22 Jul 2010 08:09:](#)

There is a concept in *Chasidus* that Hashem, in His Infinite Wisdom, causes all sins to happen and we, those who sinned unwillingly so to speak

[destructive cycle](#)[Can you please include a source for this idea \[/quote\]](#)

[\[quote= wrote on 23 Jul 2010 04:02:](#)

You can check out Drash Moshe by R' Moshe Feinstein (as "proper mesorah" as it gets), at the end of the sefer he adds in a whole section of his pshetlach on T'nach.

Look at the shtickle on "Kol Haneshama t'hallel kah", where he basically says this whole inyan very clearly.

Thank you Rabbi Kollel! I looked it up, but he does not speak about the idea that Hashem causes our sins to happen. He does say that in the end we will see how all evil in the world will be the seen as being the cause for good. But the actions as they are, he says, are still sins, caused by man himself. This is very similar to what Rav tzadok explained in siman 40, which I quoted above, that at the highest level of teshuvah we see how our sins became merits and thereby creating ratzon hashem. But he *does not* say that are sins were *caused* by Hashem. And in fact, he implies the opposite in siman 43, as mentioned above.

So, we are still lacking a source for this "concept in chasidus" that states are sins are caused by Hashem. And as stated a few times above, it is against the Rambam. Please, someone fill me in. I am sorry for being such a nudge, but this sugya is at least keeping me out of trouble in the meantime.

So long me friends

=====  
=====

Re: Reflections About a Year at GUE now GYE  
Posted by Holy Yid - 23 Jul 2010 09:12

---

. I am sorry for being such a nudge, but this sugya is at least keeping me out of trouble in the meantime.

So long me friends

[/quote]

Forgive me for psycholanilzing you from another country and not evening knowing who you are but you appear to be a little sensitive and maybe worried about what others think of you a tat more than others do, my dear fellow struggler. This might be a factor in yooour struggles and it might benefit you both personaly and in this area to read about being assertive.

I am sorry if I went anywhere I should not have, but in general FEEL FREE TO ASK AWAY. Btw you have very good questions.

=====

Re: Reflections About a Year at GUE now GYE  
Posted by destructive cycle - 23 Jul 2010 09:44

---

[Holy Yid wrote on 23 Jul 2010 09:12:](#)

Forgive me for psycholanilzing you from another country and not evening knowing who you are but you appear to be a little sensitive and maybe worried about what others think of you a tat more than others do, my dear fellow struggler. This might be a factor in yooour struggles and it might benefit you both personaly and in this area to read about being assertive.

I am sorry if I went anywhere I should not have, but in general FEEL FREE TO ASK AWAY. Btw you have very good questions.

Firstly, thanks for validating my questions. Whether I am overly sensitive or not, validation is always important.

Secondly, feel free to psychoanalyze all you want. The worst will be is that you are wrong. And

the best will be is for you to encourage me to grow.

Anyway, the issue has more to do with being polite than "worried about what others think". I know from personal experience that sometime people ask me too many questions about something that I said that it becomes annoying. So I am acknowledging the fact that I might be a nudge to you. But, B"H, you have perfected middos and didn't even need my apology.

Anyway, I could be wrong about myself, whatever.

But, honestly, do you honestly believe that such a "personality defect" is a cause to my addiction? And if it had some cause do you honestly believe that this is important for recovery. At this point in my life I am dealing with compulsion issues and lack of self control. When we blow up our problems and look at every defect in our character traits and expect that fixing those issues will help us in our struggle, we are setting ourselves up for disappointment and disaster. But, then again, what do I know? I am still new to GYE.

Anyway, back to the main sugya. Can you please fill me with the sources? And do you agree that the Rambam's I quoted to you are against what you stated?

And once again, sorry for being a nudge. ;D

=====

Re: Reflections About a Year at GUE now GYE  
Posted by Holy Yid - 25 Jul 2010 03:24

---

My sweet holy friend who G-d loves dearly and who I only want that you should get better and live a happier life, please do not apologize to me again. It REALLY is getting on my nerves.

=====

Re: Reflections About a Year at GUE now GYE  
Posted by Yosef Hatzadik - 26 Jul 2010 19:14

---

[Daily Dose of Dov in GuardYourEyes Chizuk E-Mail \(No. 818\) Friday ~ 12 Av, 5770 ~ July 23, 2010\]](#)

[For whatever reason, I see it as Rav Noach zt wrote:](#)

**it was bashert that I become an addict and have to find Him by way of depravity and insanity.**[/u] I am not touching on bechirah issue - the fact is that I am an addict, and at some point I became hopeless. And He was and is the only One who can really save me... lo ayacheil! Ein od milvado! Many other people apparently are able to learn that through mitzvos - I could only learn it through aveiros. Sorry, that is just the way it was.

=====

Re: Reflections About a Year at GUE now GYE  
Posted by Holy Yid - 01 Aug 2010 06:15

Reb Destructive,

Look at the last peice from Reb Tzadok on parshas vayailach

???? ?????? ???? ???(????) ?????? ???? ???? ?

????? ?????? ?????? ???? ???? ??? ???? ?

???. ?????? ?? ??? ?????? ?? ?????????? ???? ?

???? ??, ??? ?????? ???, ?? ?????? ??????? ?

????? ???? ?????? ?? ??? ?????? ??????? ??? ?

??? ?????? ??? ?????• ?????? ??????? ??? ?????? ?

??????? ???? ???? ???? ??????. ?????? ?????? ?

???? ?????? ?????????? ??? ??????? ??? ??? ?

????? ?????? ?????? ?? ??? ?????? ??? ?????? ?

?????? ?? ???? ?? ???? ?? ???? ???? ???? ???? ?



?????? ???? ????? ? ???? ????? ????? ?????

????? ????? ???? ???? ??????. ????? ?????

??? ?????? ?????? ????? ???? ????? ?? ?????

????? ?? ?????? ??????? ????? ?? ??? ???

?????? ????? ???? ????? ????? ???? ?????

??? ??????? ??????. ??? ?????? ?? ??? ??????

??????? ?????? ??? ????? ??????? ??? ??

The quote has a few mistakes so look here

[hebrewbooks.org/pdfpager.aspx?req=22600&st=&pgnum=212](http://hebrewbooks.org/pdfpager.aspx?req=22600&st=&pgnum=212)

=====

====

Re: Reflections About a Year at GUE now GYE  
Posted by destructive cycle - 02 Aug 2010 21:55

---

Thanks!

I sent you a PM.

=====

====