

"seal of truth"="seal of suicide"

Posted by happygrowth - 19 Apr 2010 22:26

---

i am a young youth counsellor and i am close to a lot of frum and secular teens.

i know some secular kids, that were becoming very passionate about yiddishkeit and had even started keeping shabbos.

however after they saw the film "the seal of truth" they told me that they don't want a relationship with a god that tortures people for masturbating and not keeping shabbos, even if they were born secular! "the guy in the film does not even mention being jugged for the way he treated people yet he was publicly humiliated for masturbating!"

What worries me the most and what really compelled me to post this is that i have had 2 frum kids cry to me, with terrible guilt and fear in their eyes after watching that movie, they both told me they had not slept properly in weeks. the one kid sounded suicidal so i sent him for help as i am not qualified.

the thing is, before they watched the film they were doing well.

I am begging anyone who can stop this to do something, **must we wait for the first child to kill himself G-d forbid?** the movie clearly is not true if this even has to be debated it is tragic. one is jugged on a personal level for what you were able to do. the film gives the christian impression that you will burn in hell even if you never hear of the torah.

=====

Re: "seal of truth"="seal of suicide"

Posted by Yosef Hatzadik - 22 Apr 2010 15:56

---

[Rage ATM wrote on 22 Apr 2010 15:53:](#)

by the way, the very worse sin according to the kabbalah is ...

You are already a greater kabbalist than I am! ;D

=====

Re: "seal of truth"="seal of suicide"

Posted by Yosef Hatzadik - 22 Apr 2010 15:59

---

[Rage ATM wrote on 22 Apr 2010 15:53:](#)

as the text plainly states, these were agents placed to prevent anyone from discovering the existence of gan eden...the "spinning sword" and "cherubim" or "destructive angels" are certainly not hell...

To prevent anyone from discovering the existence of Gan eden, or maybe to guard the route to gan eden to prevent anyone from entering with 'soiled clothes'? Maybe they are the 'washing machine'?

=====

Re: "seal of truth"="seal of suicide"

Posted by Yosef Hatzadik - 22 Apr 2010 17:15

---

[Rage ATM wrote on 22 Apr 2010 17:06:](#)

[Yosef Hatzadik wrote on 22 Apr 2010 15:59:](#)

[Rage ATM wrote on 22 Apr 2010 15:53:](#)

as the text plainly states, these were agents placed to prevent anyone from discovering the existence of gan eden...the "spinning sword" and "cherubim" or "destructive angels" are certainly not hell...

To prevent anyone from discovering the existence of Gan eden, or maybe to guard the route to gan eden to prevent anyone from entering with 'soiled clothes'? Maybe they are the 'washing machine'?

there are a number of oblique references and medrashim about hell (hell DOES exist after all)...i was saying the reason hell isnt mentioned in ki tavo or anywhere else explicitly is because...

I do not disagree!!!

You will notice that my sentences ended with question marks. They are questions, thinking aloud, wondering etc. They are NOT statements. As was already stated, I am not knowledgeable in these areas.

=====

Re: "seal of truth"="seal of suicide"

Posted by happygrowth - 22 Apr 2010 18:10

---

[Yosef Hatzadik wrote on 22 Apr 2010 15:30:](#)

almost everything he said corroborates very closely to what I already knew. So I look at it as a compilation of the Mamorei Chazl on this subject packaged into story form. Is it for everyone to watch? A resounding **NO!!!** Was it wrong to make such a film? I don't think so. No one around here complained about the Sefer Reishis

Dear Yosef Hatzadik, you may be touching on the very root of this discussion.

There is one big problem, fine the nishoma will need cleaning, but **why the "gehinom" must he be publically shamed and tortured?** Millions of angels shouted that he is a rasha! He says that he felt so ashamed, and that it is the hardest thing in hell to go through, this **is all for the things he did as an Ones!!**

He is **not responsible** for these actions, he had not heard of most things, not even teffilin.

**In the world of truth how can you feel ashamed and evil for something you have no control over?** And **strangely enough he does not mention being judged for the things that someone on his level should feel ashamed about e.g. Kibud Av?**

Something is dangerously wrong with this.

Why should everyone in shomuyim look at him as an evil person, which he is not!

Am I missing something? Or is something very, very wrong.

Sorry, the whole thing upsets me.

=====

Re: "seal of truth"="seal of suicide"

Posted by Yosef Hatzadik - 22 Apr 2010 18:24

---

My impression:

The film is not a true story.

The film does not fit with the Chazal describing *Techilas ino shel adam*, The order of the beginning of the Judgement.

When a person comes up there, he will be judged for everything! [I heard that the Vilna Goan rebuked someone that he saw smoking on Shabbos about the issur of Muktzah! When the guy incredulously pointed out that he is making a flame - something which is much worse, the Goan answered, "You think that because you do something big Hashem overlooks the small things?"]

It is extensively written up in seforim that a large part of the onesh for this sin is based on lots of shame....

A good scrubbing may be painful too. And if an abrasive detergent is used it will be 'highly uncomfortable' to say the least, but it is part of the cleaning process. The other option may be to discard this set of clothes and try with another. Do we want that option? That is what the Christians say Hashem did. They claim that He discarded us because we sinned and He had no more hope for us.

But the main part that I meant in my post was that it is not 'revenge'! Especially if we had no way of knowing that it is a sin in the first place! Neither is a washing machine taking 'revenge' against the mud that a person slipped in. Hashem loves us too much to want to take 'revenge' from us little guys. He only wants us to be clean enough to enter Gan Eden and REALLY enjoy ourselves!

(If it would've been 'revenge', I would tell Hashem, "Please go pick on your own size to fight with." :D )

=====

Re: "seal of truth"="seal of suicide"

Posted by happygrowth - 22 Apr 2010 18:54

---

[Yosef Hatzadik wrote on 22 Apr 2010 18:24:](#)

It is extensively written up in seforim that a large part of the onesh for this sin is based on lots of shame....

If someone has cancer and needs to be cured, should he feel ashamed?

Surely you can only be ashamed of things you have control over.

Unless you are saying that the shame is false shame, in other words the cleansing process is that you feel a deep sense of shame, but the **reality is you have absolutely no reason to be ashamed**, it's not your fault! Just like some one whose garments need to be cleaned before entering the hall would not need to be ashamed for his dirty clothes, it was not his fault!

I'm also wondering, there seems to be no difference in punishment for Ones sins and intentional sins!

=====

Re: "seal of truth"="seal of suicide"

Posted by kanesher - 22 Apr 2010 19:40

---

[Yosef Hatzadik wrote on 22 Apr 2010 15:46:](#)

[Rage ATM wrote on 22 Apr 2010 15:42:](#)

and another thing...have you ever considered WHY the torah shebichtav does not make a single reference to hell even though it exists?

What are the "*Keruvim* and *Lahat hacherev hamishapeches*" that Hashem placed at the entrance to Gan Eden referring to?

(See Bereishis 3:24)

The Ramban writes in Shaar HaGemul that Gan Eden is a physical place, as is the cherev, which is still there. And he says that explorers in his day got killed by it. I made a chesbon once, and I figure it's someone in Kenya. Explains Obama, I guess.

Hell helps for some things - but it's like an emergency brake - don't try to drive with it...positive, positive, positive. Kabbalah isn't halacha. It just isn't. We follow Halacha. Yes, as per Halacha it's assur, most horrible - but focusing on that isn't going to help us. So many have recovered here - has anyone recovered through guilt and pain? Again, the real horror is the addiction of it all and the destruction of self. Obviously we don't pasken that it's the worst chet in the world.

Anyway, back to the positive stuff!

=====

Re: "seal of truth"="seal of suicide"

Posted by happygrowth - 22 Apr 2010 19:51

---

[Rage ATM wrote on 22 Apr 2010 19:15:](#)

happy, your logic and theory makes as little sense as any i have heard....if, as you say, a person that never knew of the torah is completely absolved of responsibility in the afterlife then how is he treated any differently then a tzaddik that worked his whole life in mitzvot? are those two people treated the same? is fat mike from nofx treated the same as rav shach? i refuse to believe that...

Rage ATM, I think you are misunderstanding me, I am not saying that a secular person is not responsible for anything, I am saying he has his "point of free will" he is only responsible for this. everyone has there own "point of freewill". Obviously your point of free will changes as you grow; this is a fundamental principle as is explained by Rav Dessler. This is why no one can say who is more of a tzaddik then who.

Rabbi DR Tatz explains this very well over here.

<http://www.simpletoremember.com/media/a/free-will-the-real-you1/>

you and i and everyone else on this planet needs to understand that we cannot understand what happens after we die...there is no way for us to indulge ourselves in this topic....dont try to figure out why, who, where or how when it comes to the afterlife...there is no human logic that can lead you to any right answers....

Exactly, then why is "the seal of truth" on a lot of frum websites?

Are people meant to think "ooh that's scary, but a better not think about it at all because we will never know, but I must just be scared."

=====

=====



Re: "seal of truth"="seal of suicide"

Posted by Yosef Hatzadik - 22 Apr 2010 23:04

---

[happygrowth wrote on 22 Apr 2010 18:54:](#)

I'm also wondering, there seems to be no difference in punishment for Ones sins and intentional sins!

Are you in the mood of a good scare? That film is only about the *Shogegsins*. The intentional ones are much..... muddyer? :o

=====

Re: "seal of truth"="seal of suicide"

Posted by kanesher - 23 Apr 2010 07:47

---

Frum websites aren't exactly run by da'as torah (other then, of course, GYE)...not exactly a rayah...

=====

Re: "seal of truth"="seal of suicide"

Posted by southafricanJEW - 23 Apr 2010 13:23

---

[quote="happygrowth" link=topic=2192.msg62501#msg62501 date=1271959826]

There is one big problem, fine the nishoma will need cleaning, but **why the “gehinom” must he be publically shamed and tortured?** Millions of angels shouted that he is a rasha! He says that he felt so ashamed, and that it is the hardest thing in hell to go through, this **is all for the**

**things he did as an Ones!!**

He is **not responsible** for these actions, he had not heard of most things, not even teffilin.

**In the world of truth how can you feel ashamed and evil for something you have no control over?**

Happy, I know these questions can drive one crazy, but if you think about it, questions about spiritual damage from "Ones" sins, is basically the same as the old age question "why do bad things happen to good people?" Moshe never even knew the answer to this!

But I am learning not to be concerned about questions like this, at the end of the day we cannot begin to understand the way Hashem works, but I am comforted by the fact that Hashem in is infinite wisdom knows what's best, and He only wants the ultimate best for us.

=====

Re: "seal of truth"="seal of suicide"

Posted by silentbattle - 23 Apr 2010 13:44

---

Well said!

There may be a slight difference as the understanding of "why do bad things happen to good people" is based on the assumption that in the world of truth, everything makes sense, while this is TALKING about the world of truth - but even so, the point is that even if it doesn't make sense to US, god probably knows what he's doing.

Another thought or two - when we talk about "being publicly embarrassed," that may be a bit different from what we imagine. It might mean that we become aware, on a deep level, of what we've done, we have to look directly at our actions (hence all the angels, created by our sins, because that's just what happens, on a practical level, when we sin).

Referring back to my earlier example, it's like a guy who flips a switch, and then finds out that he triggered a nuclear explosion. Not his fault, right? But he'd still probably feel bad...especially if he finds out that his local library had a sign up saying that no one should ever touch that switch!

DISCLAIMER: I'm not comparing this to killing people, I'm just using that as an example of

something with terrible consequences, that we'd feel bad about once we found out what we had done.

=====

Re: "seal of truth"="seal of suicide"

Posted by strugglingandstrivingBT - 23 Apr 2010 14:11

---

I've been reading through this thread and everything said is very interesting. I would like to share my haskafa on the matter.

The reason I stopped MZ'L is NOT because I thought I would be punished (I do sort of think that, but in honest analysis that is not the reason.) I did it because every time I did I felt my connection to Hashem suffer drastically, almost to the point of nonexistent. I'm not convinced that people are punished for sin, rather they are not rewarded as much and the world is not as perfect as it could be. Yes, I think that there is a possibility for punishment, but I don't think we are capable of understanding or comprehending the whole of what it is, and I think that what we lack may be more of a punishment than what we could endure.

Torah and mitzvos are the way to best function in this world, best cleave to Hashem and those who don't follow them will not feel peace, will not be as successful as they could and etc etc.

That being said, I do believe that my actions have dire consequence and I am G-d fearing. I fear losing my relationship to my Creator, the many blessings he bestows upon me, not that he will punish me with horrific acts of torture.

This is my outlook as a person striving to become Baal Teshuva. Before becoming frum I didn't have any idea that this was assur, I didn't even know what assur meant! How could I possibly have stopped my desires when I didn't know there was anything wrong with what I was doing?! A Jew raised by Gentiles is not punished for his actions. There are consequences, causes and effects, and a child who regularly masturbates will probably lack a healthy relationship with Hashem, and potentially go on to further sin. But could he really be punished for what he doesn't know is wrong?

Yes, there is a systemic problem with society that the issue is not addressed, no sparking fear in young children will not help this issue. We need to teach people to love Hashem, then the sin will stop naturally.

=====

Re: "seal of truth"="seal of suicide"

Posted by briut - 23 Apr 2010 14:54

---

[strugglingandstrivngBT wrote on 23 Apr 2010 14:11:](#)

The reason I stopped MZ'L is NOT because I thought I would be punished (I do sort of think that, but in honest analysis that is not the reason.) [...] We need to teach people to love Hashem, then the sin will stop naturally.

Thank you. What you just described is the Judaism that I recognize and love. I appreciate your putting some ahavas Hashem back into a discussion that seemed to be taking us further from the goal.

=====

=====