

Ben adam lamakom vs. ben adam lachaveiro

Posted by Momo - 06 Dec 2009 10:18

Please vote!

=====

=====

Re: Ben adam lamakom vs. ben adam lachaveiro

Posted by Ano Nymous - 06 Dec 2009 10:23

A person's Bein Odom LaMakom tends to mirror his Bein Odom Lachaveiro, so I voted for the latter.

=====

=====

Re: Ben adam lamakom vs. ben adam lachaveiro

Posted by habib613 - 06 Dec 2009 10:24

momo, you need to add some background.

like if someone cooks on shabbos and offers me the food, I'll say no. nicely, obviously, but it's a definite no.

but if someone comes to me crying hysterically i will try to help them instead of davening mincha.

dunno if that's even right, lehalacha, now that i think about it ???

it's so good i'm not a posek

=====

=====

Re: Ben adam lamakom vs. ben adam lachaveiro

Posted by Momo - 06 Dec 2009 10:37

No background will be given because I want you to take this and run with it.

Please feel free to write why you voted the way you did.

=====

Re: Ben adam lamakom vs. ben adam lachaveiro

Posted by the.guard - 06 Dec 2009 11:49

Ultimately, the goal of everything is really bein adam Lemakom. However, Hashem created the world in such a way that it is IMPOSSIBLE to get to bein adam Lamakom before perfecting the bein adam lechaveiro. Hashem is too abstract for us physical beings. We need to first work with what we see and feel, and once that is perfected, we can do it for Hashem. This is a big Yesod. And that is why Rabbi Akiva writes that Loving your fellow man is a Klal Gadol BaTorah.

=====

Re: Ben adam lamakom vs. ben adam lachaveiro

Posted by imtrying25 - 06 Dec 2009 12:31

[guardureyes wrote on 06 Dec 2009 11:49:](#)

Ultimately, the goal of everything is really bein adam Lemakom. However, Hashem created the world in such a way that it is IMPOSSIBLE to get to bein adam Lamakom before perfecting the bein adam lechaveiro. Hashem is too abstract for us physical beings. We need to first work with what we see and feel, and once that is perfected, we can do it for Hashem. This is a big Yesod. And that is why Rabbi Akiva writes that Loving your fellow man is a Klal Gadol BaTorah.

DITTO all that. R Itze'le Volshiner says over from his father that a persons most important thing in this world is to be there for others. Le'ho'il Le'achrini.

=====

=====

Re: Ben adam lamakom vs. ben adam lachaveiro
Posted by Momo - 07 Dec 2009 13:02

Thanks to everyone who voted and posted.

I thought this was an interesting topic.

48 views and only 4 people voted. What are you afraid of? Vote, even if you don't post why!

I can't see who voted for which answer, so you're totally anonymous.

=====

=====

Re: Ben adam lamakom vs. ben adam lachaveiro
Posted by silentbattle - 07 Dec 2009 13:43

I'm going to go out on a limb here and vote...yeah, I kinda figured my vote would be in the minority.

Our bein adam l'chaveiro is part of our bein adam l'makom...it's not indepedent.

Also, we can't decide on our own what "good bein adam l'chaveiro" is. Just look at the worlds outside, and you'll see millions (billions) of people trying to figure out, on their own, what the "right" way to act is.

That's not to minimize the importance of bein adam l'chaveiro -

In fact, Rabbi Kelemen brings down, in parshas mishpatim (not sure who he's quoting from) that the purpose of the whole torah is the mitzvos bein adam l'chaveiro. HOWEVER, what that means, he says, is that we need to get to the point where we do even mitzvos bein adam

l'chaveiro, that make sense, completely leshmah, and with complete awareness that the reason we're doing them is for hashem.

So yes, bein adam l'chaveiroh is essential, in so many ways. But it's important to remember that it's all part of our avodas hashem, and without that balance...

=====

Re: Ben adam lamakom vs. ben adam lachaveiro
Posted by bardichev - 07 Dec 2009 16:08

THIS IS A CLASSIC QUESTION

SOME OF IT BORDERS ON THE ORIGINAL DIFFERNCES BETWEEN THE CHASSIDIM AND THE BALLIE MUSSAR(WHICH I WILL NOT BE THE REFEREE)

BALEI MUSSAR FOCUS ON PERFECTING ONES MIDDOS AND PERFECTING ONES SELF

WHILE CHASSIDIM IN GENERAL(THERE ARE EXCEPTIONS IN CHASSIDUS WHERE THEY ARE MORE INTERNAL)

FOCUS ON THE SEEMINGLY EXTERNAL

THERE IS A VORT IN THIS WEEKS PARSHA FROM THE HEILIGER REBBE REB MEILICH THAT A PERSON WHO HAS GOOD MIDDOS WILL BRING HIM TO AVODAS HASHEM

THERE IS A CHASSIDIH "VERTEL"IN LAST WEEKS PARSHA

HOW DID YAAKOV KNOW THAT WE WAS FIGHTING THE SAO SHEL ESAV?

BECAUSE WHEN HE ASKED HIM FOR SOMETHING HE SAID "SORRY I NEED TO GO

DAVEN"

ONE CHARACTER TRAIT YOU WILL FIND IN ANY ANY ANY GADOL WE KNOW OF NO
MATTER WHICH HAT THEY WORE ON THEIR HEAD OR AT WHICH TIME THEY DAVENED
MINCHA

THAY WERE ALL HUMBLE AND HAD GOOD MIDDOS

THE QUESTION IS ONLY WHICH COMES FIRST THE CHICKEN OR THE EGG?

HEY THEY BOTH WORK

GET WORKING!!!

=====

Re: Ben adam lamakom vs. ben adam lachaveiro

Posted by Moshew - 07 Dec 2009 16:53

How can you have one without the other!!!!!!!!!!!!!!

=====

Re: Ben adam lamakom vs. ben adam lachaveiro

Posted by silentbattle - 07 Dec 2009 17:03

To Reb MosheW - on a very deep level, you're absolutely right. On a superficial level, a person might appear to have one but not the other, but a chashuva rav once told me that you can use each one as a check for the other - if a person's bein adam l'makom is good, then he'll have good bein adam l'chaveiro, as well. And if you want to check whether his bein adam l'chaveiro is real - see if he's got real bein adam l'makom.

R' Bard - I'm goin to think more about what you've said from R' Mailich, but the first difference you brought seems to be a different issue - whether to work on the internal, or to use "chitzoniyus me'orer ese hapnimiyus," letting the externals influence our internal values. That difference could be applied to both bein adam l'makom, OR bein adam l'chaveiro.

Of course, we need to remember that when we judge someone's bein adam l'chaveiro, our own judgement may not be accurate. For example, when R' Shach made decisions about what to do in areas of bein adam l'chaveiro, I'm certain that there would be times whe I wouldn't have understood his reasoning. I'm sure there would be times when I would have done something different in his shoes. And I am absolutely certain that he'd be right, even if I totally don't understand.

=====

====

Re: Ben adam lamakom vs. ben adam lachaveiro
Posted by imtrying25 - 07 Dec 2009 17:11

[Moshew wrote on 07 Dec 2009 16:53:](#)

How can you have one without the other!!!!!!!!!!!!!!

Hey Moshew wats up? I dont think the question was ever about which one do you need and which you dont. But rather where should our focus be. What should we fcus on which in essence bring us to the other. And like Bardy mentioned before the balai Mussar definitely go with the approach that bein adom lechaveiroh is more important to focus on.

=====

====

Re: Ben adam lamakom vs. ben adam lachaveiro
Posted by the.guard - 08 Dec 2009 11:20

48 views and only 4 people voted. What are you afraid of?

I was afraid of voting because, like I answered above, it depends. Bein Adam Lechaveiro is more important NOW, but ultimately, it's goal is to bring us to Bein adam **lamakom**, which is greater in the over-all context of things.

=====

Re: Ben adam lamakom vs. ben adam lachaveiro
Posted by silentbattle - 08 Dec 2009 14:25

Rage, I like your point!

Correct me if I'm wrong, but it seems you're saying that we can use bein adam l'chaveiro as a way to make sure that we're doing the right thing bein adam l'makom, because the consequences of our actions are more concrete - sometimes it's hard to fully recognize that our actions are real, and that they have real consequences in the spiritual world, but it's easier to see the reality of hurting someone in this world.

Wow, that was an incredible run-on sentence!

=====

Re: Ben adam lamakom vs. ben adam lachaveiro
Posted by silentbattle - 08 Dec 2009 15:17

I completely agree with some of your points...but I completely disagree with others. To put it another way, I think I may agree with a lot of what you're saying - but not how you're saying it.

To start with, you're 100% right that he didn't create this world, and us, because he needed us. He is totally independent, and perfect. However, your next step is a bit more vague - yes, he wants us to do good, but it seems to me that that includes the "good" of bein adam l'makom, as well.

You're right - the torah is not a "how to get into heaven" book. But it's also not just a book that tells us how to live in this physical world. I think it's a book that helps clue us in to the spiritual reality, and based on that, yes - it's a "Living On Earth For Dummies" book. It tells us how to live in this world, and get closer to god. Like you said, not for his good, not because he needs it, but for our benefit. But our goal should be doing what Hashem wants.

And yes, we are supposed to follow in his ways, and do good - clearly, that is essential, in so many ways.

BUT - we are also supposed to do things for him that do not relate directly to anyone! For example, not wearing shatnez, keeping kosher, etc. Clearly, we are supposed to be doing these things to build a relationship with hashem. Because that's what HE wants.

i suppose the litmus test of all this is, what happens when our bein adam l'makom and our bein adam l'chaveiro (or at least, how we see it) clash? When halacha tells us to do one thing, but we feel that it's wrong. That the RIGHT thing would be to do something else. That can be an extreme example of "timcheh es zecheh amalek," or something more everyday - we can think of a million examples. Or even when a mitzvah of bein adam l'makom clashes with a ben adam l'chaveiro.

=====
=====