90,000 Reasons Posted by shneurzalman404 - 24 Nov 2016 01:25

Because your Tati shebashamayim loves you too much to let you do this.

Re: 90,000 Reasons Posted by Watson - 26 Nov 2016 17:34

Shlomo24 wrote on 25 Nov 2016 21:46:

It says ???? ????? ????? ????? It doesn't say them collectively.

====

====

Re: 90,000 Reasons Posted by Watson - 26 Nov 2016 17:45

It seems to me we need to very careful here. The steps are a spiritual program not a religious one. It strikes me that a sober apikores is also an apikores. So let's not get carried away. In England we call this 'throwing the baby out with the bathwater.'

Also, Big Book quote for all the BB fans:

"If we belong to a religious denomination which requires a definite morning devotion, we attend to that also..... Be quick to see where religious people are right. Make use of what they offer."

Finally, one of my favourite posts on the forum is very relevant in this thread IMO, albeit subtly so.

"gibbor120" post=126395 date=1321998827 catid=4**I'm Happy Just Being Me - from today's** daily dose

I'm Just Me; Hashem's Little Guy

You'd think I'd be HAPPY that certain urges are going away and my ability to walk away from certain aveiras is strengthening. But I've realized-- er, um, I'm NOT.

Why not? Because for so long I had been wearing my challenges on my sleeve.

> As a badge of honor for how "different" I was and how "amazing" I've been for conquering so much for so long.

> As an excuse to avoid all kinds of growth in my frumkeit.

> As a convenient tool for avoiding certain flavors of emotional (not physical, emotional) intimacy with my wife.

> As a way to feel special, different, deserving of G-d's love as compensation for the challenges He gave me.

> I could go on and on.

What a bunch of ego, ego, ego mess to have to tackle. Yuck.

The bottom line is, if I'm no longer going to be able to "define myself" in terms of certain sexual orientations, preferences, fantasies, whatever... then maybe I'm scared I've lost my uniqueness, my excuses, my... addunno, I gotta think about it.

Just when I thought I'd have an easy time of this work for a few weeks.... Darn.

Warning: Spoiler!

====

Re: 90,000 Reasons Posted by YidFromMonsey - 26 Nov 2016 23:19 Was thinking over shabbos about this topic and I came to think that "God as we understood Him" doesn't mean any of the above complicated discussions, what it means is simply this; Jews understand God to be hashem, Muslims understand God to be Allah, Hindus have their God, each religion understands their God to be whatever it may be. I don't think "God as we understood Him" implies on if we understand God's decisions or not....

Here goes another quote from Harvey; "this program is so simple that most people don't get it".

I feel that all this conversation is just overly complicating what the book is saying.

Re: 90,000 Reasons Posted by Workingguy - 27 Nov 2016 00:36

YFM,

====

That is exactly what it means. It never intended to be a license for a Jew to change his theological beliefs; it was a license to MAINTAIN his beliefs and that is why all the rabbis Shlomo quoted feel that there is nothing wrong with it.

But that isn't the way it's been being quoted. I may have misunderstood the conversation, but it sounded to me like it was up for discussion.

Let's put it this way- HaShem doesn't, and can't, change. He has many names, He has thirteen attributes of mercy, He has Sefiros, He is our Father, Our King, and many other ways that we refer to Him. But whatever those things are, they are absolute and not something that a Jew can give up on for recovery.

That was my point and I've never heard otherwise, but the recovery and 12 step talk often get very close to that. I remember someone asking me why I wouldn't be mechalel Shabbos to call a sponsor- not getting into whether it's a question or not (that's been discussed many times and although I believe that if yes it would be in limited and pretty extreme circumstances but not the

point here)- what amazed me was that it wasn't a question for him. That was frightening.

Re: 90,000 Reasons Posted by Shlomo24 - 27 Nov 2016 00:57

What has just been said is not what is said in the stories in the back of the Big Book. The reason why "of your understanding" was added is because one of the original members wasn't religious and he thought that people shouldn't be forced into believing in any particular God. People should be able to relate to it in their own way. For many people their "God" is the group itself. I've heard of it also be the human spirit and for some it's a doorknob. There's a famous story about an AA member who's "God" was a tree. There are many people who relate to God in different ways and that is why it's called "God of our understanding." Again, my sponsor always tells me to find "my God." And that "no one has a monopoly on God, even Harvey." (That was a direct quote, just thought I'd mention it for YFM).

Re: 90,000 Reasons Posted by YidFromMonsey - 27 Nov 2016 01:06

WG,

Correct, but with all that said, at least in my situation, before starting 12 steps my yiddishkiet was anyway out the window, so it's not like 12 steps would in any way get in the way of my yiddishkiet, so I do understand why some people feel that 12 steps is priority over anything else, because for people like me, without 12 steps we don't have anything, no life, no marriage, no yiddishkiet, and might even become suicidal in some extreme cases, which then a shaila of pikeeach nefesh mamish.

One big BUT here thought, I do agree that no one can decide on his own what is right or wrong, only a posek who understands addiction can say what's right or wrong, and each situation is unique....

====

Re: 90,000 Reasons Posted by cordnoy - 27 Nov 2016 01:14

Shlomo24 wrote on 27 Nov 2016 00:57:

What has just been said is not what is said in the stories in the back of the Big Book. The reason why "of your understanding" was added is because one of the original members wasn't religious and he thought that people shouldn't be forced into believing in any particular God. People should be able to relate to it in their own way. For many people their "God" is the group itself. I've heard of it also be the human spirit and for some it's a doorknob. There's a famous story about an AA member who's "God" was a tree. There are many people who relate to God in different ways and that is why it's called "God of our understanding." Again, my sponsor always tells me to find "my God." And that "no one has a monopoly on God, even Harvey." (That was a direct quote, just thought I'd mention it for YFM).

Which is why it is so dangerous.

Which is why it riles up those of us who are religious.

God commands us to observe Shabbos; doorknobs don't.

====

Re: 90,000 Reasons Posted by YidFromMonsey - 27 Nov 2016 01:19

Shlomo24,

====

There's no disagreement here, I didn't put in there that for some it might be a tree or a doorknob, but that's exactly the point I was trying to make. The "understanding" doesn't refer to us understanding God's doings but rather how we understand the concept of what God is, and that is different for everyone....

Re: 90,000 Reasons Posted by Workingguy - 27 Nov 2016 03:50

YidFromMonsey wrote on 27 Nov 2016 01:06:

WG,

Correct, but with all that said, at least in my situation, before starting 12 steps my yiddishkiet was anyway out the window, so it's not like 12 steps would in any way get in the way of my yiddishkiet, so I do understand why some people feel that 12 steps is priority over anything else, because for people like me, without 12 steps we don't have anything, no life, no marriage, no yiddishkiet, and might even become suicidal in some extreme cases, which then a shaila of pikeeach nefesh mamish.

One big BUT here thought, I do agree that no one can decide on his own what is right or wrong, only a posek who understands addiction can say what's right or wrong, and each situation is unique....

YFM,

I hear you, but it actually still doesn't matter. Like I mentioned in a previous post, you can't save your life using medicine that was obtained from Avoda Zara- there are some situations where even if it would make you a better Jew you still can't do it. Avoda Zara or denying the Torah concept of HaShem is one of them. Which means that we would tell you that you can't do it.

It's not a game of numbers- just because you'll have a closer relationship with HaShem in the end wouldn't justify the means if indeed it meant going against ikrei emunah.

To be clear- I went to 12 steps (SAA) for over a year in a church, had a very Christian sponsorso I'm not talking at all about not going. I'm talking about changing your beliefs to make the program work, or listening to your sponsor when it goes against Halacha or Hashkafa. ____

Re: 90,000 Reasons Posted by Shlomo24 - 27 Nov 2016 05:04

Learning that a sponsor isn't God is important. I think the issue that we're talking about is that people don't think to call their Rav when they receive advice that contradicts Yiddishkeit. Or that people lower their level of religion in program.

I also think that while this conversation has been a strong one, I'm not sure I'd the benefit it will have. I've learned so many times that I can tell someone something from today until tomorrow but nature will run it's course. The reality is that many people in program lower their Yiddishkeit. It's not just the East Coast, it's also in Israel. But when people go to SA they're usually desperate for help and the fact that they might lower in frumkeit isn't necessarily going to be the biggest turn off. I know that was true for me. I needed a solution in the biggest way. I was crossing red lines like crazy and my life was rapidly going to s***.

====

Re: 90,000 Reasons Posted by cordnoy - 27 Nov 2016 06:02

Shlomo24 wrote on 27 Nov 2016 05:04:

Learning that a sponsor isn't God is important. I think the issue that we're talking about is that people don't think to call their Rav when they receive advice that contradicts Yiddishkeit. Or that people lower their level of religion in program.

I also think that while this conversation has been a strong one, I'm not sure I'd the benefit it will have. I've learned so many times that I can tell someone something from today until tomorrow but nature will run it's course. The reality is that many people in program lower their Yiddishkeit. It's not just the East Coast, it's also in Israel. But when people go to SA they're usually desperate for help and the fact that they might lower in frumkeit isn't necessarily going to be the biggest turn off. I know that was true for me. I needed a solution in the biggest way. I was crossing red lines like crazy and my life was rapidly going to s***.

Perhaps in Israel as well.

Makes sense, but I don't have first hand knowledge of that.

And your post only strengthens my resolve to warn people beforehand.

Like I have also said in previous posts....for many, it still might be worth it to go.

Re: 90,000 Reasons Posted by YidFromMonsey - 27 Nov 2016 07:08

I'm wondering, does anyone know of any posek or torah authority who looked into addiction and or the 12 steps from a torah perspective? If so, what's his opinion?

Re: 90,000 Reasons Posted by Shlomo24 - 27 Nov 2016 07:13

Rabbi Dr. Abraham J. Twersky has done extensive research about the subject.

====

Re: 90,000 Reasons Posted by cordnoy - 27 Nov 2016 07:26

YidFromMonsey wrote on 27 Nov 2016 07:08:

I'm wondering, does anyone know of any posek or torah authority who looked into addiction and or the 12 steps from a torah perspective? If so, what's his opinion?

There are many articles on this site about this.

AdditionallyI, rabbi tanenbaum published a pamphlet (and perhaps now it's a book) on this very subject. On my thread tryin', we have many excerpts and discussions.

====
