

Where is Hilchos Addiction?

Posted by mifatfait - 16 Feb 2012 23:44

---

I have a question. I may not be fair but it bothers me anyways, so I want to ask.

We know that everything is found in the Torah, not just halachos and hashkafos but also the ??? ?????. The Rambam devotes much of hilchos daas to midos and ????? ?????, as well as in Moreh Nevuchim and ????? ????? and more. All of the greats concentrated much effort on teaching us the about the ??? ???? , how the ??? ????? should and shouldn't look (The Ramchal, Gr'a, R' Yisrael Salanter, etc.). And not just theory, but also fixing things that went wrong. It's all there.

What I would like to know is if and where in the works of the Rishonim or Achronim we find the concept of addiction as a illness that requires a special method of healing, different than the standard approaches that work for everyone else. True, all the 12 steps have there source, but what is the source for the source of it all, the basic attitude of addiction as a sickness? Where is Hilchos Addiction?

Please let me know what you think.

=====

Re: Where is Hilchos Addiction?

Posted by Dov - 18 Oct 2012 03:30

---

Far from criticizing you, I just suggested that the reason you see 12-step fellowships as being based on the power of shame at 'failing', might be because you feel the need to succeed so acutely, yourself. So the shame of failing is a big deal to you. That'd be projection.

And this is not about you. It's your repeated representation of SA to others that I am criticizing, for the sake of others who may come to see things a different way. You do your thing, and I do mine. I'd be happy meeting you over a bagel and a cup of coffee and talking about anything any day - I doubt we'd end up arguing. For you are sincere, and I think i am, too.

And incidentally, the power of the *group* part of AA/SA is just a tool - perhaps a very important one - but far from the ikkar of recovery. And tools are never the answer - they are all only half-measures standing on their own. Yet people like to grab onto a couple of the tools and pretend they are the Entire Deal. Nu. So people do lots of goofy things, me included. That's what my sponsor showed me, and that is how my other mentors saw it, too.

But as you know, "Half-measures availed us nothing."

The only **full**-measure, I was shown, is the honest relationship I grow to have with my own G-d. The group gives us the opportunity to learn how to be honest even when it hurts - or how else will we professional self-liars ever become honest with ourselves? Being a little more honest, we eventually become able to have a real relationship with our own G-d. And as many tzaddikim have said, being able to say "Elohai", and really *know* it is a big deal.

And any Yid or goy can do that just fine. It is *integrity*, and it is what the 12th step means when it reads: Having had a spiritual awakening as **the** result of these steps..." (italics mine)

Is that a christian concept?

I hope not...

=====

Re: Where is Hilchos Addiction?

Posted by nederman - 18 Oct 2012 14:07

---

[dov wrote on 18 Oct 2012 03:30:](#)

Far from criticizing you, I just suggested that the reason you see 12-step fellowships as being based on the power of shame at 'failing', might be because you feel the need to succeed so acutely, yourself. So the shame of failing is a big deal to you. That'd be projection.

I see. I do feel the need to succeed. I think you do too, and I think anyone on gye does, or else

they would just resign to the fact that they like masturbating and the sin and the mitzvos would simply coexist.

But I think in my case the desire to succeed is exceeded by the desire for a challenge, and also the desire for truth. I knew I was lying to myself in the 12-step program, I knew that the material was arbitrary and of dubious origin, that the quality of each sponsor is different and not well understood etc. So I quit the program despite the fact that without the commitment I started acting out again. I stand by my decision because the 12-step program is not the solution to the problem of frum people doing porn.

And this is not about you. It's your repeated representation of SA to others that I am criticizing, for the sake of others who may come to see things a different way. You do your thing, and I do mine.

As I said before, I am interested in a general solution, not in being the guy who has been sober the longest and has unique insight in the problem and the guru that can heal others. My goal is to establish something that anyone can pursue on their own. This is very different from your goal which is I think to help one person at a time, correct if I am wrong, and I would think also to continuously work on your 12th step.

With the benefit of cognitive skills I have observed that people come to the forum and try some half measures (all of them except SA,) and they usually include surrender, i.e. let go and let G-d. This is a partial improvement, but eventually leads to two things: the guy understands that he is not doing enough, and **because of the surrendering behavior** he rationalizes more and more that this is a disease and it is not his fault.

The reason he does that is because since he doesn't have the skills to stop and if he is not a tzadik he is worthless SA must be right!

Therefore I can see with my cognitive skills that GYE is basically a gateway to the 12-step program. In fact, it is a bit of factory of true addicts. It's a self-fulfilling prophecy.

Nobody should claim that enrolling in the 12-step program comes for free. Rather, it has a large impact on a person's life. For example, if a single man is in SA, when he gets married if the girl asks "do you have any addictions" he would have to say "yes." And again, the quality and details of each sponsor are unique. Not everyone has Dov as a sponsor, even if Dov were perfect. Many sponsors have been sober for a couple of years. Further, it can be easily observed by going to SA meetings that people relapse. I saw people relapse after being sober for a year or two. And if a guy is married I think his wife wants to know that he does not see himself as a sick person, because who is to say when a sick person has been healed? She wants to be married to a person who makes choices, and she may put up with someone who makes some choices that she does not like (it happens every day to everyone.) Further, the 12-step program goes on forever. Further, driving to meetings costs money. Further, the approved literature for SA was largely written by non-Jews. Et cetera. Et cetera. Et cetera.

Since I have seen what cognitive skills can gain for a person, I just can't avoid explaining to people what they are getting into.

But I agree that if a person does not want to see the reality and does not want to try cognitive therapy because he somehow knows better, then he is better off in SA.

I'd be happy meeting you over a bagel and a cup of coffee and talking about anything any day - I doubt we'd end up arguing. For you are sincere, and I think i am, too.

I do not consider arguing a problem. I am not afraid of conflict. I am not attacking SA members, I am attacking the cognitive errors.

Still, I should be careful with people's pride. The Torah says "you will rebuke your friend" but not to the point that his face starts turning colors. People have pride and I think I have to do a better job of protecting people's pride.

And incidentally, the power of the *group* part of AA/SA is just a tool - perhaps a very important one - but far from the ikkar of recovery.

I agree, because I recover without the group.

But there's a video on youtube where Dr. Twersky says that a therapist can do nothing for an addict without a support group (he has never done cognitive therapy but I was told that he has heard good things about it.) And the group often holds hands and says "keep coming back ..." for a good reason. I think everyone knows that if you stop going to meetings while thinking that you are powerless you'll start acting out again.

In SA the group is not the ikkar, but it's indispensable because you cannot recover if you are not sober. With cognitive skills you can recover even if you are not sober.

And tools are never the answer - they are all only half-measures standing on their own. Yet people like to grab onto a couple of the tools and pretend they are the Entire Deal. Nu. So people do lots of goofy things, me included. That's what my sponsor showed me, and that is how my other mentors saw it, too.

But as you know, "Half-measures availed us nothing."

The only **full**-measure, I was shown, is the honest relationship I grow to have with my own G-d.

The group gives us the opportunity to learn how to be honest even when it hurts - or how else will we professional self-liars ever become honest with ourselves? Being a little more honest, we eventually become able to have a real relationship with our own G-d. And as many tzaddikim have said, being able to say "Elohai", and really *know* it is a big deal.

And any Yid or goy can do that just fine. It is *integrity*, and it is what the 12th step means when it reads: Having had a spiritual awakening as **the** result of these steps..." (italics mine)

Admitting that I will fail without the group, admitting that I am powerless, is not honesty because desiring sex more than Torah is not a fault. It is your prerogative. It takes work to appreciate yiddishkeit more than porn. If you do not want to do the work it's your loss. You are not doing G-d any favors by keeping the mitzvos. G-d doesn't need your mitzvos because he can have anyone he wants doing that job.

Is that a christian concept?

I hope not...

Yes, it is. The belief that I am honest by admitting that I want porn more than I want to love G-d is a Christian concept.

=====

=====

Re: Where is Hilchos Addiction?  
Posted by Dov - 18 Oct 2012 17:49

---

[nederman wrote on 18 Oct 2012 14:07:](#)

I stand by my decision because the 12-step program is not the solution to the problem of frum people doing porn....In fact, it is a bit of factory of true addicts. It's a self-fulfilling prophecy.

Agreed. SA is not a solution for *anyone at all* who is just "doing porn". It is meant for addicts - not for the average frum yid who has some desire or acts it out once in a while. The *program* does not make my life unmanageable - I come into it that way. The *program* does not make me powerless - I come to it after trying everything else (even Cognitive Therapy). You seem to blame the program for 'convincing' guys that they are powerless, that they cannot manage their own lives, and that they need to keep coming back.

Gevalt.

Yes, there are some cultist members - but they usually do not last very long. And yes, there are a few people in SA because they heard of it and were attracted to the idea of a place they can go where they will get unconditional respect and support....but they do not last very long, either. Only those who either arrive knowing they have tried everything and lost, belong there - in my opinion. That is why I (and some other guys) never say, "Keep coming back!" at meetings. For who needs non-addicts at a meeting? Not me - and not themselves.

And this is not about you. It's your repeated representation of SA to others that I am criticizing, for the sake of others who may come to see things a different way. You do your thing, and I do mine.

And as wonderful as the forum and GYE is, it is even worse in this regard. Many guys click onto this site and are bombarded with premature and presumptuous pronouncements like: "All you need to do is finally admit to yourself that you are powerless and need Hashem," and "once an addict, always an addict," etc. There is truth to these things - major truth. But not for every person. They are poison for non-addicts...and that means the majority.

But by the same token, I believe that Cognitive Therapy is poison for the true addicts here. Especially the way you promote it. For you declare that 12-step programs are patently misleading people to *become* and remain sick. True, you throw a bone by saying "well, if remaining a loser floats your boat, go ahead, knock yourself out." But that is your axe grinding that I believe that I am hearing in the background.

I believe that an addict **will** improve by using CT - and will also improve by exercising regularly, and will improve with medication, and will improve by pretending he or she is working a 12 step program. But I do not believe that many addicts will gain a progressive sober lifestyle of recovery from any of those things. I believe that a miracle is needed and that, for addicts, G-d is only really found in surrender of ego and self-power. I think that is what mesiras nefesh *means*, for addicts.

So CT has two drawbacks for addicts: 1) it delays the inevitable, and 2) it offers a solution that enables some healthy thinking and healthy living, but not using G-d at all. It uses cognitive skills - and that is me, not G-d.

So I think CT is probably awesome for normals - even yidden (Rav Zelig Pliskin has been using a version of it in his therapy for decades, now). Just as regular exercise and medication for depression may be. But I presume that for addicts it is ikkar choser min hasefer.

Nobody should claim that enrolling in the 12-step program comes for free. Rather, it has a large impact on a person's life...But I agree that if a person does not want to see the reality and does not want to try cognitive therapy because he somehow knows better, then he is better off in SA.

There you go again, throwing a derisive bone. Do you hear what I am referring to? This is not helpful. I presume again that you have an axe to grind. You can stop doing that if you choose to.

But decrying the fact that there are drawbacks and weaknesses to SA is nothing really significant, anyway. Yes there are weaknesses. So?

Nonetheless, Hashem successfully uses AA, NA, SA, and other 12-step fellowships to help lots of people - including many frum yidden I know who are sober in SA. And quite a few of these frum yidden (I know at least fifty) have wives who choose to be in S-Anon. They learn not to pity their husbands at all, learn to be free of their husbands and be their own person, and learn to be happy as Hashem's person irrespective of how their addict husband is doing at the moment. Not every wife is happy with their husband doing what is right for him, true. Remember, that he is a recovering sex and lust addict. "We thought there must be an easier, softer way..." And you may have found one indeed - for yourself.

Well, sometimes there isn't a softer, easier way. So? I hope you stop making it sound like there always *is* one.

I'd be happy meeting you over a bagel and a cup of coffee and talking about anything any day - I doubt we'd end up arguing. For you are sincere, and I think i am, too.



I do not consider arguing a problem. I am not afraid of conflict. I am not attacking SA members, I am attacking the cognitive errors.

Still, I should be careful with people's pride. The Torah says "you will rebuke your friend" but not to the point that his face starts turning colors. People have pride and I think I have to do a better job of protecting people's pride.

I am not about conflict and not afraid of it, either - and my pride is alive and well, how's yours?

But what about sitting down together over a bagel and coffee, chaver?

And finally:

Admitting that I will fail without the group, admitting that I am powerless, is not honesty because desiring sex more than Torah is not a fault. It is your prerogative. **It takes work to appreciate yiddishkeit more than porn.** If you do not want to do the work it's your loss. You are not doing G-d any favors by keeping the mitzvos. G-d doesn't need your mitzvos because he can have anyone he wants doing that job.

Is that a christian concept?

I hope not...

Yes, it is. **The belief that I am honest by admitting that I want porn more than I want to love G-d is a Christian concept.**

The two bolded comments you made are actually contradictory.

And the answer to this issue is plain. There is no "belief" being discussed here. The point of the second (yes, 2nd) step is to recognize that the reason my sanity and managability has not been restored by Hashem is simple: I have another god that I worship and hope to: lust fantasy and sex. And that is not an 'avodah zorah' issue, but rather a stupidity issue. Call it mental illness if you like.

We porn users *often* get convinced on a very deep, visceral level that the nudes have *far* more to offer us than Hashem does. Our bodies declare it to us loudly. In the second step (yes, 2nd) we do not condone it - we just admit that this is how we are operating, unfortunately. And we learn to become ready to depend on the Real G-d help us out of that hole. And He does - if we *let* him by working the 4th-7th steps and also making amends (8/9th) to those we hurt. For those steps get us out of His way. As the Kotzker said, "Hashem only comes *where people let Him in.*"

And that we are wrong and broken is not apikorsus, nor does it mean that we are therefore 'good christians'. It just means we are a bit twisted and perverted. Do you have too much pride to admit that? Maybe you are not really broken - and that's great. But boruch Hashem **we** can admit that our minds are a bit broken and need some fixing. That's what Hashem does for people in the program - He helps us stay sober and helps us work on learning new ways to think, new ideas and beliefs that work - when we let Him. So don't bother contradicting yourself. It is just the way we admit we function - and we do not like it. So we make some choices.

Chosamo shel hKb"H is emess. He loves when we admit the way we really working, and that it is sick and unacceptable to us.

=====

====

Re: Where is Hilchos Addiction?

Posted by nederman - 19 Oct 2012 03:36

---

I am looking at the size of these messages and I am stressing out just thinking about responding point by point. I am getting too old for these flame wars. So please excuse me if I skip.

I respect your opinions because I respect your experience as an addict. I think you are behaving as you should behave, doing your 12th step and helping people as best you can. As I said my objective is different, namely to work out a system that works for everyone. Everyone understands that SA is not that system.

I believe from basic cognitive considerations that advising the average guy to "let go and let G-d" pushes a regular guy into addiction. You clearly do not see why this is, so you should keep advising them that way, but I won't.

=====

====

Re: Where is Hilchos Addiction?

Posted by Dov - 19 Oct 2012 04:59

---

Why stress? It's not worth it. But here is a shorter version. You will do what you see is right, chaver. And "too old"? How old *are* you?

1- I have agreed with you *and* clarified a number of times already that telling "the average guy" (that means mostly non-addicts) to accept that *they* are powerless is a huge mistake and very anti-program. Even the program Traditions are clear that members ought not promote AA/SA in any way (interestingly quite different from many branches of christianity and more like the prevailing attitude of *Yiddishkeit* regarding proselytism). So why would you ever say I "clearly do not see why this is"? That's just not true.

2- Though you have made encouraging comments about SA and 12 steps at times, you frequently refer to SA with marked derision. Is your sourness "cognitive" - or do you actually have some hurt feelings toward the 12 step program or to some philistines there who attacked you (there are idiots there, too - I have met a few over the years).

3- You contradicted yourself four sentences apart, first saying that "it takes work to appreciate yiddishkeit more than porn," and then, "The belief that I am honest by admitting that I want porn more than I want to love G-d is a Christian concept." Gevalt, what could you mean?

4- Bagels are healthy, especially with a decaf coffee.

=====

====

Re: Where is Hilchos Addiction?

Posted by nederman - 19 Oct 2012 12:24

---

[dov wrote on 19 Oct 2012 04:59:](#)

Why stress? It's not worth it. But here is a shorter version. You will do what you see is right, chaver. And "too old"? How old *are* you?

I prefer not to say.

1- I have agreed with you *and* clarified a number of times already that telling "the average guy" (that means mostly non-addicts) to accept that *they* are powerless is a huge mistake and very anti-program. Even the program Traditions are clear that members ought not promote AA/SA in any way (interestingly quite different from many branches of christianity and more like the prevailing attitude of *Yiddishkeit* regarding proselytism). So why would you ever say I "clearly do not see why this is"? That's just not true.

I don't think you agree that it's harmful though.

2- Though you have made encouraging comments about SA and 12 steps at times, you frequently refer to SA with marked derision. Is your sourness "cognitive" - or do you actually have some hurt feelings toward the 12 step program or to some philistines there who attacked you (there are idiots there, too - I have met a few over the years).

It's just cognitive. My experience in SA was positive. I have only ever been attacked by sex addicts on GYE, as well as attacked behind my back. But I don't attribute that to the 12-step program. The 12-step program doesn't tell people to attack others because they don't agree. So I have no issue there.

3- You contradicted yourself four sentences apart, first saying that "it takes work to appreciate yiddishkeit more than porn," and then, "The belief that I am honest by admitting that I want porn more than I want to love G-d is a Christian concept." Gevalt, what could you mean?

The first statement means that, for example, you have to gain skills in Torah to appreciate Torah. I call that work.

The second statement means it's not honesty to admit that you have a yetzer ha-ra. That's not your fault. That's a fact. It's a Christian belief that I am culpable for the "original sin." I don't think the Torah tells me that I am at fault for the chet of adam ha-rishon. The ability to fight the yetzer ha-ra is G-d given and there is a skill involved. Honesty would be to say "I admit that I don't see why yiddishkeit is better than porn and I don't put in the work to see it."

There is another kind of honesty which is discover your true beliefs. But that is really skill. You look at your current behavior, and that tells you your beliefs. It's like in the gemara in B"M 22a (I think) where the man says "you should have gone after the better ones." The gemara has a rule for figuring out what he really means. Look at the behavior, that's what he believes. If he says "no, I really wanted you to get the better ones" it just means he has a belief that wanting to give truma from the bad ones makes him a bad person.

But it would be silly to be honest about a belief that is not true (an irrational belief.) To state "I do have a belief that I sex is too much for me" sounds honest but since the belief is false, do we care? Sex is not too much.

But maybe it sounded contradictory. Don't hold your breath trying to understand my writing because my communication is usually pretty nebulous.

4- Bagels are healthy, especially with a decaf coffee.

I can't have bagels. Anyway, I don't have impressive insights in addiction or the Torah or spirituality. I am just a regular mama's boy who likes sex and I don't even feel bad about it and not somebody you want to have a relationship with.

=====

Re: Where is Hilchos Addiction?  
Posted by Dov - 19 Oct 2012 17:19

---

[nederman wrote on 19 Oct 2012 12:24:](#)

I am just a regular mama's boy who likes sex and I don't even feel bad about it and not somebody you want to have a relationship with.

First of all, I like sex, too and certainly don't see why I should feel badly about that. Asceticism is beyond me, at least for now. I don't get why you would need to point that out, though. What's the problem with loving sex? I love *lots* of people, lots of things and love doing lots of things, b"H, and none of them are bad for me until I misuse them or use them in excess. You are certainly a great person to meet, chaver.

And besides, I sit down to coffee with people ranging from talmidei chachomim to raging perverts (and often both in the same guy). I am sure that 'mama's boys' fit *somewhere* in that range. Nu. Anyhow, as you like...

When I say "It's a huge mistake," I do mean it's harmful. But you were in SA for years - somehow you were not damaged beyond repair.

Do you suggest that I cease suggesting SA for b'nei Torah (and for goyim, too)?

I want you to know that I am the last guy to say to a man who calls me and spills his guts about

the hookers he has been seeing, "You are an addict - you need SA, the steps, a sponsor, etc." I have written about the fact that - besides perhaps a trained expert shrink - there is only one guy who can tell a person that he is an addict: himself. And the addict should never be dissuaded to try all sorts of things to fix himself, before crawling or walking into 12 step recovery. The most precious lesson he may learn is the discovery that he really *needs* G-d for a change. Then he will start to *love* G-d, too, for a change, be"H. And he will stay sober and learn how to live better so he can stay sober today....if he wants to and does the work.

And no, SA is certainly not the answer for every addict. Some folks need something else. Thank G-d I am not holding myself up as an expert who is able to 'tell them what they need'! I hope you are not, either. It'd ruin my program and I suspect it is not the place for any addict (who is not a trained, qualified shrink, which you may be).

And you are right. I simply cannot follow your explanation of how it is christian to say I am honest about having a screwed up heart because it has something to do with original sin doctrine - yet it is Torah to work on accepting right and wrong in one's heart. And I do not see addiction - even lust addiction - as a matter of the yetzer hora, and certainly believe that whatever tools and attitudes we hidden masturbaters used from Torah to 'fight our yetzer horas' all those years while we developed into the addicts we are today - was part of the *problem*, not the solution. I believe we arrived with, and developed, twisted basic assumptions about G-d and life that poisoned our use of Torah and made us into the raging sexaholics some of us are today even through the battle with the yetzer hora. And *we primarily need healing from **those old ideas*** in order to succeed in recovery. That's what the steps (and often therapy) are for, in my continuing experience. So I say to most people (even non-addicts) that keeping on using "Torah" and "Mussar" and even referring to the issue as revolving around the yetzer hora is so treif to them that it will likely only perpetuate their problem. They usually hear that loud and clear - but wer just waiting for someone with the guts -and the pain - to say it clearly.

These guys discover that what they called "Torah" was not, and they begin to find Yiddishkeit for a change. It does not remove them from any kedusha.

Have a nice Shabbos!

=====  
=====

Re: Where is Hilchos Addiction?

Posted by Dov - 23 Oct 2012 21:50

---

I do not know where to post this sweet thing I read from Rav Avigdor Miller zt"l, but it applies so deeply to the recovery derech I was taught in 12 steps (SA) that I just had to post it somewhere:

**Everything is in your hands; nothing is in your hands**

We see that there are so many fronts on which a man has to constantly exert himself. He has to guard his health constantly. He has to constantly be on guard regarding his personal relations with people. He should be careful not to talk carelessly, to not become angry. He has to guard his finances.

Then, after doing all the things on his own behalf -- after trying his best to be healthy, to live peacefully with people, to have Parnassa (livelihood); after all these efforts -- he is expected to say to Hashem, "Everything comes from Your hand." [As we say in the Shemoneh Esrai three times a day,] "Baruch atah rofai cholai amo Yisrael, "You are the One Who keeps me well." [And right after that we say,] "You are the One Who gives me Parnassa."

That is the great test to which everyone is subjected. The loyal Jew has two different tracks, and he has to constantly think about both and maintain his equilibrium.

How do many people solve this problem? They do so by ignoring one or the other. They go about their business as if everything was in their own hands. They merely do lip service to the other principle. Or, in some rare cases, they trust in Hashem and do not do what is necessary for themselves. But the tzaddik is expected to do both things, and to do them perfectly and at the same time. One should not contradict the other or encroach on the province of the other...

Life is not simple at all. We are constantly between two forces. Our happiness is in our hands. All our relationships -- to our family, to society around us, to our employers, to our neighbors -- are in our hands. Our health is in our hands. At the same time, we have to understand that nothing is in our hands...

It is remarkable how much of our happiness depends on us. (Rav Avigdor Miller on Emunah and Bitachon)

Dedicated For The Refuah Shlemah Of Meir Leib ben Sarah

This is very close to how I live with the idea of powerlessness - yet taking responsibility for taking actions of recovery. Some mistakenly say that following the 12 steps means a risk that the addict may absolve himself of personal responsibility. It - recovery for an addict - is exactly like parnassah for all Jews. All in our hands and yet totally out of our hands.

Teshuvah does not need to be that way, as it can be *all* in our hands - but Teshuvah is not the way addicts get and live clean. Addicts who actually *use* the ideas in 12 steps *do* depend on G-d completely...but the steps are full of action! Just like Parnossah al pi din Torah. For addicts, recovery is completely in the realm of parnossah and health. It is about our survival in *Olam hazeh* - not about our Olam haboh. And we play the game that Rav Miller describes to the tee, one day at a time.

That is a *very* important distinction, I think. Thanks for helping me see that and write it here.

=====

Re: Where is Hilchos Addiction?

Posted by tehylimzugger - 25 Oct 2012 18:09

---

[dov wrote on 23 Oct 2012 21:50:](#)

I do not know where to post this sweet thing I read from Rav Avigdor Miller zt"l, but it applies so deeply to the recovery derech I was taught in 12 steps (SA) that I just had to post it somewhere:

you don't know where?

DUDE, GET YOURSELF A THREAD IN BEIS MEDRASH

MUSHCHAYHU GUYS!

=====

Re: Where is Hilchos Addiction?

Posted by Gevura Shebyesod - 25 Oct 2012 18:22

---

Who ya gonna call?



=====

=====

Re: Where is Hilchos Addiction?

Posted by Machshovo Tova - 25 Oct 2012 18:38

---

[TehillimZugger wrote on 25 Oct 2012 18:09:](#)

...DUDE, GET YOURSELF A THREAD IN BEIS MEDRASH

MUSHCHAYHU GUYS!

Are you from the Meshuchusten?

MT

=====

=====

Re: Where is Hilchos Addiction?

Posted by Markz - 25 Oct 2017 20:22

---

[Dov wrote on 05 Oct 2012 17:19:](#)

Of course the 12 step program does not work for everyone!

And how many very messed up and uncouth - or even really bad - frum yidden do you know? I am not talking only about the secret masturbaters and porn-hiders, but mainly about the liars, abusers, and very selfish people among us. There are and always have been quite a few. So obviously Torah does not 'work' for everyone, either. This is not a hashkofah problem, just a fact that everyone knows. Mesiras nefesh is a big part of keeping Torah - in the program we translate that exactly - mesiras nefesh is surrendering of my self-will to Hashem. ("Nefesh" means "self-will", as in Avraham Avinu to bnei cheis - "im yeish es nafshechem"; and "mesirah"

is giving over - surrendering).

The fact that many do not get sober in AA, SA, NA, etc., proves nothing about those tools any more than bad Jews prove anything about Torah. Torah is still Torah, and perfect. It is still just stuff in a book until it is used right. And that takes motivation and siyata dishmaya.

But Torah 'works' much more often for people to be *good people* if they are really *trying* and *do not let go of it*. And l'havdil, it is the same for the 12 steps and many other tools. And if a person uses it honestly and consistently - even when it is not comfortable, it often works.

I assume we agree on all that. If not, let me know please.

As far as the disease thing, i will agree with you on your reading of Tanya and will be glad to speak it over on the phone, but think it is a topic that is best not posted here on GYE, of all places.

All these things are just philosophy, and have little to do with actually recovering. Recovering happens when I start to take real action - not when I start to 'understand' things. Just like Torah, l'havdil, the ones who are obsessed with "mah ksiv boh" never get Torah. It is not just Torah that they do not get - it is also a wife, children, and real life. Having to know everything and understand everything about those things leads to never committing to marriage, never actually engaging in parenting, and never really living. I think.

Hey, can you PM me *if* you want to talk?

- Dov

Let's bump the sweet guy again

=====  
=====

Re: Where is Hilchos Addiction?

Posted by LoveU,Hashem - 25 Oct 2017 21:26

---

Yea, we need to refresh this place. Some more good content.

=====

=====

Re: Where is Hilchos Addiction?

Posted by Third holy bear - 30 Oct 2017 15:09

---

BH

What if.... the belief that you are NOT in control and are addicted is fueling your addiction?

What if you believed that you can create change slowly and progressively can actually change your behavior, in the past this has been true to a limited degree in my life.

?I know this heresy to anyone who believes in 12 step program, but for the benefit of those who truly seek recovery and those who 12 step program did NOT work for them. just maybe...

=====

=====