

R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by strivingforhonesty - 13 Nov 2011 09:55

[Moderator's note: The controversial article that was posted here purports to present Rav Tzadok's views. Some of the general statements are indeed classic Rav Tzadok, but other statements appear so far from normative Halacha and Hashkafa that I'm not convinced that Rav Tzadok actually wrote them, or intended them for public consumption. The danger of quoting from unpublished manuscripts is that such quotes are difficult to verify].

=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by Kedusha - 16 Nov 2011 18:07

[strivingforhonesty wrote on 16 Nov 2011 17:29:](#)

obormottel-

If someone needs to masturbate twice a week because they are single and have no other sexual outlet, they don't have an addiction, they are normal, you claim that there are millions of religious single people that don't masturbate, this is simply false, can you please show me your source, actually a friend of mine did a survey with a lot of students on the frequency of their masturbation (don't ask) and there was no real difference between the religious and secular.

What you write is a tacit acknowledgement that the removed article is not appropriate for those with an addiction, any more than giving chizuk to an alcoholic who drinks twice a week that his behavior (which is killing him) is perfectly normal. See Guard's post (reply #2) here:

[www.guardyoureyes.org/forum/index.php?topic=4764.msg125653#new.](http://www.guardyoureyes.org/forum/index.php?topic=4764.msg125653#new)

Regarding your other point, it's hard to give accurate numbers, but the issue is not (as many people frame it) whether someone ever masturbates (or has ever masturbated). The issue is whether someone is trying to avoid it. Of course, someone who watches TV, movies, and videos, and/or surfs the Internet without restriction, will feel that he needs a sexual outlet twice per week (at least), as you write. The same with someone who looks improperly at the opposite sex, or engages in forbidden behavior with a girlfriend. But someone who does his best to avoid these things and guards his eyes will have a much easier time, although the desire won't go away completely, and he may experience occasional slips or falls. I don't consider such a person as "someone who masturbates." He is someone who is trying to do the right thing, and his efforts are very precious to the RBS"O. There are definitely many tens of thousands of people in this category.

By the way, there is a downside to trying to remove all feelings of guilt. True, guilt can be taken too far, and that needs to be avoided. But, normal feelings of guilt after doing an aveira subtracts from whatever punishment the person would otherwise deserve (heard from Rav Avigdor Miller, ZT"L). It can also motivate a person to try to improve. So, let's differentiate between healthy and unhealthy guilt.

=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by mggsbms - 16 Nov 2011 18:08

Thanks obormottel for articulating so well what was urking me so much about the post. and your comments about the rant from the other holy jew are also to the point, even though i refrained to comment as it seems the guy is hurting. however i have to disagree with your comments regarding R tzodok, his writings are vey accepted and not considered a daas yachid at all, its distorting what he wrote thats the problem.

=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by Kedusha - 16 Nov 2011 18:15

I agree with MGS that Rav Tzadok is an accepted Baal Machshava. But, nothing he wrote was intended (or should be used) to try to condone doing aveiros.

=====

====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by strivingforhonesty - 16 Nov 2011 19:34

"

But someone who does his best to avoid these things and guards his eyes will have a much easier time, although the desire won't go away completely, and he may experience occasional slips or falls."

The desire to masturbate is in internal desire, some people have a stronger desire than others, yes someone that os exposes to material etc will increase his urge, but someone that is single and needs to masturbate twice a week is no addict. And anyway a therapist, who is recommended by this site personally told me [moderator's note: private advice, not intended for public consumption has been removed]. The bottom line is that diffrent approaches work for different people and just because an approuch seems stage to you, it does not mean its beyond the pale.

Secondly, kedusha, can you please remove the loshen horah that you wrote about Dr Jennie Rosenfelt, I know you did not intend to but as "baalteshuva" pointed out you are missrepresenting her.

Finally. (Correct me if I'm wrong on this) you seem to believe that the removed post is beyond the pale yet guardyoureyes writes "And the article about Rav Tzadok may all be true"

So why do you disagree with guard? I would be interested to know the reasons why you feel so strongly about this, no one is trying to "condone doing aveiros"

=====

====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by mggsbms - 16 Nov 2011 19:44

I just dont get it. if a therapist has guided u in a certain way why do you feel that this has to be

expoused as normative hashkafah. i think the question is simple enough. it is clearly against shi"o to say that mastrubation is fine, period.

=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by Kedusha - 16 Nov 2011 19:51

Striving,

1.) What a therapist told you in private is not for public consumption, and could be very harmful to someone who is capable of being successful in this area (indeed, every day of staying clean is a tremendous success). And, if your quote of Rav Matisyahu is correct (and it doesn't seem that you heard it firsthand), it was also probably not meant for public consumption.

2.) Although I didn't read the Ph.D.'s works myself, I did read an article quoting her as saying many things that appear to be against a proper Torah Hashkafa and against the accepted Halacha. Maybe the article misquoted her, although it's been up for 2 years and I'm not aware that she did anything to correct the record. Therefore, while the laws of Lashon Horah would not permit believing that article as the absolute truth, it is important that anyone who reads her works proceed with great caution. Now that you may have gotten some people interested in her works, it is important that they be forewarned not to automatically accept what she writes as proper Torah Hashkafa, let alone as Torah MiSinai. The laws of Lashon Horah permit warning people in this type of situation, subject to certain conditions, which I believe have all been met.

3.) I don't think Guard was disagreeing with me. His point was, even assuming that Rav Tzadok is being properly quoted, it is not appropriate for this forum.

=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by strivingforhonesty - 16 Nov 2011 19:59

"it is clearly against shi"o to say that mastrubation is fine, period"

No one is saying masturbation is "fine", no matter how much I kick and scream about it,

masturbation is against halacha, I am not really saying anything more radical then Rabbi Gotlieb of ohr somauch says here simpletoremember.com/media/a/psychologicalneeds/

=====

=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by strivingforhonesty - 16 Nov 2011 20:11

Kedushu can u pleeesze tell me what you are so upset about, the idea of growing slowly is not at all controversial, rav dessler talks about everyone having a point of free will.

And can you pleeeze tell me what is so terrible about the removed post, I am honestly confused.

=====

=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by Kedusha - 16 Nov 2011 20:20

The concepts of growing slowly and nekudas habechira are well-accepted. The article, however, goes much further than that.

=====

=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by strivingforhonesty - 16 Nov 2011 20:32

Please elaborate, what is repulsive about that article? Is it R Zadoks idea of le-hotsi yakar mi-zolel? Is it the idea that sin is apart of life after eden?

=====

=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by Kedusha - 16 Nov 2011 20:42

The article goes out of its way to view masturbation in a positive light. If Rav Tzadok actually

said any of this, it's not only not normative Hashkafa, but it can cause people to be lax in keeping the Halacha, which was clearly not his intent.

=====

=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by strivingforhonesty - 16 Nov 2011 21:17

"but it can cause people to be lax in keeping the Halacha"

Ok, I hear you, yet there is another side to the coin, it can cause people to regain there sanity, I speak from personal experience, I needed to see the positive in masturbation, otherwise I would have destroyed myself, and there are a lot of people like me, but I would walk around all day scared to death that I was a heretic or something, so when I read these ideas of R Zadok it felt like I could finally breath, finally live.

=====

=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by gibbor120 - 16 Nov 2011 21:27

I think the general hashkafa here is that we need to accept ourselves, and not beat ourselves up for masturbating. Guilt, for the most part, is damaging. To a large extent, we may not have even had bechira. There is a lot in the GYE handbooks about this. Have you read them? At the same time, we do not condone or accept it as being "positive" as you describe it. I think the sticking point here is promoting it as "positive".

=====

=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by strivingforhonesty - 16 Nov 2011 22:02

Well Unfortunately I view it as a positive activity on certain levels, what do you want me to do? Shoot myself? If only R Zadok was alive today...

=====

=====