

Destiny vs Free Will

Posted by DesertLion - 18 Mar 2011 22:22

Hey Guys,

I hope you're all doing well. Part of the GYE philosophy towards life really puzzles me. Guard always tells us to let go and let God, and that everything has already been pre-determined before we were even born.

If this is true, then how does personal effort come into play? If humans are ultimately powerless and everything is in the hands of God, then how do we have true free will? If we cannot be the masters of our own destiny, even if we gain self-mastery, then how can we ever be truly free?

I hope I'm making some sense here, lol.

Anyway fellas, TC and have a great weekend.

DL

=====

Re: Destiny vs Free Will

Posted by oblum - 19 Mar 2011 17:50

@DesertLion -

That is a wonderful question, and I was wondering it myself. While there are many different explanations, here is one that I think is simple in concept:

There are three steps to following Hashems commandments:

1. Desire to do them
2. Resolve to do them
3. Attempting to so them

I think what guard is saying is that once you've desired to do good (1) (hopefully that covers all of use) and once you've resolved to do good (2) (perhaps by coming to this site and reaching out for help) all you need now is the S'yata D'shmay to actually bring said desire/resolve to fruition (3).

Hence, once youve come forward and are sincere - trust in Hashem that you will be able to make the leap from concept to completion.

Personally, I think it goes great with "Pischu Li pesach k'pischo shel machat..."

=====

Re: Destiny vs Free Will

Posted by pinokio - 19 Mar 2011 18:09

tzaddik,

although um not sure that this is the correct meaning of "let go and let god", this Q' itself is a question called yediyah vs. bechira.

see tzidkas hatzaddik number 40 for a great pshat.

if i understood it,

we have bechira while Hashem knows what we are going to choose, simply bec. Hashem is above time. See first page of leshem hak' vishiarim

our job is to realizethateven when we did aveiros and we thought hashem didnt know , hashem did know. bec. if he didnt will it i happen then it couldnt exist, and so essentially our acting out is pt of god's will. and when we have such a realization of hs will then we truly bring god into our life in the highest level.

drank a shtikel and gotta go,

tzaddik 90

=====

Re: Destiny vs Free Will

Posted by silentbattle - 20 Mar 2011 12:05

[DesertLion wrote on 18 Mar 2011 22:22:](#)

let go and let God, and that everything has already been pre-determined before we were even born.

OK, let's see - let go and let god is a complicated issue, and lots of people understand it in lots of different ways.

As far as things being pre-determined before we're born, though, I don't think that's true. In other words, we do make free choices. Does god allow us to make those choices? Yes. Did he know before hand? This is a bit trickier, but yes again.

How do we pair god's foreknowledge and our free will? It's an age-old question, but here's an answer i heard, in a very abridged version. If you want more detail, PM me, please.

Imagine that I know what decision you will make tomorrow, because I went (with my time machine) into the future and saw you decide (and then came back to today). My knowledge doesn't limit your free will. So, God knows what we will do before we do it, because He's in the future, too - he's above time, not limited by it.

=====

Re: Destiny vs Free Will

Posted by DesertLion - 20 Mar 2011 22:39

Hi Guys,

Thanks for all your posts, it's been thought inspiring. I just don't understand why God would go to the trouble of putting us through the life process when he can read us like an open book anyway.

Anyway, I hope you're all doing well.

TC,

DL

=====
=====

Re: Destiny vs Free Will

Posted by silentbattle - 21 Mar 2011 00:46

Well, that's what my answer explains - Perhaps god only knows what we'll do because we choose to do it, and he sees that.

=====
=====

Re: Destiny vs Free Will

Posted by ZemirosShabbos - 21 Mar 2011 17:13

the question of yediah vs. bechira (free will vs. an Omniscient Creator) is addressed in Pirkei Avos, ??? ????? ??????, and many other authorities since then, notably the Rambam. for a full treatment i would recommend reading The Aryeh Kaplan Reader, the essay about paradoxes.

the consensus is that it is not humanly possible to reconcile free will with Divine Knowledge. being above time just moves the question to another focus but does not explain the logic behind how they can co-exist.

=====

Re: Destiny vs Free Will

Posted by realsimcha - 23 Mar 2011 04:34

I was thinking about it from a different angle:

We are NOT powerless because we have the ability to let go and let god. In other words, that IS how we have bechira by choosing to recognize that its out of our hands. And that is our choice - to recognize how powerless we are.

Let go and let god is not yediya -- -- - its the epitome of bechira!

Also, is it possible that there are "regular" tests where there is real bechira, and then there is addiction where we have to let go...

Anyway just some thoughts...

=====